

## **WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL**

### **Report by Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development**

**Tendering Committee: 17 December 2008**

---

**Subject: Tender for the Recycling/Recovery/Disposal of Waste from  
Household Waste Recycling Centres /Transfer Stations**

#### **1. Purpose**

- 1.1** To advise the Committee of tenders received for the Recycling & Recovery and Disposal of Waste from Household Waste Recycling Centres and Transfer Stations and to seek approval to accept the most economically advantageous tender.

#### **2. Background**

- 2.1** The former Scottish Executive developed a National Waste Plan which introduced a recycling target of 30% by 2008 which has recently been supplemented by the Scottish Government's Zero Waste Policy. West Dunbartonshire Council must now recycle 30% by 2008 (achieved), 40% by 2010, 50% by 2013 and 60% by 2020 through enhanced kerbside collections and optimising recycling in every area of its waste management activities.
- 2.2** In 2005 Members approved a tendering exercise for the reprocessing/recovery of the waste collected at the Council's civic amenity sites (Household Waste Recycling Centres). The awarding of the contract until 2008 permitted the segregation and recovery of around 2,000 tonnes of the projected 16,000 tonnes of waste which is managed at Household Waste Recycling Centres and Transfer Stations each year.
- 2.3** The remaining 14,000 tonnes of residual waste is physically treated by a series of trommels and shredders and approximately 5,000 tonnes of recycle per annum is recovered.
- 2.4** An advert inviting tenders was placed in OJEU on 6 June 2008 and in the Herald newspaper on 12 June 2008. Tender packs were issued to 17 companies which responded to the adverts.

### **3. Main Issues**

**3.1** On the closing date, valid tender returns were received from the following 6 companies:

- 1) Viridor Enviroscot, Bargeddie Recycling & Transfer Station, Langmuirway, Bargeddie, Glasgow, G69 7RW
- 2) W M Tracey Ltd, 49 Burnbrae Road, Limwood Industrial Estate, Paisley, PA3 3BD
- 3) Barr Environmental Ltd, Garlaff Farmhouse, Skares Road, Cumnock, KA18 2RB
- 4) Shanks Waste Management, Dunedin House, Auckland Park, Milton Keynes, MK1 1BU
- 5) J & M Murdoch, Crofthead Industrial Estate, Neilston, Glasgow G78 3NA
- 6) Enviro-Clean, Scotland, 8 Hawbank Road, College Milton North, East Kilbride, G74 5HA

**3.2** The above tenders were comprehensively evaluated using the following criteria:

1. Financial - 45%
2. Service - 35%
3. Quality - 14%
4. Administration - 6%

**3.3** Shanks Waste Management subsequently withdrew their tender during the evaluation period.

**3.4** The most competitive tender in terms of the award criteria detailed above was received from Barr Environmental Ltd - information at Appendix 1.

**3.5** The evaluation team comprised staff from the Corporate Procurement Unit and from Housing, Environmental and Economic Development.

**3.6** The tender details that the contract period will commence in October 2008 and end in October 2011 with the option to extend for a further two periods of 12 months each.

### **4. Personnel Issues**

**4.1** None.

## **5. Financial Implications**

- 5.1 The completed tender cost matrix is attached for information at Appendix 2
- 5.2 The tender cost will be met from existing Waste and Transport Services budgets

## **6. Risk Analysis**

- 6.1 Failure to award this contract is regarded as a contributory risk to meeting the Council's Landfill Allowance Scheme obligations and it's Single Outcome Agreement with the Scottish Government.

## **7. Conclusions**

- 7.1 The tendering process and evaluation methodology utilising the award criteria has successfully identified a contractor which can supply this service.

## **8. Recommendations**

- 8.1 The Committee is invited to approve the award of this contract to Barr Environmental Ltd as the most economically advantageous tender.

**Elaine Melrose**

**Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development**

**Date: 12 December 2008**

---

### **Persons to Contact:**

Angus Bodie, Manager  
Roads, Waste and Transport Services, Garshake Road  
Dumbarton G82 3PU  
Tel no. 01389 737598  
angus.bodie@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Rodney Thornton, Section Head,  
Waste and Transport Services, Richmond Street,  
Clydebank G81 1RF  
Tel. no. 01389 – 738731  
rodney.thornton@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

**Appendices:** Appendix 1 & Appendix 2  
**Background Paper:** None  
**Wards Affected:** All

## Appendix 1

### Award Criteria Summary Scores

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Supplier 1</b>	<b>Supplier 2</b>	<b>Supplier 3</b>	<b>Supplier 5</b>	<b>Supplier 6</b>
Financial <b>45%</b>	26.51	29.92	31.73	24.40	40.31
Quality <b>14%</b>	13.35	14.00	12.73	5.73	7.00
Service <b>35%</b>	31.78	29.77	29.37	31.76	26.55
Administration <b>6%</b>	4.91	4.91	4.91	4.36	2.18
<b>Total</b>	<b>78.57</b>	<b>80.60</b>	<b>80.85</b>	<b>67.90</b>	<b>78.73</b>

## Appendix 2

### Financial Element Cost Matrix

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Supplier 1</b>	<b>Supplier 2</b>	<b>Supplier 3</b>	<b>Supplier 5</b>	<b>Supplier 6</b>
Commercial Summary (Score)	21.51	25.92	27.84	20.03	40.00
Landfill Tax element	<b>£262,400</b>	<b>£262,400</b>	<b>£262,400</b>	<b>£262,400</b>	<b>£205,440</b>
Service Cost (£)	<b>£1,005,727.50</b>	<b>£834,782.50</b>	<b>£777,037.50</b>	<b>£1,080,150</b>	<b>£540,000</b>