



# **Planning Committee**

 

 Date:
 Wednesday, 10 November 2021

 Time:
 10.00

 Format:
 Hybrid Meeting

 Contact:
 Gabriella Gonda, Committee Officer Email: Gabriella.Gonda@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Dear Member

Please attend a meeting of the **Planning Committee** as detailed above.

The Convener has directed that the powers contained in Section 43 of the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003 will be used and Members will have the option to attend the meeting remotely or in person at the Civic Space, Church Street, Dumbarton.

The business is shown on the attached agenda.

Yours faithfully

#### JOYCE WHITE

Chief Executive

Distribution:-

Councillor Jim Finn (Chair) Bailie Denis Agnew Councillor Gail Casey Councillor Karen Conaghan Councillor Ian Dickson Councillor Diane Docherty (Vice Chair) Councillor Daniel Lennie Councillor Douglas McAllister Councillor Jonathan McColl Councillor Lawrence O'Neill

All other Councillors for information

Date of Issue: 28 October 2021

#### PLANNING COMMITTEE

#### WEDNESDAY, 10 NOVEMBER 2021

# <u>AGENDA</u>

#### 1 APOLOGIES

#### 2 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members are invited to declare if they have an interest in any of the items of business on this agenda and the reasons for such declarations.

#### 3 RECORDING OF VOTES

The Committee is asked to agree that all votes taken during the meeting will be done by roll call vote to ensure an accurate record.

### 4 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING 5 - 12

Submit for approval as a correct record, the Minutes of Meeting of the Planning Committee held on 6 October 2021.

#### 5 NOTE OF VISITATIONS

Submit, for information, Note of Visitations carried out on 4 October 2021.

13

#### 6 OPEN FORUM

The Committee is asked to note that no open forum questions have been submitted by members of the public.

#### 7 PLANNING APPLICATION

Submit report by the Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration in respect of the following planning application:-

(a) DC21/212/PPP – Proposed residential development at land
 15 - 23
 to the east of 8 Cochno Holdings, Cochno Road, Hardgate
 by Miss Cunningham.

8/

### 8 REDISCOVERING THE ANTONINE WALL PROJECT AND 25 - 29 RE-IMAGINING THE ANTONINE WALL – PHASE 2

Submit report by the Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration seeking approval that the Council will continue to manage the Antonine Wall Project for Historic Environment Scotland and the four other Councils.

# 9 REVIEW OF QUARRIES AND LANDFILL SITES 31 - 36

Submit report by the Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration providing an update on the annual monitoring of the two quarries and two landfill sites in the West Dunbartonshire Council area along with the status of the relevant restoration bonds which apply to three of the sites.

# PLANNING COMMITTEE

At a Meeting of the Planning Committee held by video conference on Wednesday, 6 October 2021 at 10.03 a.m.

Present:	Bailie Denis Agnew and Councillors Gail Casey, Karen
	Conaghan, Ian Dickson, Jim Finn, Daniel Lennie, Jonathan
	McColl and Lawrence O'Neill.

- Attending:Peter Hessett, Chief Officer Regulatory and Regeneration;<br/>Gail MacFarlane, Chief Officer Roads and Neighbourhood;<br/>Pamela Clifford, Planning, Building Standards and<br/>Environmental Health Manager; John Kerr, Housing<br/>Development and Homelessness Manager; John Walker,<br/>Assistant Engineering Officer, Roads and Transportation; Nigel<br/>Ettles, Section Head Litigation (Legal Officer); George<br/>Hawthorn, Manager, Democratic and Registration Services;<br/>Christine McCaffary, Senior Democratic Services Officer; Scott<br/>Kelly and Gabriella Gonda, Committee Officers.
- Also attending: Matt McPhee and Emilia Milne, Anderson Bell + Christie.
- Apologies: An apology for absence was intimated on behalf of Councillor Diane Docherty.

**Councillor Jim Finn in the Chair** 

# DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Bailie Denis Agnew declared an interest in Item 7b – DC20/176 – Change of Use of Land at rear of 19 Millburn Avenue, Clydebank due to being an objector to the application and advised that he would leave the meeting and take no part in the discussion on the item.

# **RECORDING OF VOTES**

The Committee agreed that all votes taken during the meeting would be done by roll call vote to ensure an accurate record.

# MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

The Minutes of Meetings of the Planning Committee held on (a) 6 November 2019 (Ordinary Meeting); (b) 2 June 2021 (Ordinary Meeting, Reconvened on 28 June 2021); (c) 23 June 2021 (Ordinary Meeting); and 28 June 2021 (Special Meeting) were submitted and approved as correct records.

### NOTE OF VISITATIONS

A Note of Visitations carried out on 25 June 2021, a copy of which forms Appendix 1 hereto, was submitted and noted.

# **OPEN FORUM**

The Committee noted that no open forum questions had been submitted by members of the public.

# PLANNING APPLICATIONS

Reports were submitted by the Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration in respect of the following planning applications:-

 (a) TPO18/13 – Felling of trees (compromising of 16 Lime, 5 Sycamore and 1 Silver Birch) at various locations on Bell Street, Edward Street, McGregor Street and White Street, Clydebank by West Dunbartonshire Council.

Reference was made to a site visit which had been undertaken in respect of the above application.

After discussion and having heard the Planning, Building Standards and Environmental Health Manager, in further explanation of the report and in answer to Member's questions, the Committee agreed to grant full planning permission subject to the condition set out in Section 9 of the report, as detailed in Appendix 2 hereto, and to add an additional condition that after the complete removal of roots and stumps, a full resurfacing of the pavement will be carried out.

(b) DC20/176 – Change of use of land to the rear of No. 19 Millburn Avenue, Clydebank to form private rear garden ground and construction of associated fence/gate and ancillary outbuilding (retrospective) at No. 19 Millburn Avenue, Clydebank by Miss Sylwia Gadas.

Bailie Denis Agnew left the meeting at this point, having declared an interest in this item earlier in the meeting.

Reference was made to a site visit which had been undertaken in respect of the above application. The Planning, Building Standards and Environmental

Health Manager was heard in further explanation of the report and in answer to Members' questions.

Councillor Finn, Chair, invited Mr Robert Hay and Mr Gil Paterson, on behalf of the objector, to address the Committee. Both were heard in support of the objection and in answer to Members' questions.

The Chair then invited Mr Gadas, applicant, to address the Committee. Mr Gadas was heard in support of the application and in answer to Members' questions.

After discussion and having heard the Planning, Building Standards and Environmental Health Manager in answer to Members questions, the Committee agreed to grant full planning permission subject to condition 1 of the conditions set out in Section 9 of the report and subject to an amended condition 2 that access to No. 17 Millburn Avenue shall be maintained at all times and no gates or fences shall be erected, as detailed in Appendix 3 hereto.

# ADJOURNMENT

The Committee agreed to adjourn for a short time to allow for a comfort break.

The meeting reconvened at 11.14 a.m. with all those shown in the sederunt present.

(c) DC21/138/FUL – Proposed residential redevelopment of 88 dwellings compromising of cottage flats, bungalows and flats with vehicular access, associated car parking and landscape works at land at the corner of Glasgow Road and Mill Road, Clydebank by West Dunbartonshire Council.

Reference was made to a site visit which had been undertaken in respect of the above application.

After discussion and having heard from the Planning, Building Standards and Environmental Health Manager, the Housing Development and Homeless Manager and representative Solicitor Matt McPhee in further explanation of the report and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed that consideration of the report be continued to the next meeting of the Planning Committee to allow officers to give further consideration to parking provision which had been raised as an issue by members of the Committee.

Note: Bailie Denis Agnew left the meeting during consideration of this item.

#### STREET NAMES FOR NEW HOUSING DEVELOPMENT SITE AT MILLER STREET, CLYDEBANK BY MILLER HOMES

A report was submitted by the Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration recommending two street names within the new housing development at Miller Street, Clydebank.

After discussion, the Committee agreed that Rosebery Street and Millerbank Street be approved as the street names for the development.

The meeting closed at 12:18 p.m.

# PLANNING COMMITTEE

# NOTE OF VISITATIONS – 25 JUNE 2021

Present: Bailie Denis Agnew and Councillors Gail Casey, Jim Finn and Marie McNair.

(The above lists Members who attended at least one site visit)

Attending:Pamela Clifford, Planning, Building Standards and<br/>Environmental Health Manager; Lorna Ramsey, Lead Planning<br/>Officer; Michael McGuinness, Economic Development<br/>Manager and Robin Abram, Project Manager.

(The above lists officers who attended at least one site visit)

# SITE VISITS

Site visits were undertaken in connection with the undernoted planning applications:-

# DC21/018/FUL - 10 Castle Terrace, Castle Street, Dumbarton

Change of Use of office to flat, Flat 1/3, 10 Castle Terrace, Castle Street, Dumbarton G82 1QY by Richmond Architects.

# DC21/081/FUL - Land Adjacent to Miller Street, Clydebank

Section 42 application to amend Condition 2 (with revised brick type specification) and remove Condition 19 (traffic calming measures) of planning permission DC20/028 Residential Development Site on Land Adjacent to Miller Street, Clydebank by Miller Homes.

# DC21/030/FUL - Space at Bowling Green, John Knox Street, Clydebank

Erection of 3 storey block of flats comprising 18 units and associated parking and open space at bowling green, John Knox Street, Clydebank by Clydebank Housing Association.

# DC21/115/FUL - Queens Quay, Cart Street, Clydebank

Section 42 to vary Condition no. 1 (development phasing), Condition no. 3 (Design Codes reference) and Condition no. 27 (Bird Hazard Management Plan) of permission DC15/234 at Queens Quay, Cart Street, Clydebank.

TPO18/13 – Felling of trees (16x Lime, 5x Sycamore and 1x Silver Birch) at Bell Street Edward Street McGregor Street and White Street, Clydebank by West Dunbartonshire Council Greenspace.

#### GRANT full planning permission subject to the following conditions:-

1. Prior to any of the tree felling works hereby approved being undertaken on site, full details of the compensatory replanting scheme of 22 trees shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. This shall include a plan alongside details of the location, species and age of the trees to be planted. The approved compensatory replanting scheme shall thereafter be undertaken in a timescale to be agreed in writing by the Planning Authority.

DC20/176 – Change of use of land to the rear of 19 Millburn Avenue, Clydebank to form private rear garden ground and construction of associated fence/gate and ancillary outbuilding (retrospective) at No. 19 Millburn Avenue, Clydebank by Miss Sylwia Gadas.

#### GRANT full planning permission subject to the following conditions:-

- 1. For the avoidance of doubt the use of the shed hereby approved shall be for purposes which are incidental to the enjoyment of the dwelling house and no trade or business shall be carried out therefrom.
- 2. Access to no. 17 Millburn Avenue shall be maintained at all times and no gates or fences shall be erected.

# PLANNING COMMITTEE

# NOTE OF VISITATIONS – 4 October 2021

Present:Bailie Denis Agnew and Councillors Gail Casey, Karen<br/>Conaghan, Jonathan McColl and Lawrence O'Neill.

Attending: Pamela Clifford, Planning, Building Standards and Environmental Health Manager.

(The above lists Members who attended all three visits with the exception of Bailie Denis Agnew who did not attend the site visit at DC20/176 - 19 Millburn Avenue, Clydebank.

# SITE VISITS

Site visits were undertaken in connection with the undernoted planning applications:-

**TPO18/13** – Felling of trees (compromising of 16 Lime, 5 Sycamore and 1 Silver Birch) at various locations on Bell Street, Edward Street, McGregor Street and White Street, Clydebank by West Dunbartonshire Council.

**DC20/176** – Change of use of land to the rear of No. 19 Millburn Avenue, Clydebank to form private rear garden ground and construction of associated fence/gate and ancillary outbuilding (retrospective) at No. 19 Millburn Avenue, Clydebank by Miss Sylwia Gadas.

**DC21/138/FUL** – Proposed residential redevelopment of 88 dwellings compromising of cottage flats, bungalows and flats with vehicular access, associated car parking and landscape works at land at the corner of Glasgow Road and Mill Road, Clydebank by West Dunbartonshire Council.

# Item 7

#### WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

# **Report by Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration**

Planning Committee: 10 November 2021

# DC21/212/PPP Proposed residential development at land to the east of 8 Cochno Holdings, Cochno Road, Hardgate by Miss Cunningham

# 1. REASON FOR REPORT

**1.1** This application is subject to representation and is contrary to the local development plan. Under the terms of the approved Scheme of Delegation it therefore requires to be determined by the Planning Committee.

# 2. **RECOMMENDATION**

**2.1 Grant** planning permission in principle subject to conditions set out in Section 9.

# 3. DEVELOPMENT DETAILS

3.1 The application site is located on the eastern side of Cochno Road to the south east of the junction with Duncombe Avenue. The site area is 0.55 hectares and presently accommodates the rear garden of No. 8 Cochno Holdings, this is a detached bungalow with an associated garage/outhouse to the north of the bungalow. It is known that the site has historically been use for dog kennels and a poultry farm. Aside from the domestic garden associated with No.8 Cochno Holdings the land is a grass field with some fruit trees and the land slopes to the north. Vehicle access to the site is off Cochno Road and is sited in between the bungalow and the garage/outhouse. It is also noted that Cochno Road is at a lower level than the application site. Along the length of the site's western site boundary with Cochno Road there is a strong hedgerow. On the opposite side of Cochno Road there are a variety of bungalows that are set back from the road by circa. 21metres. To the site's southern and part eastern boundary the site abuts the two storey houses of Cochno Brae. The houses of Cochno Brae sit at a lower level than the application site and there is a 2m high close boarded fence on the boundaries with these properties. To the remaining eastern boundary and the northern

boundary there are open fields with mature hedgerows forming this boundary. At the northwestern part of the site the application site includes an area of the adjacent open field. This area is 350 sqm. and has a length of circa. 43m and is to the rear of the existing garage/outhouse. The open fields to the north accommodate the electricity pylons and it is also noted that Cochno Burn is located in the field to the east.

3.2 Planning permission in principle is sought for the residential rdevelopment of the site. At this point the application seeks to establish that the principle of residential redevelopment is acceptable as well as the means of access. No detailed layout or house type designs have been submitted at this point and accordingly no assessment can be made regarding these matters. In support of the application the Supporting Statement indicates that the site could accommodate up to 3-4 dwellings. The site layout includes a proposed means of access to the north of the existing garage/outbuilding. This arrangement results in the need for land in the field to the north of the existing garage/outhouse to achieve the vehicular access. The existing access to No. 8 Cochno Holdings will be retained and car parking spaces associated with that dwelling is proposed. The application also includes works to construct a pavement on the eastern side of Cochno Road for the length of the application site's boundary with Cochno Road.

# 4. CONSULTATIONS

- **4.1** <u>West Dunbartonshire Council Roads Service</u> have no objection to the principle and advise that the development can be served by a private access provided it serves no more than 5 dwellings. The extension of the existing footway is welcomed and will ensure the development is accessible by active travel modes.
- **4.2** <u>West Dunbartonshire Bio-diversity officer</u> advises that the nearby Cochno Burn is known to be used by otters and appropriate surveys and Preliminary Ecological Appraisal will be necessary but this would be more appropriate at the next stage if planning permission in principle were granted. Compensatory tree planting to strengthen boundaries should also be a consideration.
- **4.3** <u>West Dunbartonshire Council Environmental Health Service</u> has no objection subject to conditions regarding ground contamination, remediation, hours of construction and dust control.
- **4.4** <u>Scottish Water</u> has no objections to the proposed development.

# 5. **REPRESENTATIONS**

- **5.1** Eleven objections have been received from local residents. The material planning points raised can be summarised as follows:
  - Impact on traffic and existing highway safety issues will exacerbate.
  - There is no need for new housing given the current building rates elsewhere in Clydebank.
  - Loss of amenity to neighbouring houses by reason of overshadowing and loss of privacy.
  - Existing drainage and flooding problems will be exacerbated by this development.
  - Loss of greenbelt land is contrary to Local Plan policies.

# 6. ASSESSMENT AGAINST THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN

#### West Dunbartonshire Adopted Local Plan 2010

- 6.1 Policy GB1 advises that there is a strong presumption against inappropriate development in the green belt and development will not be permitted which would have an adverse effect on the landscape character of the local area. Policy UR1 encourages the redevelopment and re-use of underused, vacant and/or derelict land and buildings for appropriate uses such as housing. Policy H4 sets out standards expected of residential development, requiring high quality design in the range of house types and sizes and in terms of form, layout and materials. Policy GD1 seeks to ensure that all new development is of a high quality of design and respects the character and amenity of the area.
- 6.2 Policy T1 and T4 requires sites to be integrated with sustainable travel and Policy E5 relates to trees and requires new development proposals to consider impacts on trees and incorporate suitable tree planting. Policies F1 and F2 aims to ensure that new development is not at risk from, and does not increase the risk of flooding, and has suitable SUDS drainage infrastructure.

# 7. ASSESSMENT AGAINST MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

#### West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan (LDP1) Proposed Plan

7.1 On 27 April 2016, the Planning Committee took a final decision not to accept the Local Development Plan Examination Report recommended modification in respect of including the Duntiglennan Fields site in Clydebank as a housing development opportunity, and therefore, as a result of the Scottish Ministers' Direction, the Local Development Plan has

remained unadopted but continues to be a material consideration in the determination of planning applications.

- **7.2** Policy DS2 restricts development in the green belt so as to maintain the attractiveness and character of the area. The development requires the consideration of policies DS1, GN2, SD1, DS6 and GN3 and GN5 with regards to new residential development, green network, transport, flooding and drainage and protected species and trees. These policies are similar to that of the Adopted Plan. DS7 requires any potential site contamination issues to be dealt with and DS1 seeks to ensure a high design quality in housing and being suitable for a mix of occupants.
- **7.3** The proposed development is assessed against the Proposed Plan and the Residential Development Guidance in Section 7 below.

#### West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan (LDP2) Proposed Plan

- 7.4 The modified Plan and associated documents was approved by the Council on 19 August 2020. The Council has advised the Scottish Ministers of its intention to adopt the Plan. On 18<sup>th</sup> December 2020, the Scottish Ministers issued a Direction in relation to the housing land chapter of the Plan. None of the policies considered in the determination of this application is affected by the Direction. Therefore, Local Development Plan 2 is the Council's most up to date policy position and is afforded significant weight in the assessment and determination of planning applications.
- **7.5** Policy GB1 seeks to ensure that new development is directed towards urban areas to maintain the attractiveness and character of the green belt. Similarly to Policy DS1 of LDP 1, Policy CP1 seeks to ensure that housing is of a high quality, adaptable and is designed to be suitable for a mix of occupants. It indicates that all new development will be expected to contribute towards creating successful places by having regard to the six qualities of a successful place (distinctive, adaptable, resource efficient, easy to get to/move around, safe and pleasant, and welcoming).
- **7.6** Policy GI2,G14, BE1, FCC1, ENV1, ENV4, ENV5 and ENV6 are similar to the green network, built heritage, tree, water environment and flooding policies of the Adopted and LDP 1 policies, albeit that Policy GI2 sets a higher open space standard to that of the adopted Local Plan and LDP 1. Policies CP2 requires the integration and consideration of green infrastructure from the outset of the design process through to its maintenance and stewardship of the resource. Policy G12 and Policy G14 require that where residential developments are unable to meet the required green infrastructure standards on site, they must provide a financial contribution towards the cost of providing or improving green infrastructure within the area. As this application is "in principle" and the

number and type of units is not confirmed. It will be for the subsequent detailed application for the site to provide the appropriate development contribution for green infrastructure.

7.7 Policy CON4 sets out a need for all developments to install sufficient broadband provisions. Policy ENV8 requires developments to address air quality, lighting and noise as part of the planning process, whilst policy ENV9 requires all potentially contaminated sites to be remediated where necessary to ensure that the site is suitable for the intended use. It is considered that the proposals comply with the above policies as discussed below.

#### Principle of Development

- **7.8** The majority of the application site is not allocated for any specific use in the adopted Local Plan or in Local Development Plan 1 and 2, being part of an 'existing residential area'. In this respect, having regard to the character of the surroundings, the principle of residential development is acceptable. As the application is for planning permission in principle and access is the only issue is being asked to consider, this forms the basis of the following assessment. The applicant envisages 3 or 4 detached houses either 1.5 or 2 storey in height but no layout or design has been provided for assessment at this stage and this would be provided at the detailed stage.
- 7.9 As detailed above it is proposed that the vehicle access to the site is achieved by utilising a strip of land to the north of the existing garage/outhouse. This strip of land is circa. 350 sgm and adjoins Cochno Road. The strip of land is within land allocated as green belt and the following policies are applicable to the determination of this application, Local Plan (2010) Policy WC1 Wider Countryside, Local Development Plan (2016) Policy GB1 Greenbelt & Countryside Development and Local Development Plan 2 (2020) Policy GB1 Greenbelt & Countryside. These policies seek to restrict development to those that are compatible within a rural setting and do not have an adverse impact on the established rural character and landscape. In terms of Policy GB1 Greenbelt and Countryside in LDP 2 the residential development is in accordance with Policy H1 however the part of the application site that falls within the greenbelt which facilitates access to the site requires to be assessed against Policy GB1.
- **7.10** A Supporting Statement has been submitted by the applicant which seeks to justify the proposal against these policies. The Supporting Statement contends that there is a justifiable and specific locational need for the proposed access hence meeting the requirements of Policy GB1 in LDP2 The Supporting Statement discounts using the existing access to the wider

site. The reasons for this being the intensification of vehicle movements adjacent to the north elevation of No. 8 Cochno Holdings (the applicants dwelling) and loss of the garage/outhouse would have unacceptable implications for No. 8 Cochno Holdings. The applicant also considers that using the existing access would impact on the bungalows sitting opposite. The Supporting Statement also discounts forming a new access to the south of No. 8 Cochno Holdings as this option is seen to present challenges with the gradient and would impact on the applicant's garden. The Supporting Statement contends that the proposed use of a strip of the adjacent field to facilitate the access to the site is therefore the best option. The Statement asserts that, '...the development of a very small section of the existing agricultural field could be achieved without having any material impact on the existing settlement boundary, the green belt or the landscape character of the surrounding area.'

7.11 The area of green belt land needed to facilitate this access is 350 sqm, equating to circa. 15% of the overall application site area. The strip of land has a width of 9m to Cochno Road. With respect to the wider context and the surrounding green fields the area of green belt land needed to facilitate this development is considered to be small and its loss would have a negligible impact on protecting the green belt and its wider role. The fields also contain significant overhead power lines. The existing hedgerow field boundary to the north of the applicant's garage/outhouse provides a very visible, established and well defined boundary between the houses of Cochno Road and Cochno Brae and the land beyond, although it is noted that there are gaps in the hedgerow at its western end. Changes to facilitate the proposed access will be visible and will involve adding a new two width vehicle junction. The existing hedgerows will also need to be removed and this will be visible but can be reduced by new robust planting to screen the new access and provide a defined settlement boundary. It is considered in this instance that taking a small area of the adjacent field to form an access to the site will not affect the character and amenity of the area and will not undermine the Local Plan policies seeking to protect green belt land.

#### **Technical Matters**

- **7.12** The Council's Environmental Health Service have requested a site investigation report including remediation and mitigation measures. These matters alongside other matters regarding dust mitigation and construction activity can be dealt with by condition together with the Preliminary Ecological Appraisals requested by the Council's Bio-diversity officer.
- **7.13** The Roads Service has not raised any issues in terms of the new access and has welcomed the extension of the footpath along Cochno Road.

# 8. CONCLUSION

**8.1** Whilst the principle of residential development is acceptable, the means of access would result in the small incremental loss of green belt land. The loss of this land will not be highly visible and can be mitigated by strong landscaping and will not have a negative impact on the amenity and character of the area, or on the role and purpose of the green belt. The additional information provided by the applicant is considered to justify this small loss of greenbelt land together with the extension of the footway along Cochno Road.

#### 9. CONDITIONS

- 1. No development shall commence on site until such time as approval of matters specified in conditions for the following matters shall be obtained from the planning authority. Any application for approval of matters specified in conditions shall be submitted before the expiration of three years from the date of this planning permission in principle and shall include:
- a) site layout plans showing the position of all buildings, roads, footpaths, car parking areas, walls, fences and landscaping;
- b) block and layout plans and elevations of each building showing dimensions, design, height and palettes of external materials;
- c) landscape and streetscape plans showing the location of all proposed trees, shrubs, hedges, palettes of landscaping materials
- d) details of existing and proposed levels and finished floor levels relating to a clearly identified fixed datum point;
- e) the means of drainage and sewage;
- f) a detailed report on the extent, scale and nature of any contamination of the site and a remediation scheme;
- h) a Ecological Appraisal detailing any ecological interest in the site and how it should be addressed.
- i) the provision of open space to West Dunbartonshire Council's Residential Design Guidance.
- 2. Under condition 1 above details to be submitted shall include no more than 4 houses.
- 3. Prior to any development on site the existing footpath along the eastern side of Cochno Road shall be extended to the junction with Duncombie Avenue. Details of the footpath and its location shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority and implemented prior to the occupation of any houses on site.
- 4. Detailed to be submitted under condition 1(c) shall include a landscaping strip along the northern boundary to screen the new vehicular access.

#### Peter Hessett

Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration Date: 10<sup>th</sup> November 2021

Person to Contact:	Pamela Clifford, Planning & Building Standards
	Manager Email: Pamela.Clifford@west-dunbarton.gov.uk
	Email. <u>Famela.Clinolu@west-dunbarton.gov.uk</u>

Appendix: Location Plan

Background Papers:

- 1. Application forms and plans;
- 2. Consultation responses;
- 3. Representations;
- 4. West Dunbartonshire Local Plan 2010;
- 5. West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Proposed Plan;
- West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan 2 Proposed Plan.

Wards affected: Ward 4 - Kilpatrick



#### WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

#### **Report by the Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration**

### Planning Committee: 10 November 2021

# Subject: Rediscovering the Antonine Wall Project and Re-Imagining the Antonine Wall – Phase 2

#### 1. PURPOSE

**1.1** To seek approval that the Council will continue to manage the Antonine Wall Project for Historic Environment Scotland and the four other Councils.

### 2. **RECOMMENDATION**

- **2.1** It is recommended that the Committee:
  - notes the progress and achievements of the Antonine Wall Project as described in this report;
  - agrees to continue to manage the Antonine Wall Project for the next 3 years for Historic Environment Scotland and for the other partner Councils;
  - notes that officers will submit as a growth item for capital funding for £10k from West Dunbartonshire Council to the project in setting the 2022/23 budget.

#### 3. BACKGROUND

- **3.1** The Antonine Wall forms part of the Frontiers of the Roman Empire World Heritage Site. It runs from Old Kilpatrick in West Dunbartonshire to Bo'ness in the Falkirk Council area, passing through the Council areas of Glasgow, East Dunbartonshire and North Lanarkshire. These local authorities, in partnership with Historic Environment Scotland, are responsible for the management of the Antonine Wall World Heritage Site, which is guided by a Management Plan. This Council manages and leads the Rediscovering the Antonine Wall Project for the other partner authorities since 2016. The Project Manager and Development Officer work directly with the Antonine Wall WHS Co-ordinator at Historic Environment Scotland and are responsible to the Steering Group which comprises representatives from the five Councils and Historic Environment Scotland.
- **3.2** The Rediscovering the Antonine Wall project was the first project of its type whereby five local authorities are working together with Historic Environment Scotland to increase the awareness, understanding and engagement with the Antonine Wall World Heritage Site and to better connect communities and visitors to the Wall. In response to extensive consultation with communities

and stakeholders and to create both community and visitor benefits the following project elements have been achieved to date:

- Installation of five replica Roman distance stones which includes two large Roman head sculptures which has included a skills development partnership with City of Glasgow College;
- Creation of four Roman themed play facilities with the fifth one due to complete in 2022;
- A series of community led engagement projects including murals with young people, Roman themed gardens, Antonine Wall trishaws, community-led sculpture projects and a refugee and asylum seeker project;
- Reshooting of 1960's film charting the route of the Wall to include interviews with communities;
- Creation of 21<sup>st</sup> century Legion volunteer workforce;
- A touring exhibition, launched at Perth Museum and Art Gallery and due to tour to other venues from 2022;
- Creation of curriculum linked educational resources.
- 3.3 The project has been immensely successful in raising the profile of the Wall due to the creation of new and interesting attractions in areas that were harder to understand and appreciate and had little interpretive content to attract visitors other than those with a particular interest in Roman heritage. The sculptures, distance stones and playparks in particular are helping less traditional audiences to actively engage with, explore and understand the heritage of the Wall and the Roman occupation of Scotland. Academic rigour and multi layered interpretative content has not been sacrificed and the project has received several accolades for its outreach and interpretation approach. This collaborative project has also been recognised on an international level: it received the Honourable Mention for the European Archaeological Heritage Prize 2021 and has been shortlisted as a finalist for an Association for Heritage Interpretation award for the sculpture and distance stone at Nethercroy. In addition, it was the only UK project selected as an example of Best Practice by the Eurocities Cultural Heritage in Action programme (hosting virtual Peer Review visits in April 2021) and was recently presented on an international stage for Europe Nostra, the leading citizens' movement to protect and celebrate Europe's cultural and natural heritage. It has featured in a European Association of Archaeologists conference keynote presentation (2020) and papers in major international academic journals. The project manager, together with the Antonine Wall coordinator, have presented the project to numerous audiences, including the annual St Andrew's Day meeting of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland (2020).
- **3.4** Significant collaboration and partnership have been created during the time of the Project with key sectoral organisations such as Hunterian Museum, University of Glasgow, City of Glasgow College, Forestry and Land Scotland and Scottish Canals. Most have expressed a desire to continue to collaborate beyond the individual projects as they recognise that the Antonine Wall is a

valuable joint asset with mutual benefits. The bulk of the funding for the Project has been through the National Lottery Heritage Fund (£1.08m) with additional funding provided by the five Councils, Historic Environment Scotland and Leader.

The project recently was granted a one year extension from the original end date of October 2021 to October 2022 by the National Lottery Heritage Fund due to the impact of Covid which will allow delayed community projects such as the murals, comic books, creative writing, theatre and refugee work to be completed. The Rediscovering Antonine Wall Project is presently being evaluated by external consultants and this will feed into the emerging business plan for Stage 2 of Antonine Wall Project.

# 4 MAIN ISSUES

**4.1** Given the success of the Rediscovering the Antonine Wall Project and responding to newly identified community priorities which have emerged over the life of the Project, the focus is now on meeting wider sustainable development goals, making the Wall more accessible along its full length and growing the visitor offer. There is a real potential to use the wall as a catalyst for regeneration and sustainable economic development and this would support the objectives of the National Planning Framework 4, a spatial plan for Scotland to 2050, and the Sustainable Development Goals for UNESCO especially around health and wellbeing and green tourism. The Silvanus sculpture at Nethercroy is a good example whereby previously the area was used by local residents for leisure activities and dog walking and with the introduction of the sculpture it has created a destination for walkers and cyclists and a visitor attraction.

#### Re-imagining of Antonine Wall

- **4.2** The Steering Group comprises of Historic Environment Scotland and the 5 Local Authorities. Four of the Local Authorities and Historic Environment Scotland have agreed in principle to continue to support and fund the Antonine Wall Project. One Local Authority from the Steering Group still is considering their position. It is proposed that the Project would continue to be managed by West Dunbartonshire Council with staff working directly with the Antonine Wall WHS Co-ordinator at Historic Environment Scotland and being responsible to the Steering Group. It is suggested that the initial project elements of Phase 2 will focus on the following:
  - Regeneration: improved spaces for communities and visitors along the Wall, improving existing assets in each local authority.
  - Reinterpretation: improved visitor offers at key locations.
  - Access: improved signage, walking routes and more sustainable options.
  - Commercial opportunities: using the Antonine Wall brand to begin to generate income to support future work.
  - Skills Development: Develop opportunities for apprenticeships, internships and engagement.

Initial discussions with the National Lottery Heritage Fund have indicated that they would be supportive of the rollout of some elements of the existing project that have acted as pilot projects, for example the Roman head sculptures which could be replicated elsewhere and in the skills development partnership with City of Glasgow College which could be rolled out to other further education providers along the Wall.

**4.3** The second phase of the Project supports opportunities to look at existing. successful assets held by Partner/ key stakeholder organisations where small scale investment such as an exhibition space or improved facilities (toilets/café) would expanded the offer for visitors. More significant and transformational proposals of this second phase include looking at properties currently on the Buildings at Risk Register and focusing on targeted development for the 5 Council areas. One such property in West Dunbartonshire likely to be suitable is "B" listed Dunglass Castle and Henry Bell Obelisk Monument sited on the Exxon site which is in close proximity to the Antonine Wall. The Project would seek funding sources for the restoration of Dunglass Castle and future viable uses

# 5. **PEOPLE IMPLICATIONS**

5.1 The Project currently employs a Project Manager, a Development Officer and graduate Education officer. All are on temporary contracts to December 2022. It is intended that if the Project is continued that the contract of the Project Manager is renewed in line with the duration of the Re-imagining of the Antonine Wall Project.

# 6. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- **6.1** It is proposed that the Project should continue after the current funding period ceases in 2022. A contribution of £10,000 is secured through the Planning and Building Standards revenue budget. Officers will submit a contribution of £10,000 capital per year for the next 3 years as a growth item for Members consideration in setting the 2022/23 budget.
- 6.2 Over the three years of the project to date, the return on investment for West Dunbartonshire contributing £10,000 revenue/£10,000 capital per year (£60,000 in total) and being able to access external funding through the Antonine Project has included a new playpark at Goldenhill Park costing c. £114,000 and a replica distance stone costing c. £53,000 so far. By the end of the current project the total will be c. £185,000 capital. In addition, there has been revenue spend, raising awareness of the Wall and community work as well as the Project being nominated for and won awards. The next stage of the Antonine Wall could see a predicted greater return in capital terms.

#### 7. RISK ANALYSIS

7.1 There are risks associated with this Council undertaking the lead applicant and accountable body role. These risks and mitigation have been identified in a project risk register for the project delivery phase and fully assessed. If approval is not given by the Committee, the project will not proceed, the considerable work achieved to date by all partners may be lost and the momentum built up within the communities along the Wall and at a national level for the World Heritage Site will disappear. There will also be reputational damage to this Council as lead applicant for the overall project.

### 8. EQUALITIES IMPACT ASESSMENT (EIA)

**8.1** An equalities impact assessment screening will be required as part of stage 2 of Re-imagining of Antonine Wall.

#### 9. STRATEGIC ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT

**9.1** The proposed project is not considered to have significant environmental impacts requiring a Strategic Environmental Assessment.

#### 10. CONSULTATION

**10.1** Historic Environment Scotland and the 4 other local authorities who form part of the Steering Group have been consulted on Re-imagining of the Antonine Wall Project.

#### 11. STRATEGIC ASSESSMENT

**11.1** The Antonine Wall National Heritage Lottery Fund projects are considered to align with the strategic priority of improving the wellbeing of communities.

#### Peter Hessett Chief Officer - Regulatory and Regeneration Date: 10 November 2021

Person to Contact:	Pamela Clifford, Planning, Building Standards and Environmental Health Manager Email: Pamela.Clifford@west-dunbarton.gov.uk
Appendices:	None
Background Papers:	Antonine Wall website – antoninewall.org

Wards Affected: 4 – Kilpatrick 5 – Waterfront

## WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

# **Report by the Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration**

Planning Committee: 10 November 2021

### Subject: Annual Review of Quarries and Landfill Sites

#### 1. Purpose

**1.1** To update the Committee on the annual monitoring of the two quarries and two landfill sites in the West Dunbartonshire Council area along with the status of the relevant restoration bonds which apply to three of the sites.

#### 2. Recommendations

**2.1** That the Committee notes the progress of the quarry and landfill sites, the status of the relevant restoration bonds and that a further update will be provided to a future Planning Committee during 2022.

#### 3. Background

**3.1** Formal monitoring arrangements of the Council's two quarries and two landfill sites were agreed in 2014. An annual report is presented to the Planning Committee detailing the progress of the operations, restoration arrangements and highlighting any issues at the two quarries and two landfill sites within this Council's Planning Authority area. The Planning Compliance Officer continues to monitor the progress of the landfill and quarry sites assisted by Planning Officers.

#### 4. Main Issues

#### Annual Monitoring of Sites

**4.1** This year site visits took place to the two quarry sites and the two landfill sites associated with respective applications for the sites. A detailed site visit took place by the Planning Compliance Officer at Auchencarroch Landfill site. The Planning Compliance Officer has retained contact with each of the sites. All four sites continue to progress in accordance generally within the terms of their respective planning permission.

#### Auchencarroch

- **4.2** The landfill site has seen significant investment over the last 12 months with upgrades to the processing line costs which have improved efficiency of the operations at the site. This has included the road into the site which has been resurfaced which has accelerated the turnaround times for vehicles. Permission was granted for the extraction of the clay including progressive restoration (DC19/033) in July 2019. The clay extraction would be used for the landfill cell engineering process on the adjacent landfill site and has been implemented on site.
- **4.3** Currently work is ongoing on waste disposal operations in Cell E4 by way of infilling. Previously the landfill operator had undertaken initial restoration of completed Cell E3 by way of capping. The final restoration of cell E3 has not been completed however continuous assessment of the cell is ongoing and planting/re-seeding in line with the restoration agreement will be progressed during 2021/2022.
- **4.4** A new operational cell, E5 has been constructed, the initial "fluff layer" placement has commenced. The fluff layer is utilised as the sub structure for a vehicle pathway into the cell allowing for vehicles to tip directly into the cell. Full waste tipping is expected later in 2021. During the later period of 2021 the capping of cell E4 will commence in accordance with the planning conditions and in accordance with restoration scheme.
- **4.5** Settlement of cell E2 has stopped and it is expected waste placement within cell E5 will "come up and over" the settled flank of E2 thus providing the required land form profile that is needed for "capping". Discussions have taken place between the operator and planning officers regarding changes to the restoration proposals and this will be achieved through the current application to extend the time of the approved landfilling operation which is currently under consideration.
- 4.6 The recycling centre waste streams have remained static albeit there was an interruption to green waste and organic services due to Covid restrictions as Councils ceased the uplift of green waste. However, the amount of waste being deposited as landfill remains significantly below the approved maximum allowance. The Scottish Government have several ambitious targets for reducing waste and increasing recycling. By 2025 the aim is to reduce total waste arising in Scotland by 15 % against 2011 levels, reduce food waste by 33 % against the 2013 levels recycle 70 % of remaining waste, send no more than 5 % of remaining waste to landfill. The foregoing targets will have an impact on Auchencarroch however the operator has indicated that changes have been made to reflect the reduction of landfill in the cells. The extant planning permission permits the disposal of waste until 31 December 2022 with restoration to be completed by 31 December 2024. This has resulted in the application (DC 20/253) to extend the time of the approved landfilling operation and restoration by an additional 15 years.

This application is under consideration and will come to a future meeting of the Planning Committee.

- **4.7** Over the past 12 month period, seven odour related complaints have been made directly to SEPA in respect of the Landfill or recycling centre. None of the complaints received were substantiated by SEPA and the current SEPA Compliance Assessment Score for the operator is "Excellent" status. There have been no direct complaints made to the Planning or Environmental Health Services in respect of this site.
- A bond at the original level of £120, 000 remains in place and has been 4.8 renewed until 31st December 2022- the end of the current planning permission. The existing bond requirements will require to be reviewed in terms of the current application to extend the time of the approved landfilling operation and restorations. Initial discussions have taken place with the operator and the bond is likely to require to be increased substantially to meet the requirements of restoration. In addition to the Council's bond the site is regulated by SEPA and it demonstrates financial provision by means of a parent company guarantee which states the aggregate liability or financial provision limit. The current financial provision for Auchencarroch remains at the same level as previously set of over 1 million pounds. There is an ongoing dispute about Scottish Landfill Tax between Barr Environmental Limited and Revenue Scotland. The Scottish First-tier Tax Tribunal recently found in favour of Revenue Scotland. The Council has been advised that Barr are appealing the decision. The sums involved are huge. If Revenue Scotland are ultimately successful, it appears that there will be a severe impact on the viability of Barr.
- 4.9 <u>Dumbuckhill Quarry</u>

There are seven benches in total at the Quarry. All excavation works have been completed on the 147m and 135m benches and the faces have been left at a safe angle of repose as required by the agreed details. Work has commenced at the northern end and quarrying continues on the 123m bench. The works to bench 123 will continue for around 6-8 months. Since the Covid-19 restrictions were eased aggregate output has returned to pre-existing levels. To date the quarry has extracted approximately 30% of its agreed extraction, leaving approximately 3.8 million tons of reserves.

**4.10** In June of 2021 the Review of Minerals Permission (DC19/163) and application (DC19/162) to extend the life of quarrying operations, it was agreed to approve both applications subject to the satisfactory conclusion of a legal agreement in terms of the restoration bond. Presently an independent review is being carried out of the Restoration bond and once concluded the decisions on both applications can be issued. As the bond and legal agreement have yet to be finalised the

quarry continues to operate as per the existing planning conditions. The existing restoration bond of £200,000 agreed in 2014 remains in place (until 4<sup>th</sup> April 2024).

**4.11** There have been a total of 23 complaints made regarding blasting at the quarry since the last report. Environmental Health Service indicated that all blast measurements are well below the nationally agreed levels of 6mm/s. There are no outstanding improvement notices by Health and Safety Executive, SEPA or any other regulatory bodies for this site.

#### Rigangower Landfill

- **4.12** The recycling plant has remained fully operational over the last 12 months with a steady production around 15% less than an average year pre- COVID. The stockpiles of materials are maintained below the 9 metres in height as per the planning condition. The recycling and reprocessing of incoming and previously landfilled materials continues.
- **4.13** The bund surrounding the operational area remains in good condition with continuing growth on the trees providing good screening. All areas in the site, including areas within the landfill that are currently not being excavated, have been grassed over ensuring a more natural appearance of the landfill area. The site is being worked in accordance with the phasing plan. Phase one of the site is still being excavated however the volume of material removed was reduced due to Covid restrictions as well as labour and supply shortages, accordingly no restoration can take place until this area is complete. The extended capacity to the site has not been utilised and the operator has indicated that it is unlikely to be used whilst the excavation of previously landfilled material continues.
- **4.14** An application to install and operate additional recycling plant associated with the approved waste recycling facility (DC21/132) is presently under consideration. The additional facility is being sought to satisfy the demand for product together with a more sustainable generation of products from the site.
- 4.15 No complaints were received in respect of the site. The bond for the site was renewed in November 2019 and was set at the same level of £70,000 for a further 5 year period. The site's financial provision regulated by SEPA was demonstrated as being sufficient cover.

#### Sheephill Quarry

**4.16** The quarry continues to operate under the 1949 permission. The Review of Minerals Permission (WP98/076) was agreed by Council in March 2021 whilst the planning application for an extension to the north west of the extraction area (DC02/447) was refused by Council in March 2021. The refused application is now the subject of an appeal to the Planning and Environmental Appeals Division and a decision is awaited. The Review of Minerals Permission (ROMP) has been issued and the applicant has until 1<sup>st</sup> January 2022 to appeal the ROMP. The

conditions of the ROMP are only finally determined once an appeal has been determined or the right of appeal has expired.

- **4.17** The quarry has remained fully operational over the last 12 months with a steady production around 15 % less than pre Covid. The reduction is due to a number of factors, labour and supplier shortages along with managing Covid related issues on and off site. The site is currently being worked on both the east side at 135m level and west sides at 100m level. Initial works have commenced on the approved haul road following archaeological explorations. The operator indicates work on the road will be slow due to availability of plant and labour. It is anticipated that the road will be completed by the end of summer 2022.
- **4.18** Nine complaints were made regarding five blasting incidents, the recorded measurements indicate that all were below the permitted 6mm/as set out in PAN/50. One complaint was made regarding works being undertaken out with the consented area however following inspection this was not the case.
- **4.19** There is no bond for the wider quarry site. An application for Scheduled Monument Permission for the removal of Sheephill fort recently has been made to Historic Environment Scotland for a decision. The Council is currently preparing to make comments to this application.

# 5. **People Implications**

- **5.1** Staff time will be required to take forward any issues which arise from the monitoring exercises across all sites. It is anticipated that this additional workload can be accommodated through existing staff resources.
- **5.2** Continued monitoring of the two quarries and landfill sites will be undertaken by the Planning Compliance Officer assisted by Planning Officers, on an annual basis. Site visits will also be undertaken if any issues/complaints arise.

# 6. Financial and Procurement Implications

**6.1** Financial implications could arise in the future in the event of the failure of one of the site operators without a restoration bond, or if a bond was not sufficient to cover the required restoration of the site.

# 7. Risk Analysis

**7.1** There are financial and reputational risks to the Council if the sites are not formally monitored or the bonds are not adequate to cover the full cost of implementing the agreed restoration proposals. There is a higher risk to the Council if no bonds are in place and the operator fails.

# 8. Equalities Impact Assessment (EIA)

**8.1** It is not considered that the report or recommendations raise any equality issues.

#### 9. Environmental Sustainability

**9.1** All the quarry and landfill sites have been subject to Environmental Statements through the processing of the respective planning applications.

#### 10. Consultation

**10.1** No consultation was necessary for the preparation of this report.

#### 11. Strategic Assessment

**11.1** The annual monitoring of the quarry and landfill sites aligns with the strategic priorities of the Council.

#### Peter Hessett

# Chief Officer – Regulatory and Regeneration Date: 10 November 2021

Person to Contact:	Pamela Clifford, Planning, Building Standards and Environmental Health Manager Email: pamela.clifford@west-dunbarton.gov.uk
Appendices:	None
Background Papers:	Planning Committee Report, 28 <sup>th</sup> August 2019 Annual Review of Quarries and Landfill Sites
	Planning Committee Report, 30 April 2014 - Review of Quarries and Landfill sites (monitoring arrangements)
Wards Affected:	Ward 1 (Auchencarroch Landfill Site)
	Ward 3 (Dumbuck Quarry, Sheephill Quarry and Rigangower Landfill Site)