

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
01 General	<p>1. Inserting a new paragraph after paragraph 2 on page 54 to read: “Local Development Plan 2 also fully aligns with Scotland’s National Marine Plan (2015) and the emerging Regional Marine Plan for Clyde Marine Region. Any proposals for planning within the Marine Plan area must be in accordance with Scotland’s National Marine Plan (2015) and the emerging Regional Plan once adopted, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.”</p> <p>2. Inserting an additional criterion at the end of Policy WD1 to read: “e) Development proposals with a marine component or implication (such as marinas, ports, harbours, shipbuilding, marine tourism and recreation, fish farming etc) will be determined in accordance with Scotland’s National Marine Plan and the emerging Regional Marine Plan for Clyde Marine Region (once adopted) unless relevant considerations, including the criteria detailed above and all other relevant policies of this local development plan, indicate otherwise.”</p>	5	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification made by the Reporter to state that the Plan aligns with the National Marine Plan and emerging Regional Marine Plan and that any applications within the Marine Area need to accord with the documents.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that development proposals are in accordance with the documents referenced unless other considerations indicate otherwise.</p>
02 Introduction and Spatial Strategy	<p>1. Adding the following sentence at the end of the first paragraph on page 6: “It also contains part of the internationally important Inner Clyde Special Protection Area, designated for redshank.”</p> <p>2. Inserting new paragraphs after paragraph 7 on page 6 to read: “Climate Change The effects of climate change are well documented and it is clear that Local Development Plan 2 has a key role to play in addressing its causes (mitigation) and dealing with its effects (adaptation). Whilst there</p>	13	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify the Special Protection Area is within the Council area and what it is important for.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify how the plan will address climate change.</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>is no chapter within the plan specifically covering this subject, climate change issues are embedded in all aspects of the plan.</p> <p>Mitigation The Plan seeks to ensure that everyone has access to new quality homes and employment opportunities but, as a consequence, new development required to achieve these goals will result in increased carbon emissions. Local Development Plan 2 mitigates against this by ensuring that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• new developments are within sustainable locations and easily accessible to public transport to reduce the use of the private car;</li> <li>• the layout, design and construction of new buildings are of a high quality, sustainable and suited to the climate and location and provide sustainable design which reduces carbon emissions in the developments' construction and end use;</li> <li>• buildings are energy efficient and that low and zero carbon technologies are installed wherever appropriate;</li> <li>• a green infrastructure first approach to development is undertaken;</li> <li>• carbon rich soils and peatland are protected from inappropriate development due to their importance as carbon sinks; and</li> <li>• renewable energy, including heat and electricity from renewable sources is achieved in line with national climate change targets whilst giving due consideration to environmental, community and cumulative impacts.</li> </ul> <p>Adaptation In tandem with reducing our greenhouse gas emissions, it also must be</p>		

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>ensured that the effects of climate change are dealt with. Particular attention must be given to the threats of flooding, and in this regard Local Development Plan 2 ensures, as far as possible, that development in areas of flood risk is avoided or, where this is not possible, that potential flooding issues are flagged up at an early stage so that they can be addressed by the development industry. All development is required to demonstrate sustainable drainage solutions.</p> <p>The plan also embeds a green infrastructure first approach for the design of new developments and has strong green network and green infrastructure policies. These policies are seen as being an important part of the plan's mitigation against, and adapting to the threats faced by, climate change."</p>		
03 Queens Quay, Clydebank	<p>1. Deleting the third sentence from the seventh paragraph of the Queens Quay supporting text and substituting the following sentence: 'Development which could harm an internationally important site will only be approved in the circumstances detailed in Policy ENV1 Nature Conservation.'</p> <p>2. Adding a fifth bullet point to the Development Strategy, as follows: 'To ensure no adverse effect on the integrity of the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area (SPA) or on the objectives of designation and the overall integrity of the Inner Clyde Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI).'</p> <p>Deleting the full stop at the end of the fourth bullet point and replacing it with '; and'.</p> <p>3. Adding a new third paragraph to proposed Queens Quay Policy 2,</p>	19	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify that Policy ENV 1 would need to be satisfied where there would be harm to the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there is no adverse impact on the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that the amenity of new residential development would not be</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>as follows:            'In order to ensure compliance with Policy H4, proposed housing development will not be supported if the council considers that existing, authorised uses are likely to have an unacceptable impact on the amenity of future residents.'</p> <p>4. Adding a new fourth paragraph to proposed Queens Quay Policy 2, as follows:            'Development proposals are required to ensure that the necessary infrastructure is in place to allow public transport to be accessed from the site and to ensure that bus services can be operated on Cable Depot Road in the future.'</p>		<p>adversely impacted upon by existing development.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure public transport infrastructure is in place.</p>
04 City Deal Site – Esso Bowling and Scott's Yard	<p><u>Introductory Text</u></p> <p>1. Deleting the third sentence of the fifth paragraph on page 20 and substituting the following sentence:            'Development which could adversely affect the integrity of an internationally important site will only be approved in the circumstances detailed in Policy ENV1 Nature Conservation.'</p> <p>2. Adding a final paragraph to the supporting text on page 20 of the proposed plan, as follows:            'A water and drainage impact assessment is required for the site. Early contact with Scottish Water is required in relation to this assessment and any potential impacts on Scottish Water's network.'</p> <p><u>Development Strategy</u></p> <p>3. Deleting the third bullet point of the proposed development strategy</p>	50	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify that Policy ENV 1 would need to be satisfied where there would be harm to the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to meet with the requirements of Scottish Water for the site.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>and substituting the following wording:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'To use the development of the sites to enhance the green network and access links and for the proposals to reflect the distinctive landscape and visual characteristics and qualities of the site, including Dunglass Castle and the Henry Bell Obelisk Memorial.'</li> </ul> <p>4. Deleting the fifth bullet point of the proposed development strategy and substituting the following wording:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'To ensure no adverse effect on the integrity of the Special Protection Area (SPA) or on the objectives of designation and the overall integrity of the Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI).'</li> </ul> <p><u>Development Strategy Map</u></p> <p>5. Revise the notation so that it is clear where the opportunity for green network enhancement coincides with a designation of land as green belt.</p> <p>6. Deleting from the development strategy map the opportunity for green network enhancement that overlays the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area.</p> <p>7. Extending the existing green belt designation in the western part of the area situated between the railway line and the indicative access route on the development strategy map to cover this entire area and making a commensurate modification to the Dumbarton Proposals Map.</p> <p>8. Identifying the land shown on the revised development strategy map prepared by the council on 20 December 2019 which is situated</p>		<p>the Reporter to clarify the role that the site can make to the green infrastructure.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there is no adverse impact on the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to provide clarity to the map.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to provide clarity to the map.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to provide clarity to the map to the extent of the greenbelt on the site.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>between the southern boundary of employment site E1(16) and the River Clyde to the west of Dunglass Castle and between the western boundary of employment site E1(16) and the Special Protection Area as an area for green network enhancement.</p> <p>9. Identifying the area of land around Dunglass Castle and the Henry Bell Obelisk Memorial shown on the revised development strategy map prepared by the council on 20 December 2019 as a green network enhancement opportunity.</p> <p>10. Reducing the size of employment site E1(16) in the area between Dunglass Castle and Scott's Yard to create an area for green network enhancement along the River Clyde, as shown on the revised development strategy map prepared by the council on 20 December 2019.</p> <p><u>Esso Bowling Policy 1</u></p> <p>11. Adding two additional sentences to the second paragraph of Esso Bowling Policy 1 to read as follows: 'The masterplan should be informed by the Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment (LVIA) that has been carried out for the site. The LVIA must also be provided alongside any planning application for the site.'</p> <p><u>Esso Bowling Policy 2</u></p> <p>12. Deleting the third bullet point of proposed Esso Bowling Policy 2 and substituting the following sentence:</p>		<p>green network enhancements are taken around the foreshore.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that the setting of these assets are protected.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that green network enhancements are taken around the foreshore.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure the masterplan considers Landscape and Visual Impacts.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure public</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>'Provision of bus stops and associated infrastructure to encourage public transport provisions within the site, subject to discussion with SPT and bus operators.'</p> <p>13. Adding a new third paragraph to proposed Esso Bowling Policy 2 to read as follows: 'Recreational access routes on the site must be designed to take account of potential health and security and safety issues arising from future land uses, in order to avoid risks to the public and conflict with approved uses. This may have the effect of limiting public access to some areas within the proposed green network.'</p> <p>14. Adding a new final paragraph to proposed Esso Bowling Policy 2 to read as follows: 'Early engagement with Network Rail is essential to ensure that proposals to provide pedestrian and vehicular access to the site protect rail assets and do not compromise rail service delivery.'</p> <p><u>Esso Bowling Policy 3</u></p> <p>15. Deleting the first paragraph of proposed Esso Bowling Policy 3 and substituting the following paragraph: 'The council requires proposals for the site to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• deliver a designed waterfront edge that demonstrates successful integration of proposals within the landscape, provides appropriate recreational access and frames key views;</li> <li>• ensure that enhancements reflect and help to strengthen the biodiversity value of the site;</li> <li>• retain significant trees and woodland to safeguard the landscape</li> </ul>		<p>transport infrastructure is in place.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that health and safety issues, as well as, security issues are taken into account.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that early engagement with Network Rail is undertaken to avoid any impacts on the railway.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to specify what Green Network and Green Infrastructure enhancements require to take place throughout the site especially at the waterfront.</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>character of the site and protect the residential amenity of site neighbours;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• plant trees to reinforce the existing landscape pattern and help to mitigate the impacts of development;</li> <li>• provide a high-quality landscape within the built development area that integrates with the natural environment of the site;</li> <li>• take account of external views into the site, including from the River Clyde and from the south side of the river;</li> <li>• take account of views to Dunglass Castle and the Henry Bell Obelisk Memorial;</li> <li>• ensure any flood defences are designed to complement landscape character; and</li> <li>• design recreational access to take account of potential health and safety and security issues arising from future land uses in order to avoid risks to the public and conflict with approved uses.</li> </ul> <p><u>Scott's Yard Policy 1</u></p> <p>16. Deleting the second paragraph of Scott's Yard Policy 1 and substituting the following paragraph:  'A comprehensive masterplan for the development of the site is required to be submitted as part of any planning application for the site. The masterplan should be informed by the Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment (LVIA) that has been carried out for the site. The LVIA must also be provided alongside any planning application for the site.'</p>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure the masterplan considers Landscape and Visual Impacts.</p>
05 Carless, Old	1. Deleting the final sentence of the proposed fifth paragraph of the	84	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
Kilpatrick	<p>supporting text on page 24 and substituting a new sentence, to read as follows:            'Development which could adversely affect the integrity of an internationally important site will only be approved in the exceptional circumstances detailed within Policy ENV1 Nature Conservation.'</p> <p>2. Inserting a new sixth paragraph on page 24 to read as follows:            'A water and drainage impact assessment will be required to support the proposed development of the site. Early contact with Scottish Water is required in relation to the assessment and any potential impacts on the water environment.'</p> <p>3. Deleting the first bullet point of the development strategy and substituting the following wording:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'To remediate the Carless site to enable redevelopment for business and industrial uses, appropriate commercial uses and, where appropriate and justified, housing and day-to-day convenience retail uses;'</li> </ul> <p>4. Deleting the second bullet point of the development strategy and substituting the following wording:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'To provide a secondary access point to the site where residential development is proposed on site H2(33) Carless and to upgrade the existing access to serve the business and industrial and mixed-use areas of the site;'</li> </ul> <p>5. Deleting the fifth bullet point of the development strategy and substituting the following wording:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'To ensure no adverse effect on the integrity of the Special</li> </ul>		<p>the Reporter to clarify that Policy ENV 1 would need to be satisfied where there would be harm to the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to meet the requirements of Scottish Water for a water and drainage strategy to be provided.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify that the site needs to be remediated for the acceptable types of development on the site.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify what the secondary access is for and the existing access needs to be upgraded for the uses specified.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>Protection Area (SPA) or on the objectives of designation and the overall integrity of the Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI).'</p> <p>6. a) Deleting the green network enhancement allocation on the Carless Development Strategy Map from that part of the site which adjoins the deep-water jetties on the River Clyde within the phase 1 site boundary for the approved fabrication building (council reference DC/19/046). Additionally, showing this area, including the associated phase 1 route access, as an extension of the E1(17) business and industry opportunity site.</p> <p>b) If the scale allows this to be done clearly, making a commensurate change on the Clydebank proposals map.</p> <p>7. a) Extending the red line which defines the site boundary on the development strategy map to include the area to the south-east of the H2(33) Carless housing site located between the canal and disused railway to the point in the south-east corner of the map where the existing scheduled ancient monument designation and local nature conservation site designation converge.</p> <p>b) Showing this area as open space and a green network enhancement opportunity.</p> <p>c) Making a commensurate change to the site boundary on the Clydebank proposals map.</p> <p>8. Deleting criterion c) of proposed Carless Policy 2 and substituting the following wording:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'There is no adverse effect on the integrity of the Special Protection Area (SPA) or on the objectives of designation and the overall integrity of the Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI).'</li> </ul>		<p>the Reporter to ensure that there is no adverse impact on the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to reflect the Planning Consent boundaries of the site.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that an area of the site under the ownership of the landowner is included within the Carless boundary and to safeguard the area for open space provision.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there is no adverse impact on</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>9. Adding a second paragraph to proposed Carless Policy 2 Mixed Use Development, as follows:  'A masterplan is required to be prepared in advance of any individual development proposals for the mixed-use area shown on the development strategy map, taking into account the requirements of the housing development opportunity and new access proposed in relation to site H2(33). The masterplan should be submitted as part of any planning application for these sites and development proposals should be in accordance with the masterplan agreed by the council.'</p> <p>10. Deleting the first sentence of proposed Carless Policy 3 Residential Development and substituting the following sentence:  'Proposals for residential development will be restricted to the area identified on the Development Strategy Map as Site H2(33) and will only be supported where they meet all of the following criteria.'</p> <p>11. Deleting the second paragraph of proposed Carless Policy 3 Residential Development and substituting the following paragraph:  'The capacity of residential development on the site should take account of the site's topography, landscape capacity and characteristics, visual amenity, infrastructure and green network enhancement requirements and be in accordance with policies CP1, CP2 and ENV2.'</p> <p>12. Delete proposed Carless Policy 4 Green Network and Green Infrastructure and substitute the following three paragraphs:  'As the site is identified as a strategic opportunity for the enhancement of the Glasgow and Clyde Valley Green Network, development of the site is required to deliver habitat, access, green and open space</p>		<p>the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure the proper long-term planning of the site through a Masterplan process.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to make reference to the site reference number.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify that Policy ENV 2 is also applicable any housing proposals.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to specify what Green Network and Green</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>enhancements, as identified on the development strategy map. This will entail the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Protecting and enhancing the disused railway corridor;</li> <li>• Retaining natural screening of the site along the River Clyde and the Forth and Clyde Canal but, where appropriate, removing some trees and vegetation to provide views of the river from the national cycle network;</li> <li>• Taking account of views to the site from the opposite bank of the River Clyde;</li> <li>• Integrating and protecting the natural environment by retaining, where appropriate, natural species, habitats and mature trees within the site;</li> <li>• Upgrading existing open space, including mitigating the effect of the proposed road link on the open space adjoining Dumbarton Road, and providing new green spaces within the site;</li> <li>• Providing paths between the mixed use and residential sites and linking the canal towpath, disused railway line, river and existing paths outwith the site.</li> <li>• Providing enhancements to the green network and access for recreation along the canal and former railway line, the western and eastern parts of the site and the waterfront.</li> <li>• Designing the green network and spaces to reflect and enhance the distinctive landscape characteristics and visual amenity of the site.</li> <li>• Designing recreational access to take account of potential health and safety and security issues arising from future land uses in order to avoid risks to the public and conflict with approved uses.</li> </ul>		<p>Infrastructure enhancements require to take place and what other plans and assessments the developer requires to provide</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>Masterplanning and development of the site should be informed by a Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment. This assessment should be provided at the planning application stage alongside other relevant information such as, but not limited to, a landscape strategy and design and access statement.</p> <p>Prior to remediation or development of the site, temporary uses which enhance the green network value of the site will be supported and encouraged, as will advance greening of the site in accordance with Policy ENV7, until the site is developed fully.'</p>		
06 Dumbarton Town Centre and Waterfront	<p>1. Deleting paragraphs five and six on page 28 of the proposed plan, under the heading 'Dumbarton Town Centre and Waterfront', and replacing them with the following paragraphs: 'Development at Dumbarton Town Centre and Waterfront must not have an adverse effect on the Endrick Water Special Area of Conservation (SAC) for which Atlantic salmon, brook lamprey and river lamprey are the qualifying interests, nor on the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area (SPA) for which redshank are the qualifying interest. Proposals for development must be accompanied by an expert assessment to inform a project-level Habitats Regulations Appraisal (HRA). This may require a study of redshank behaviour in the affected area of the SPA, which is likely to involve survey over at least one overwintering season. Account should be taken of the HRA of this Proposed Plan, including measures potentially required to address disturbance both during construction and operation of the development.'</p> <p>2. Deleting the final sentence of proposed paragraph seven on page 28 and replacing it with a new sentence, to read as follows: 'Development which could harm an internationally important site will</p>	99	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there are no adverse impacts on the SPA and SAC.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify that Policy ENV 1 would need to be</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>only be approved in the exceptional circumstances detailed within Policy ENV1 Nature Conservation.'</p> <p>3. Adding a tenth bullet point to the Development Strategy on page 28, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'Protecting and enhancing natural heritage and ensuring no adverse effect on the integrity of the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area (SPA), the Endrick Water Special Area of Conservation (SAC) or on the objectives of designation and the overall integrity of the Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI).'</li> </ul> <p>4. Deleting the third sentence of paragraph one of Dumbarton Policy 5 Sandpoint Marina and substituting the following wording: 'Any development of the site should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• provide high quality design, layout and materials to reflect the close proximity of the site to Dumbarton Castle and Rock and Levensgrove Park;</li> <li>• provide a waterfront path; and</li> <li>• ensure there is no adverse effect on any Natura site.'</li> </ul> <p>5. Deleting Dumbarton Policy 6 and the preceding paragraph and substituting the following text:</p> <p>'Dumbarton Waterfront Path Following the Dumbarton Castle and Rock Charrette, Planning Guidance on the Dumbarton Waterfront Path was adopted in 2016. This details the approach to its delivery, including the required financial contributions from landowners/developers to enable the construction of</p>		<p>satisfied where there would be harm to the SPA and SAC.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there are no adverse impacts on the SPA and SAC.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to specify what the development of the site is required to take account of.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to change the name of the Guidance from Supplementary to Non – Statutory Planning Guidance as</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>the Waterfront Path. This should be taken into account by landowners and developers.</p> <p>Dumbarton Policy 6 Dumbarton Waterfront Path: Development Contributions The council will support the development of a continuous Waterfront Path leading from the town centre to Dumbarton Castle. Developer contributions will be sought from landowners/developers to enable the delivery of the path in line with the Dumbarton Waterfront Path Planning Guidance. Where developers wish to deliver the path as part of their development proposals they will be required to demonstrate to the council that this is the best way of delivering the path overall and will be required to comply with the specification and procedures set out in the Dumbarton Waterfront Path Planning Guidance. Proposals for development must not have an adverse effect on the integrity of any Natura site.'</p> <p>6. Revising the conservation area boundary on the Dumbarton Town Centre and Waterfront map to reflect the boundary approved by the Council on 11 October 2019 and adjusting the notation accordingly.</p> <p>7. Showing the sites at Dumbarton Football Club's Castle Road stadium which were granted permission for residential development by planning permission DC16/035 as consented residential development on the Dumbarton Town Centre and Waterfront map.</p>		<p>it currently is. Consequential change was also needed to advise that the guidance was revised in 2019.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> As above, making the same change to reflect that the guidance is Planning Guidance. Text of Dumbarton Policy 6 remains the same.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that the Plan shows the approved boundary.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure consented sites are allocated on the map.</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	8. Deleting proposed Dumbarton Proposal 2 Dumbarton Town Centre Conservation Area and substituting the following wording: 'The council will explore the possibility of developing a funding bid to Historic Environment Scotland for a Conservation Area Regeneration Scheme (CARS) to enhance, restore and regenerate key features within the new conservation area.'		<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to as the proposal was no longer required due to the Conservation Area now being approved but to keep the remainder of the proposal with regards to funding opportunities.
07 Clydebank Town Centre	1. Deleting the third sentence of the first paragraph of the preamble to Clydebank Policy 3 and substituting the following sentence: 'The sites are key to improving placemaking within the town centre and provide opportunities to improve the area in terms of design and vibrancy, as well as providing an active frontage to the canal and recognising the importance of those boundaries fronting onto the main town centre road network.'	108	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify that development proposal should front onto the canal and streets.
08 Alexandria Town Centre	1. Rewording the fourth sentence of paragraph four on page 38 to read as follows: 'These streets and the parking to the rear of properties on the west side of Main Street would benefit from a range of public realm improvements including new and improved paving, lighting, planting, signage and street furniture.'	112	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to make reference to Main Street.
09 Bowling Basin	1. Deleting the final sentence of the proposed fifth paragraph of the supporting text on page 40 and substituting a new sentence, to read as follows: 'Development which could harm an internationally important site will only be approved in the exceptional circumstances detailed within Policy ENV1 Nature Conservation.'	121	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify that Policy ENV 1 would need to be satisfied where there would be harm to the SPA.

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>2. Adding a third bullet point to Bowling Basin Policy 1, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'to avoid any adverse effect on the integrity of the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area (SPA) or on the objectives of designation and the overall integrity of the Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI).'</li> </ul> <p>Deleting the word 'and' from the end of the second bullet point and adding the word 'and' at the end of the third bullet point.</p> <p>3. Revising the Bowling Basin strategy map on page 41 of the proposed plan to show the mixed-use opportunity as represented on the drawing which accompanied Scottish Canals' representation on the local development plan (PLDP/786/9).</p> <p>4. Adding an additional paragraph to Bowling Basin Policy 1 to read as follows: 'The council will also support future proposals for the redevelopment of the Outer Harbour for related and compatible uses, such as additional moorings, a marina and associated facilities, further to establish Bowling Basin as a tourist destination and also to help regenerate the River Clyde Waterfront in conjunction with future development at Scott's Yard and the Esso City Deal site.'</p>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there are no adverse impacts on the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to make sure the Map accords with the Planning Consent.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to specify what types of development will be considered appropriate within the Outer Harbour.</p>
10 Lomondgate Business Park	<p>1. Showing Lomondgate Business Park (site E1(5)) as a mixed-use opportunity on the Dumbarton proposals map rather than an industrial/business opportunity.</p> <p>2. Deleting the fourth bullet point of Lomondgate Policy 1 Lomondgate Business Park and substituting the following wording:</p>	129	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure the Development Strategy Map and Proposals Map reflect each other.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that the</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'Landscaping is required to help strengthen the local landscape character and green network within and through the site. The masterplan must demonstrate that the proposed development will integrate successfully within the landscape. The masterplan must also provide details of the massing, scale, finished materials and colours of the proposed development, which must not have an adverse impact on the wider landscape character of the area; and'</li> </ul> <p>Deleting the word 'and' from the end of the existing third bullet point.</p> <p>3. Adding an additional fifth bullet point to Lomondgate Policy 1 Lomondgate Business Park, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'Proposals are required to incorporate access and route improvements and active travel connections in order to maximise access to employment opportunities in the business park, including a demonstration of how these integrate and connect with the wider road and path networks in the surrounding area and to existing public transport stops.'</li> </ul> <p>4. Deleting the existing wording of Lomondgate Policy 2 Roadside Services Area and substituting the following sentence: 'Development of further tourist related facilities and Class 3 (food and drink) uses will be supported by the council within the site where they do not have an adverse impact on the vitality and viability of Alexandria and Dumbarton town centres.'</p>		<p>masterplan and proposed development integrates with the landscape.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that active travel, infrastructure and connections are provided.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there are also no adverse impacts on Alexandria Town Centre.</p>
11 Vale of Leven Industrial Estate	<p>1. Deleting the first sentence of Vale of Leven Industrial Estate Policy 1 and substituting the following two sentences: 'Class 5 and 6 employment uses within the Vale of Leven Industrial Estate will be supported, except in locations where the council considers</p>	138	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that residential amenity is not affected by business and</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	proposed development would detract to an unacceptable degree from the residential amenity of adjoining housing areas. In these locations, only Class 4 business use will be supported.'		industrial and storage and distribution uses.
12 Our Key Assets	<p>1. Amending the third paragraph of page 54 to read:            "Proposals for development which promote recreational access on or adjacent to the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area (SPA), for which redshank are the qualifying interest, and/or including the River Leven which is a tributary to the Endrick Water Special Area for Conservation (SAC), where Atlantic salmon, brook lamprey and river lamprey are the qualifying interest, must not have an adverse effect on any Natura Site. Proposals for development must be accompanied by an expert assessment to inform a project-level Habitats Regulations Appraisal (HRA)."</p> <p>2. Amending criterion (c) of Policy WD1 to read:            "Access to and along the water's edge shall be provided, protected or enhanced where appropriate. Public access to the water's edge should normally be facilitated, except where restrictions may be required for reasons of public safety, to protect the qualifying interests of statutory ecological designations or to avoid land use conflicts. Development proposals which restrict access to the water's edge should demonstrate a specific locational need for the proposal and provide sufficient justification for the restrictions in environmental and amenity terms".</p> <p>3. Amending the first sentence of the second paragraph on page 58 to read:            "The 'Our Green Network' planning guidance (2015) identifies the principal green network assets in West Dunbartonshire and specific opportunities for improvements."</p>	149	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that river lamprey is covered by the text and some minor other re-wording.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to allow restrictions to the water front to be put in place under certain stated circumstances.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to refer to the current planning guidance which set out what the assets are and opportunities for improvements.</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>4. Amending the map on page 61 to (a) show the existing open space network and the strategic green network projects in clearly different shades of green, and (b) include the symbols used for the various green network projects and cross-boundary access opportunities in the map key.</p> <p>5. Adding the following new sentence after the existing first sentence of the third paragraph of supporting text on page 64:  “Scottish Canals and Historic Environment Scotland should be consulted at an early stage in any planning proposals which may affect the Forth and Clyde Canal and also when a planning application is lodged.”</p> <p>6. Inserting a new second paragraph within Policy FCC1 as follows:  “Where development and/or works affect the Canal, they will be required to accord with Scottish Canal's Third Party Works procedures.”</p>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to aid comprehension of the map.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure the relevant bodies are contacted.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to set out Scottish Canal's requirements.</p>
13 Communities and Place	<p>1. Replacing the final sentence of the fourth paragraph on page 68 with the following:  “This approach will give our communities a strong voice in how their area can be enhanced and will be prepared jointly by the council and communities for defined neighbourhoods within West Dunbartonshire following the guidance set out in the National Standards for Community Engagement and in accordance with the Council's Engaging Communities Toolkit.”</p> <p>2. Amending the first line of the Policy Framework on page 69 to read:</p>	156	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to make reference to the National Standards and Council Guidance on community engagement.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>“The council will adopt Locality Place Plan(s) ...” [continue as in Proposed Plan]</p> <p>3. Amending criterion (f) of the Policy Framework on page 69 to read: “The Locality Place Plan has been subject to significant and wide-ranging engagement and consultation with different ages, groups and individuals within that community or communities including landowners and developers with interests in the area.”</p> <p>4. Adding a further note at the end of Policy LPP1 to read: “The council may publish further guidance on how this policy should apply to local place plans as provided for in the Planning (Scotland) Act 2019.”</p>		<p>the Reporter to state that it will be the Council rather than the LDP that will adopt these documents.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that landowners and developers within an area have an opportunity to be involved in these documents.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to allow the Council to provide further guidance when the provisions of the Planning Act 2019, through secondary legislation and guidance, on this subject are available.</p>
14 Creating Places	Add a new sentence at the end of Policy CP3 as follows: “Schedule 1 of the Plan details the type and status of the detailed spatial design guidance that has been prepared/is being prepared for key regeneration sites as contained within the Delivering our Places section of the plan.”	162	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to make reference to Schedule 1.
15 Housing Land	1. Adding an additional sentence at the end of the first paragraph of the ‘Meeting Housing Land Requirements’ section on page 76, to read:	195	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to update the

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments																																
	<p>“For the purposes of this plan, these figures have been extrapolated to 2030.”</p> <p>2. Replacing Table 1 as follows:</p> <table border="1"> <caption>Table 1: Housing Land Requirement 2012-2024</caption> <tr> <th></th><th>Private</th><th>Social Rented</th><th>All Tenure</th></tr> <tr> <td>A Housing Supply Target (2012-2024)</td><td>1,800</td><td>960</td><td>2,760</td></tr> <tr> <td>B Housing Land Requirement (2012-2024)</td><td>2,070</td><td>1,100</td><td>3,170</td></tr> <tr> <td>C Completions from 2012-2019</td><td>885</td><td>278</td><td>1,163</td></tr> <tr> <td>D Housing Supply Target 2019 – 2024 (A-C)</td><td>915</td><td>682</td><td>1,597</td></tr> <tr> <td>E Housing Land Requirement 2019 – 2024 (D + 15%)</td><td>1,052</td><td>785</td><td>1,837</td></tr> <tr> <td>F Supply 2019-2024</td><td>1,137</td><td>934</td><td>2,071</td></tr> <tr> <td>G SURPLUS 2017-2024 (F-E)</td><td>85</td><td>149</td><td>234</td></tr> </table> <p>3. Deleting the final paragraph on page 76.</p>		Private	Social Rented	All Tenure	A Housing Supply Target (2012-2024)	1,800	960	2,760	B Housing Land Requirement (2012-2024)	2,070	1,100	3,170	C Completions from 2012-2019	885	278	1,163	D Housing Supply Target 2019 – 2024 (A-C)	915	682	1,597	E Housing Land Requirement 2019 – 2024 (D + 15%)	1,052	785	1,837	F Supply 2019-2024	1,137	934	2,071	G SURPLUS 2017-2024 (F-E)	85	149	234		<p>tables in light of the housing land figures based on the agreed 2019 Housing Land Audit.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to reflect changes made to the housing land supply tables which take into account past completions etc so there is no requirement of this paragraph anymore.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by</p>
	Private	Social Rented	All Tenure																																
A Housing Supply Target (2012-2024)	1,800	960	2,760																																
B Housing Land Requirement (2012-2024)	2,070	1,100	3,170																																
C Completions from 2012-2019	885	278	1,163																																
D Housing Supply Target 2019 – 2024 (A-C)	915	682	1,597																																
E Housing Land Requirement 2019 – 2024 (D + 15%)	1,052	785	1,837																																
F Supply 2019-2024	1,137	934	2,071																																
G SURPLUS 2017-2024 (F-E)	85	149	234																																

## Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments																												
	<p>4. Replacing the first paragraph on page 77 with:            "Taking account of completions between 2012 and 2019, the adjusted housing land requirement for 2019 to 2024 is 1,837. Compared with the Housing Land Audit 2019, largely agreed by Homes for Scotland, and other sources of supply, there remains a surplus in the housing land supply over the housing land requirement, which equates to around 234 units to 2024."</p> <p>5. Replacing table 2 as follows:</p> <table border="1"> <caption>Table 2: Housing Land Requirement 2024 - 2030</caption> <tr> <th></th><th>Private</th><th>Social Rented</th><th>All Tenure</th></tr> <tr> <td>A Housing Supply Target (2024 - 2030)</td><td>900</td><td>480</td><td>1,380</td></tr> <tr> <td>B Housing Land Requirement (2024 - 2030) (A x 15%)</td><td>1,035</td><td>552</td><td>1,587</td></tr> <tr> <td>C Surplus from 2017 - 2024</td><td>+85</td><td>+149</td><td>+234</td></tr> <tr> <td>D Supply 2024 -2030</td><td>1,756</td><td>235</td><td>1,991</td></tr> <tr> <td>E Total Supply (C+D)</td><td>1,841</td><td>384</td><td>2,225</td></tr> <tr> <td>G Surplus 2024 – 2029 (E-B)</td><td>+806</td><td>-168</td><td>+638</td></tr> </table> <p>6. Amending the second and third paragraphs on page 77 to read:            "Table 2 above sets out the land supply position over the plan period from 2024 to 2030. The Housing Land Requirement for this period will be met by carrying over the surplus from the 2019-24 period and from additional land from the established supply and windfall sites. The post-</p>		Private	Social Rented	All Tenure	A Housing Supply Target (2024 - 2030)	900	480	1,380	B Housing Land Requirement (2024 - 2030) (A x 15%)	1,035	552	1,587	C Surplus from 2017 - 2024	+85	+149	+234	D Supply 2024 -2030	1,756	235	1,991	E Total Supply (C+D)	1,841	384	2,225	G Surplus 2024 – 2029 (E-B)	+806	-168	+638		<p>the Reporter to reflect the up-to-date information contained within the agreed Housing Land Audit 2019</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to update the housing land figures in this table.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to provide clarity on the housing land supply of the Plan and how it is calculated. It is also to note that there is a short-term but significant shortfall in the</p>
	Private	Social Rented	All Tenure																												
A Housing Supply Target (2024 - 2030)	900	480	1,380																												
B Housing Land Requirement (2024 - 2030) (A x 15%)	1,035	552	1,587																												
C Surplus from 2017 - 2024	+85	+149	+234																												
D Supply 2024 -2030	1,756	235	1,991																												
E Total Supply (C+D)	1,841	384	2,225																												
G Surplus 2024 – 2029 (E-B)	+806	-168	+638																												

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>2024 land supply in the 2019 Housing Land Audit indicates a significant amount of land in the private sector. It has been assumed less than a third of this land will produce completions in the 2024-30 period. In terms of social rented sites, which tend not to be identified so far in advance as those for the private sector, the sites in the established land supply have been augmented by some longer-term proposals identified in the Strategic Housing Investment Programme.</p> <p>The existing housing land supply offers a generous supply of land for housing across West Dunbartonshire when compared to both the private and the social rented housing land requirement for the first five years of the land and beyond to 2030. However, Clydeplan also sets individual requirements for the Dumbarton/ Vale of Leven housing market area and the Greater Glasgow North and West housing sub-market area (which includes Clydebank). At the time of adoption, a significant short-term shortfall was evident in the private housing land supply in the Clydebank area.”</p> <p>7. Deleting the words “although not needing to identify any additional land allocations for housing” from the third sentence of the fourth paragraph on page 77.</p> <p>8. Rewording Policy H1 to read:  “A five year effective supply of housing land will be maintained at all times across the local authority area (all-tenure and private housing)</p>		<p>housing land requirements for private sector housing in Clydebank.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to state that sufficient land allocations are made within the plan and therefore this sentence is no longer required.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that the housing land requirement of the</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>and each housing market/ sub-market area (private housing) throughout the lifetime of the plan to enable delivery of the strategic housing requirement. This will be monitored and updated annually through the housing land audit.</p> <p>The council will prioritise the timely delivery of sites within the established land supply. If the audit identifies a shortfall in the five year effective housing land supply, the council will support housing proposals which:" [continue as in Proposed Plan]</p>		<p>Plan is delivered and that a five year effective land supply is maintained at all times.</p>
<p>16 Revitalising our Economy and Achieving Zero Waste</p>	<p>1. Replacing the third paragraph on page 81 with:            "Development within the Hospital Campus or within the Clydebank Riverside Strategic Economic Investment Location must not have an adverse effect on the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area (SPA) for which redshank are the qualifying interest. Proposals for development must be accompanied by an expert assessment to inform a project-level Habitats Regulations Appraisal (HRA). This may require a study of redshank behaviour in the affected area of the SPA, which is likely to involve survey over at least one overwintering season. Account should also be taken of the HRA of this plan, including measures potentially required to address disturbance both during construction and operation of the development".</p> <p>2. Amending Policy E6 to read:            "The development of new and existing tourist facilities will be supported and encouraged throughout the council area where there would be no adverse effect on the integrity of a Natura 2000 site and they avoid adverse impacts on the green network and built heritage and are in</p>	<p>208</p>	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there is no adverse impact on the SPA.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there is no adverse impacts on the build and natural environment.</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	<p>accordance with other relevant policies within the plan.”</p> <p>3. Adding a new paragraph after the second paragraph on page 83 to read: “Development which is proposed within the 51dB LAeq aircraft noise contour associated with the airport is required to be accompanied by an initial noise risk assessment and the preparation of an acoustic design statement.”</p> <p>4. Replacing the noise contours shown on the upper map on page 83 with those shown for 51, 54 and 57dB LAeq in the noise contour map contained within the draft Glasgow Airport Noise Action Plan.</p> <p>5. Including “**” after the words ‘Clydebank Industrial Estate’ within Schedule 4, so that the second note to this schedule applies to this site.</p> <p>6. Amending the first paragraph of the second note to Schedule 4 to read: “Development at Clydebank Industrial Estate and Cable Depot Road must not have an adverse effect on the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area (SPA) for which redshank are the qualifying interest. Proposals for development must be accompanied by an expert assessment to inform a project-level Habitats Regulations Appraisal (HRA). This may require a study of redshank behaviour in the affected area of the SPA, which is likely to involve survey over at least one overwintering season. Account should also be taken of the HRA of this plan, including measures potentially required to address disturbance both during construction and</p>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that these relevant documents are submitted where developments are within the flight paths of Glasgow Airport.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to recently released noise contour maps.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to have the same requirements in relation to the SPA attached to this site.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter is to slightly amend the text in relation to the SPA.</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

ISSUE	REPORTER'S RECOMMENDATION	REPORT PAGE NO	Council Comments
	operation of the development.”		
17 Supporting Town Centres	No modifications.	213	No Action Required.

## **Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

18 Built Environment	<p>1. Deleting the first sentence of the second paragraph of the supporting text relating to scheduled monuments and archaeological sites on page 89 and substituting the following sentence: 'Scheduled Monument Consent is required from Historic Environment Scotland for any works that would directly affect a Scheduled Monument.'</p> <p>2. Deleting the first sentence of Policy BE1 Scheduled Monuments and Archaeological Sites and substituting the following sentence: 'Where development would adversely affect a scheduled monument or the integrity of the setting of a scheduled monument, permission would only be granted where there are exceptional circumstances.'</p> <p>3. Deleting the first paragraph of Policy BE2 Listed Buildings and substituting the following three paragraphs: 'Demolition or development that would adversely affect the special interest, character or setting of a listed building will not be permitted unless it can be clearly demonstrated and justified that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the building is no longer of special interest, or</li> <li>• the building is incapable of meaningful repair, or</li> <li>• demolition of the building is essential to the delivery of significant benefits to economic growth or the wider community.</li> </ul> <p>Appropriate enhancement of listed buildings will be supported.'</p>	217	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to refer to the requirement to obtain Scheduled Monument Consent from Historic Scotland</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that Scheduled Monuments and their settings are preserved, but to also allow granting of proposals in exceptional circumstances.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clearly set out the circumstance where a listed building would be able to be demolished.</p>
19 Green Infrastructure	No modifications.	226	No Action Required.
20 Environment	<p>1. Inserting the following new paragraph between the existing second and third paragraphs of the supporting text on page 96 of the proposed plan: 'Development likely to have a significant effect on a Natura 2000 site</p>	240	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that there is no adverse impacts on Natura 2000 sites.

## Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations

	<p>will be subject to an appropriate assessment of the implications for the conservation objectives which led to the designation of the site.'</p> <p>2. Changing the notation for the natural environment designations map to show the orange hatching relating to the Kilpatrick Hills Local Landscape Area so that it runs north-west to south-east, and the notation for Sites of Special Scientific Interest so that it runs south-west to north-east.</p> <p>3. Deleting the existing second sentence of the third paragraph of proposed Policy ENV1 Nature Conservation and substituting the following sentence: 'In all instances, the council will require development proposals to have regard to safeguarding features of nature conservation value including woodlands, hedgerows, lochs, ponds, watercourses, wetlands, wildlife corridors and geological features.'</p> <p>4. Inserting a new sentence at the end of criterion a) of the second paragraph of proposed Policy ENV1 Nature Conservation to read as follows: 'In this event, Scottish Ministers will be notified.'</p> <p>5. Deleting criterion c) of the second paragraph of proposed Policy ENV1 Nature Conservation and substituting the following criterion: 'c) SSSIs where:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the objectives of designation and the overall integrity of the area will not be compromised; or</li> <li>• any significant adverse effects on the qualities for which the area has been designated are clearly outweighed by social, environmental or economic benefits of national importance.'</li> </ul> <p>6. Deleting the fourth sentence of the proposed introductory text which</p>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to aid comprehension of the map.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to add geological features to the list of natural features within the policy.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to provide clarity on the process.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to provide clarity on the criteria that would allow development proposals to proceed in relation to a SSSI.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by</p>
--	--	--	--

## Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations

	<p>precedes Policy ENV2 Landscape Character and substituting the following sentence: ‘It is important that the siting and design of new development relates directly to key landscape characteristics in order to maintain and enhance the distinctive landscape character.’</p> <p>7. Deleting the first sentence of proposed Policy ENV2 Landscape Character and substituting the following sentence: ‘Development proposals should be sited and designed to relate to the local landscape character of the area and ensure that the integrity of this landscape character is maintained and, where appropriate, enhanced.’</p> <p>8. Inserting after the second sentence of the supporting text to proposed Policy ENV3 Carbon Rich Soils a link to Scottish Natural Heritage’s Scotland-wide map of Carbon Rich Soil, Deep Peat and Priority Peatland Habitats, 2016.</p> <p>9. Inserting the following paragraph after the existing first paragraph of proposed Policy ENV3 Carbon Rich Soils: ‘Where peat and other carbon rich soils are present, applicants may be required to submit a peat management plan and/or enhancement plan to demonstrate how impacts on peat or peatland habitat would be avoided or minimised.’</p> <p>10. Adding a new sentence after the existing fifth sentence of the third paragraph of the introductory text that precedes proposed Policy ENV6, to read as follows: ‘Further information can be found in Scottish Natural Heritage’s report Impacts of sea-level rise and storm surges due to climate change in the Firth of Clyde: <a href="https://www.nature.scot/snh-commissioned-report-891-impacts-sea-level-rise-and-storm-surges-due-climate-change-firth-clyde">https://www.nature.scot/snh-commissioned-report-891-impacts-sea-level-rise-and-storm-surges-due-climate-change-firth-clyde</a></p>	<p>the Reporter to give guidance on design consideration in terms of landscapes.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that the landscape character is not adversely affected.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to refer to SNH’s map.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that the appropriate documents are provided if these soils are present.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to draw attention to SNH’s report.</p>
--	--	--

## Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations

	<p>.</p> <p>11. Deleting the first sentence of proposed Policy ENV6 Flooding and substituting the following sentence: ‘Development which would have a significant probability of being affected by flooding or would increase the probability of flooding elsewhere will not be supported.’</p> <p>12. Inserting a new sentence after the existing second sentence of proposed Policy ENV7 Advanced and Temporary Greening of Vacant and Derelict Land to read as follows: ‘Temporary use of a site as green infrastructure should take account of any existing wildlife value of the site and should be preceded by a survey to establish any protected species licensing requirements.’</p> <p>13. Deleting the second paragraph of proposed Policy MIN3 Coal and inserting a new sub-section and policy after proposed Policy ENV9 Contaminated Land, as follows:</p> <p>‘Unstable Land In areas of former coal extraction, ground conditions may pose a risk to new development unless appropriate remediation measures are undertaken. The Coal Authority can provide advice on this matter.</p> <p>Policy ENV10 Unstable Land</p> <p>In areas of past coal mining activity, developers will be required to establish the nature and extent of any land instability. Where land instability is present and a risk is identified, remediation works will be</p>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to revise the first sentence of the policy to clearly state where proposal will not be supported.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that any temporary measures to ensure that there would be no adverse impact on protected species and where there are to obtain the appropriate licences.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure that where development is proposed in areas of former mining activity that they determine if there is any risk of land instability and mitigate where there is a risk.</p>
--	---	--	---

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

	<p>required to ensure that the site can be made safe and stable for its future use.'</p> <p>Renumbering proposed Policies ENV10 and ENV11 as Policies ENV11 and ENV12.</p>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is just numbering changes.</p>
21 Connectivity	<p>1. Inserting a new fourth paragraph of introductory text before Policy CON3 Core Paths and Natural Resources to read as follows: 'Access rights extend beyond core paths and the formal path network. There is a number of activities in addition to walking and cycling that use and are dependent on the natural environment and exercising broader access rights for their practice, including off-path activities such as climbing and water-based sports. Development proposals will be expected to consider any impacts of proposals on access for these users.'</p> <p>2. Retitling proposed Policy CON3 'Core Paths, Natural Routes and Access'. Adding a new final sentence to the first paragraph of Policy CON3 to read as follows:</p>	251	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to provide further clarity on access rights and other activities.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> These are modifications by the Reporter to explicitly to refer to access rights.</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

	<p>‘Development proposals will be required to consider any impacts on access rights for outdoor sport and recreation interests.’</p> <p>Deleting the first sentence of the second paragraph of proposed Policy CON3 and inserting a new sentence to read as follows:</p> <p>‘The council, however, will not be supportive of development which disrupts or adversely impacts on any existing or potential core path, right of way, bridle path, or footpath, including off-path access rights, used by the general public for recreational or other purposes.’</p> <p>3. Inserting a new sentence after the existing second sentence of the proposed introductory text that precedes Policy CON4 to read as follows:</p> <p>‘It is accepted that actual broadband speeds available at individual premises will depend on the wider digital infrastructure.’</p> <p>4. Deleting existing proposed Policy CON5 Communications Infrastructure and substituting the following text:</p> <p>‘Policy CON5 Communications Infrastructure</p> <p>New communications infrastructure associated with advancements in digital communications technology will be supported by the council where there is no significant, adverse visual impact on the streetscape, built heritage, green network or residential amenity. In particular, it will be necessary for the developer to demonstrate that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the proposed infrastructure is essential to support a wider network;</li> <li>• the site is the most suitable available, taking account of options for mast or site sharing;</li> <li>• the proposed equipment is the most unobtrusive suitable for the purpose, taking account of technological requirements;</li> </ul>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to make it clear that broadband speeds can vary due to the infrastructure in place.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to explicitly refer to the requirements of Scottish Planning Policy in this regard,</p>
--	--	--	---

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• all equipment is to be disguised as effectively as practically possible;</li> <li>• proposals take account of any cumulative impact in relation to existing equipment; and</li> <li>• the proposed equipment and installation complies fully with the appropriate guidelines for public exposure to radiofrequency radiation.'</li> </ul>		
22 Renewable Energy	<p>1. Deleting the second sentence of the second paragraph of proposed Policy RE2 Spatial Framework for Wind Energy and substituting the following sentence:  'Development may be appropriate in some circumstances within these areas but only in cases where it can be demonstrated that any significant adverse effects on the qualities of these areas can be substantially overcome by siting, design or other mitigation and where the proposal is acceptable in terms of the relevant development considerations set out in paragraph 169 of Scottish Planning Policy 2014.'</p> <p>Deleting the third paragraph of proposed Policy RE2 and substituting the following paragraph:  'Within Group 3 areas, as shown on the Spatial Framework for Wind Energy Development Map over, proposals for wind energy developments will only be supported where it can be demonstrated that they are acceptable in terms of the relevant development management considerations contained within paragraph 169 of Scottish Planning Policy 2014 and accord with the guidance set out in the Renewable Energy Supplementary Guidance.'</p> <p>2. Extending the red line which represents the West Dunbartonshire Council boundary on the Spatial Framework for Wind Energy Development Map around the full extent of the local authority area and changing the colour used to outline the Group 2 Areas of Significant</p>	259	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to refer to 'the relevant development considerations' and not all of them.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to refer to 'the relevant development considerations' and not all of them.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to aid comprehension of the map.</p>

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

	<p>Protection from red to another colour.</p> <p>3. Deleting the first sentence of proposed Policy RE3 Wind Energy Proposals outwith the Spatial Framework and substituting the following sentence: ‘Proposals for wind energy that do not trigger the application of the spatial framework, as set out in the first paragraph of Policy RE2, will be supported by the council where it can be demonstrated that there will be no unacceptable significant adverse impacts on the local area and the wider landscape and where they: <i>etc</i>’.</p> <p>4. Deleting the third and fourth sentences of the second paragraph of proposed Policy RE4 Heat Generation and substituting the following sentences: ‘Where there is a realistic prospect of it being utilised, proposals for new development should ensure that the site can be connected to energy centres and heat networks, including district heating, which may be developed in the future. Developers should ensure that the necessary capacity, infrastructure and land for future connections and the potential development of energy centres are safeguarded within the site where there is realistic potential for such development to take place.’</p> <p>5. Deleting the second sentence of the third paragraph of proposed Policy RE4 Heat Generation and substituting the following sentence: ‘All proposals will be required to be acceptable in terms of the relevant development management considerations set out in paragraph 169 of Scottish Planning Policy 2014.’</p>		<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clarify that this policy refers to wind energy proposals outwith the spatial framework.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to clearly state that the requirements of the policy come into force where there is a realistic prospect of them being used instead of a blanket requirement.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to refer to ‘the relevant development considerations’ and not all of them.</p>
--	--	--	---

## Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations

23 Minerals and Coal	<p>1. Inserting a new paragraph before the existing first paragraph of proposed Policy MIN1 Minerals and Aggregates Extraction, to read as follows: ‘When assessing development proposals, the council will ensure that all workable mineral resources which are of economic or conservation value are safeguarded. There will be a presumption against other forms of development which would sterilise these resources permanently, unless their retention in the ground can be justified fully.’</p> <p>2. Deleting the last sentence of proposed Policy MIN1 Minerals and Aggregates Extraction and substituting the following sentence: ‘Restoration proposals are required to restore the land to the highest possible standards to ensure its suitability for appropriate uses including tourism, leisure, forestry, nature conservation and agriculture to the benefit of local communities’.</p> <p>3. Inserting a new paragraph after the existing third paragraph of proposed Policy MIN1 Minerals and Aggregates Extraction, to read as follows: ‘Proposed commercial extraction of peat will only be supported in areas of peatland suffering historic, significant damage through human activity and where the conservation value is low and restoration is impossible.’</p>	265	<p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to explicitly refer to the requirements of Scottish Planning Policy in this regard.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to give some guidance on appropriate future uses for restored sites.</p> <p><b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to refer to the requirements of Scottish Planning Policy in relation to commercial peat extraction.</p>
24 Private Housing Sites – Clydebank	No modifications.	274	No action required.
25 Private Housing Sites – Dumbarton	<p>1. Deleting the fourth, fifth and sixth paragraphs of the notes on Schedule 2 on page 125, and replacing them with: “Development at Castlegreen Street and Sandpoint Marina, Dumbarton, annotated with a ‘3’ must not have an adverse effect on the Endrick Water Special Area of Conservation (SAC) for which Atlantic salmon,</p>	280	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure there are no adverse impacts on the SAC and SPA as a result of development of these sites.

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

	<p>brook lamprey and river lamprey are the qualifying interests or on the Inner Clyde Special Protection Area (SPA) for which redshank are the qualifying interest. Proposals for development must be accompanied by an expert assessment to inform a project-level Habitats Regulations Appraisal (HRA). This may require a study of redshank behaviour in the affected area of the SPA, which is likely to involve survey over at least one overwintering season. Account should also be taken of the HRA of this plan, including measures potentially required to address disturbance both during construction and operation of the development.”</p> <p>2. Replacing superscript “4” after Sandpoint Marina in Schedule 2 with superscript “3”.</p>		
26 Private Housing Sites – Vale of Leven	The plan be modified by redrawing the boundary of Site H2(34): Dalquhurn to exclude the area of parking along the northern boundary shown as black hatching on the map accompanying the representations from Grahame Wardlaw and Jim Conroy.	289	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to accurately reflect ownership boundaries.
27 Strauss Avenue, Clydebank	<p>1. Deleting site H2(39) from schedule 2 and the proposals map; and</p> <p>2. Identifying the site as open space on the proposals map.</p>	314	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter in relation to the proposed allocation of this site.
28 Main Street, Jamestown	No modifications.	321	No action required.
29 Glebe, Old Kilpatrick	The proposed plan be modified by annotating site H2(41) in Schedule 2 with the superscript number “2” (relating to the accompanying note regarding flood risk assessment).	337	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to ensure a flood risk assessment is provided as part of any application for development of this site.
30 Non-allocation of Duntiglenan Fields, Clydebank	No modifications.	346	No action required.
31 Non-allocation of	No modifications.	352	No action required.

**Appendix 1: West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan Examination Report – Council Comments on Recommendations**

Young's Farm, Dumbarton			
32 Affordable Housing Sites – Clydebank	The proposed plan be modified by redrawing the northern part of the western boundary of Site H2(54) to follow the existing fence line, as shown in black on the site map submitted by the council for this examination <a href="http://www.dpea.scotland.gov.uk/Document.aspx?id=607333">http://www.dpea.scotland.gov.uk/Document.aspx?id=607333</a>	362	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to accurately reflect ownership boundaries.
33 Affordable Housing Sites – Dumbarton	The proposed plan be modified by excluding the house on Whiteford Crescent, and its curtilage, shown in yellow on the site plan submitted by the council to the examination <a href="http://www.dpea.scotland.gov.uk/Document.aspx?id=607336">http://www.dpea.scotland.gov.uk/Document.aspx?id=607336</a> from housing opportunity H2(45) Former Aitkenbar Primary School, Dumbarton.	365	<b>Agree.</b> This is a modification by the Reporter to accurately reflect ownership boundaries.
34 Affordable Housing Sites – Vale of Leven	No modifications.	367	No action required.
35 Re-allocation of Land	No modifications.	376	No action required.
36 New Policy – Community Facilities	No modifications.	379	No action required.