

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL**Report by Strategic Director of Transformation and Public Service Reform****Tendering Committee: 18 September 2019**

Subject: Contract Authorisation Report for the Provision of Buses and Associated Services.

1. Purpose

- 1.1** The purpose of this report is to seek the approval of the Tendering Committee to authorise the Strategic Lead Regulatory, to conclude the award of the contracts for the Provision of Buses and Associated Services.

2. Recommendations

- 2.1** It is recommended that the Tendering Committee:

- a) Authorise the Strategic Lead Regulatory, to conclude on behalf of West Dunbartonshire Council (the Council), to award four individual contracts for Buses and Associated Services as detailed at 4.6 of the report;
- b) The contracts at a total value of £2,197,643; and
- c) Note that the warranty contract shall be for a period of five years for Lot 3 only and three years for Lots 1, 4 and 5 with the option to extend for a further two up to 12 month periods at a cost to be determined.

3. Background

- 3.1** The overall Capital Budget for the Fleet Replacement Programme for 2019 to 2020 is £5,984,000, per the approved capital plan from Council on 27 March 2019. This budget is for all vehicles including Heavy Goods Vehicles, Buses and Light Vehicles, of which the budget for buses is £2,616,000.
- 3.2** The capital investment programme for fleet replacement continues to provide new vehicles to replace end of operational life vehicles on a seven year heavy goods vehicles and a ten year cycle for light commercial vehicles and cars. This will ensure that the vehicle technology and efficiency is up to date, cheaper to operate and safer.

4. Main Issues

- 4.1** A notice was published on the Public Contracts Scotland advertising portal on 11 July 2019 with a submission date of 12 noon on 22 July 2019:

- Lot 1 (one x 12 seater mini-bus) – seven bidders were invited to submit a response by the deadline and zero submissions were received;
- Lot 2 (one x 15 seater) and Lot 3 (an additional x 17 Seater without tail lift) were tendered for and zero submissions were received;
- Lot 3 (call off 1) (14 x 17 seater including tail lift) - twelve bidders were invited to submit a response by the deadline and five submissions were received;
- Lot 3 (call off 2) (1 x 17 seater including tail lift) – no bids were received.
- Lot 4 (11 X 28 seater mini-bus including tail lift) – seven bidders were invited to submit a response by the deadline and one submission was received and;
- Lot 5 (three x 37 seater mini-bus including tail lift) – eight bidders were invited to submit a response by the deadline and zero submissions were received.

4.2 For Lot 3 (Call off 1), five tender submissions and Lot 4 a single tender submission were evaluated by representatives from Fleet and Waste Services, against a pre-determined selection criteria forming part of the published tender documents which assessed competence, experience, and capacity. Five tender submissions passed the selection criteria.

4.3 As noted above in section 4.1, Lots 1, 2, 3 (call off 2) and 5 received no bids, therefore a process of direct award was undertaken where the service identified the vehicles were still required and approached the appropriate Framework Agreement providers to quote. For Lot 1, three quotes were reviewed against a standard vehicle specification which determined Best Value. For Lot 2 and 3 (call off 2), the service removed the requirement for the 12 and 17 seater mini buses (excluding tail lift). For Lot 5 this was a bespoke requirement, a price was submitted by the single supplier in the FA then negotiated to ensure Best Value was achieved.

4.4 The following five tender submissions were received and evaluated for Lot 3 (call off 1) against a set of award criteria which was based on a Price / Quality ratio of 30% / 70%. The scores relative to the award criteria of each tenderer for Lot 3 are as follows:

	Weighting	Courtside Conversions	Euromotive (Kent) Ltd	Stanford Coachworks	TBC Conversions Ltd	W Nicholson T/A Mellor Coachcraft
Lot 3 - Quality (70.0%)						
Service Delivery / Methodology	60.0%	45.0	30.0	27.0	45.0	33.0
Project Plan & Milestones	10.0%	7.5	5.0	2.5	7.5	5.0
Experience & Methodology	5.0%	0.0	1.3	1.3	3.8	3.8
Risks	10.0%	5.0	2.5	2.5	10.0	7.5
Phase Out/Exit Plan	5.0%	1.3	1.3	1.3	3.8	2.5
Sustainability	2.5%	1.9	1.3	0.6	1.9	1.3
Social Benefits	2.5%	1.3	1.3	0.6	0.6	1.9
e-Procurement	2.5%	1.3	0.9	1.3	1.6	1.9
Fair Working Practices	2.5%	0.0	0.6	0.0	1.9	1.9
Total Quality	100%	63.1	44.1	37.0	75.9	58.6
Total Quality	70.0%	44.2	30.8	25.9	53.2	41.0
Price (30.0%)						
Price Sub Total £	-	£57,642.00	£58,480.00	£61,185.00	£50,399.20	£57,596.00
Price Sub Total %	30.0%	26.2	25.9	24.7	30.0	26.3
Total Score	100%	70.4	56.7	50.6	83.2	67.3

The following tender submission was received and evaluated by Fleet Services and Scoping Officer for Lot 4 against a set of award criteria which was based on a Price / Quality ratio of 30% / 70%. The scores relative to the award criteria of the tenderer for Lot 4 are as follows:

	Weighting	W Nicholson T/A Mellor Coachcraft
Lot 4 - Quality (70.0%)		
Service Delivery / Methodology	60.0%	30.0
Project Plan & Milestones	10.0%	7.5
Experience & Methodology	5.0%	2.5
Risks	10.0%	5.0
Phase Out/Exit Plan	5.0%	2.5
Sustainability	2.5%	1.3
Social Benefits	2.5%	1.9
e-Procurement	2.5%	0.9

Fair Working Practices	2.5%	1.9
Total Quality	100%	53.4
Total Quality	70.0%	37.4
Price (30.0%)		
Price Sub Total £	-	£989,351
Price Sub Total %	30.0%	30.0
Total Score	100%	67.4

4.5 It is recommended that the Tendering Committee Authorise the Strategic Lead Regulatory, to conclude on behalf of West Dunbartonshire Council, to award the following contracts:

- Lot 1 (one 12 seater mini-bus) - Crown Commercial Services (CCS) via Scotland Excel (SXL) framework agreement (FA) for 03-17 Heavy and Municipal Vehicles to Peugeot Motor Company PLC, Ford Garage, Kerse Road, Stirling, FK7 7RW, for the value of £23,128.04 (ex VAT); for a contract for the vehicle purchase and warranty period of 3 years.
- Lot 3 (14 x 17 seater including tail lift) - CCS Dynamic Purchasing System (DPS) for RM 3814 Vehicle Conversions to TBC Conversions, 50 Far Circular Road, Dungannon, Co.Tyrone, Northern Ireland BT71 6LW, for the value of £738,111 (ex VAT); for a contract for the vehicle purchase and warranty period of 5 years.
- Lot 4 (11 X 28 seater mini-bus including tail lift) - CCS DPS for RM 3814 Vehicle Conversions to Woodland T/A Mellor Coachcraft, Miall Street, Rochdale OL11 1HY for the value of £973,027 (ex VAT); for a contract for the vehicle purchase and warranty period of 3 years. and
- Lot 5 (three x 37 seater mini-bus including tail lift) – CCS FA for RM6060 Vehicle Purchase to Nu- Track Ltd, Galgorm Industrial Estate, Fenaghy Road, Galgorm, Ballymena, BT42 1PY, for the value of £371,400 (ex VAT). For a contract for the vehicle purchase and warranty period of 3 years.

For Lots 1, 4 and 5 the Council will have the option to extend the warranty period for these vehicles, subject to an option appraisal process at that time.

4.6 The Living Wage is paid by the following suppliers:

- Lot 1, Peugeot Motor Company - All employees are paid the Scottish Living Wage;
- Lot 3, TBC Conversions - All employees except apprenticeships are paid the National Living Wage or above;
- Lot 4, Woodland T/A Mellor Coachcraft - All employees are paid the National Living Wage or above; and
- Lot 5, Nu-Track Limited - All employees are paid the National Living Wage or above.

- 4.7** The following suppliers have committed to delivery of the following social benefits as a result of delivery of these contracts via the CCS RM60606 / RM3814 and SXL FA 03-17:

TBC Conversions:

- Use of a demonstrator 16 seat wheelchair accessible minibus for 1 week (7 days); and
- 5 years warranty for the price of 3 years.

W Nicholson T/A Mellor Coach Craft:

- Sponsorship of a local sports team; and
- Quarterly workshops to cover career skills, mock interviews in co-ordination with the Education Learning and Attainment service.

Nu-Track Ltd:

- Sponsorship of a local sports team or community event - yet to be confirmed by the service;
- Donation of product vouchers to support apprentices; and
- Attend a local school to give a short talk on the benefits of public transportation, the move towards cleaner fuels and the environmental and waste management systems in place within the coachbuilding industry.

5. People Implications

- 5.1** There are no people implications.

6. Financial and Procurement Implications

- 6.1** Financial costs in respect of these contracts will be met from the approved portion of Capital budget for Fleet Asset Management Plan of £2,616,000. Subsequent to the capital plan being agreed further research identified that the cost of the buses required would be lower than the original estimate and would be £2,380,000. Following the tendering exercise the cost of the vehicles is now established at £2,197,643, resulting in an underspend against the original budget of £418,357.
- 6.2** The Corporate Procurement Unit was able to secure additional contractual benefit through Post Tender Negotiations for Lot 3 call off 1, by agreeing a 5 year warranty for those vehicles which is valued at £13,440.
- 6.3** This procurement exercise was conducted in accordance with the agreed Contract Strategy produced by the Corporate Procurement Unit in consultation with Fleet Services and the provisions of Contract Standing Orders, the Financial Regulations and relevant procurement legislation.

7. Risk Analysis

7.1 The successful suppliers have no known links to Serious and Organised Crime which would have significant political and reputational ramifications for the Council.

7.2 Should the Tendering Committee decide not to proceed as recommended then this will delay the project, may have financial implications and may result in a delay for the delivery of the fleet replacements.

8. Equalities Impact Assessment (EIA)

8.1 An equalities screening was undertaken to determine if there is an equalities impact. The results were that there is no equalities impact.

9. Consultation

9.1 Fleet Management Service, Finance and Legal Services have been consulted regarding the contents of this report.

10. Strategic Assessment

10.1 The service provided will contribute to delivery of the Council strategic priorities by supporting the provision of efficient and effective front line services that improve the everyday lives of residents.

Name: Angela Wilson

Designation: Strategic Director - Transformation & Public Sector Reform

Date: 12 September 2019

Person to Contact: Christina Fraser - Senior Procurement Officer, Corporate Procurement Unit, Council Offices, 16 Church Street, Dumbarton. Telephone: 01389 737857.
Email: Christina.fraser@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Rodney Thornton – Fleet and Waste Services Manager
1 Richmond Street, Clydebank,
Telephone: 01389 738731
Email: rodney.thornton@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

John Blake – Fleet Coordinator, 1 Richmond Street, Clydebank,
Telephone: 01389 738730
Email: john.blake@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Appendix: None

Background Papers: Report to IRED Committee
Contract Strategy

EIA Screening

Wards Affected:

All