

AUDIT & PERFORMANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE

At a Meeting of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held in Meeting Room 3, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton on Wednesday, 15 February 2012 at 10.00 a.m.

Present: Councillors George Black, Jim Brown and Martin Rooney and Mr Stevie J. Doogan, Mr Edward Haynes, Mr Francis McNeill and Ms Margaret Ward.

Attending: Joyce White, Chief Executive; Lorraine Coyne, Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning; Stephen West, Head of Finance and Resources; Colin McDougall, Manager of Risk & Performance; Joe Gillespie, Section Head (Operations); Craig Stewart, Committee Officer, Legal, Democratic and Regulatory Services.

Also Attending: Mr David McConnell, Assistant Director, Ms Elaine Boyd, Senior Audit Manager, and Mr Laurence Slavin, Senior Auditor, Audit Scotland.

Apologies: Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf of Councillors Jonathan McColl, Craig McLaughlin, John Millar and Lawrence O'Neill.

Councillor Martin Rooney in the Chair

CHAIR'S REMARKS

Councillor Rooney, Chair, informed the Committee of the resignation of Councillor Geoff Calvert from West Dunbartonshire Council with effect from 27 January 2012 and expressed his thanks for the immense contribution that he had made to the work of the Audit & Performance Review Committee both as Chair and as a Member of the Committee over the years. The Committee warmly concurred.

DECLARATION OF INTEREST

It was noted that there were no declarations of interest in any of the items of business on the agenda at this point in the meeting.

MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The Minutes of Meeting of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held on 14 December 2011 were submitted and approved as a correct record.

The Committee heard updates from Councillor Rooney, Chair, on the current position with regard to any matters arising from the previous minutes and it was agreed that a Members' Briefing Note and not a report would be issued on the budgetary position with regard to PPP schools estate.

AUDIT SCOTLAND OVERVIEW 2011/12

A report was submitted by the Interim Executive Director of Corporate Services presenting Audit Scotland's Annual Audit Plan 2011/12 to the Committee for information.

Following discussion and having heard Mr McConnell and the Chief Executive in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that the Audit Scotland Annual Audit Plan 2011/12 would be adjusted, as appropriate, to reflect the changed position with regard to the reduction in the Council's pension liabilities; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report and appendix, together with welcoming the reduction in fee for 2011/12.

NATIONAL FRAUD INITIATIVE 2010/11

A report was submitted by the Interim Executive Director of Corporate Services advising of the progress being made in investigating matched datasets provided to the Council as a result of the National Fraud Initiative 2010/11.

Having heard the Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning and Section Head (Operations) in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

INTERNAL AUDIT ACTION PLANS ISSUED DURING THE PERIOD FROM 15 NOVEMBER 2011 TO 14 JANUARY 2012 AND REVIEW OF PROGRESS IN ACTIONING RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED WITHIN INTERNAL AUDIT AND EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORTS

A report was submitted by the Interim Executive Director of Corporate Services:-

- (a) presenting the Internal Audit Section action plans issued to directorates during the period from 15 November 2011 to 14 January 2012; and

- (b) advising of the progress being made in actioning recommendations contained within key Internal Audit and External Audit reports which management have committed to implementing.

It was noted that a revised report had been circulated to Members giving a further update on action plans contained in the report.

Having heard the Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning and relevant officers in elaboration and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the terms of the discussion that had taken place in respect of this matter; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS ON RECOMMENDATIONS – TRANSITION TO REPORTING ON COVALENT

A report was submitted by the Interim Executive Director of Corporate Services advising that the Internal Audit Section had recently entered all outstanding Internal Audit and External Audit actions on to Covalent, the Council's risk and performance management system, and providing further information in this regard.

A Supplementary Note was circulated to Members at the meeting, which provided more up to date information on Appendices A and B contained in the report.

After discussion and having heard the Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning, Chief Executive and relevant officers in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note that the information contained in the Appendices A and B would be taken back to the Corporate Management Team (CMT) in order that the information contained therein could be reviewed with a view to ensuring that departmental management were focused on ensuring that actions were on track and had been completed within agreed timescales;
- (2) to note the terms of the discussion that had taken place in respect of this matter; and
- (3) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS REPORT TO 31 DECEMBER 2011

A report was submitted by the Interim Executive Director of Corporate Services advising on the work undertaken by the Internal Audit Section against the Audit Plan 2011/12.

After discussion and having heard the Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning, Chief Executive and relevant officers in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the terms of the discussion, including the vacant post of Internal Auditor, that had taken place in respect of this matter;
- (2) to note the update provided by the Chief Executive on the ongoing review of structures of the Chief Executive's and Corporate Services Departments, which was scheduled to be completed by the end of March 2012, whereupon an update would be provided to Members in this regard;
- (3) that the report on whistleblowing which was submitted to the Committee on a quarterly basis should instead change to being reported at every meeting; and
- (4) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

SHARED RISK ASSESSMENT – ASSURANCE AND IMPROVEMENT PLAN 2011-14

A report was submitted by the Interim Executive Director of Corporate Services presenting an updated Assurance and Improvement Plan (AIP) scorecard report for 2011/12.

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Risk & Performance and relevant officers in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the terms of the discussion that had taken place in respect of this matter including the update given by the Chief Executive on the establishment of a strategic risk management working group which had been tasked to take matters forward on the Assurance and Improvement Plan (AIP);
- (2) that as well as being reported to the Council on a quarterly basis, this report should in addition be submitted to the Audit & Performance Review Committee to ensure appropriate scrutiny was undertaken; and
- (3) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

PROGRESS OF ACTION PLANS FOR THE REVENUE BUDGET PROPOSALS

A report was submitted by the Interim Executive Director of Corporate Services presenting an update in relation to the action plans drawn up from the Revenue Budget proposals previously agreed by Council.

After discussion and having heard the Chief Executive and relevant officers in elaboration and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to recommend to Council that this report should instead be considered by Service Committees and not the Audit & Performance Review Committee; and
- (2) otherwise to note the terms of the report.

KEY CORPORATE PERFORMANCE INDICATORS FOR QUARTER 3: 2011/12

A report was submitted by the Interim Executive Director of Corporate Services reviewing the performance of the Key Corporate Performance Indicators for 2011/12, quarter 3.

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Risk & Performance, Chief Executive and relevant officers in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that in terms of making comparisons with other quarter 1 and 2 in the appendix to the report, that the appendix be reformatted in future to account for comparative statistics in the immediately two preceding quarters;
- (2) to refer the matter of the concessionary staff discount on Cosmopolitan Leisure Club membership to the Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development for review in light of the downturn of staff usage of the leisure centres;
- (3) that Performance Indicator SW/CS/001 'Percentage of 16 or 17 year olds in positive destinations (further/higher education, training, employment) at point of leaving care' be reviewed as it appeared anomalous in light of the Council achieving good comparative results with other Councils in this area;
- (4) to note that the narrative contained in Performance Indicator 'SH3bviii HS4bx: Low demand stock: Average time to re-let houses (days)' should be reviewed by officers as the reference to "Christmas Shutdown" appeared anomalous; and
- (5) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

The meeting closed at 12.04 p.m.