

Provision of Cleaning/Valet Services for temporary Accomodation Units

	Supplier 1	Supplier 2	Supplier 3	Supplier 4	Digest Of Offer Supplier 5	Supplier 6	Supplier 7	Supplier 8	Supplier 9
	Campbell Cleaning	Newton security	Absolute Furnishings	CF Services	Caledonian	SPS Doorguard	Crime Scene Cleaning	Active Hygiene	Mitie
Organisation Identity	Campbell cleaning services, 11 Kittyshaw place, dalry, north ayrshire, KA24 4JS	Newton Security Doors Ltd, 9 York Street, Ayr. KA8 8AN	Absolute Furnishings Ltd, Units 11–12a Darrows Estate, Bellshill ML4 3HD	CF Services, 33 Glenburn Road, East Kilbride	Caledonian Office & Window Cleaning Co.Ltd, 32 Granvill Street, Charing Cross, Glasgow, G3 7DR	SPS Doorguard Limited, 296 St Vincent Street, Glasgow, G2 5RU	Crime Scene Cleaning UK LTD, 105 Llwydarth Rd, Maesteg Mid Glamorgan, South Wales, CF34 9EU	Castlebrae-Active Hygeine Services, Block A, Units 2&3 Drakemire Business Park Glasgow, G45 9SS	MITIE Cleaning & Support Services LTD, 35 Duchess Road, Rutherglen, G73 1AU
Tel:	01294 835886 / 07900675562	01292 269135	01698 844700	0141 583 5600	0141 248 3554	0141 275 4562	1656737355	07800 616881	0141 613 7800
Fax:	0141 882 6302	01292 292492		0141 583 5700	0141 204 2454	0141 248 7861	1656732610		1416137888
Email:	d.campbell441@btinternet.com	jimmaitland@newtonholdings.com	Adrian@absolute Furnishings.com	jim.cosgrove@cf services.co.uk		alisongray@spsdoorguard.com	cscuk@btinternet.com	Allan.Carswell@castlebraedrainage.co.uk	steven.dickson@mitie.co.uk
Bid Manager	David Campbell	Jim Maitland	adrian conduit	Maureen Osbourne					Steven Dickson
Registered Address	As above	As above	As above	As above	As above	As above	As above	As above	As above
VAT Reg No.	880467890	659060719	724105962	703722953	388902994	596515501		703842450	869807854
Company Registration	n/a	157336	sc209341	sc170883	SCO84888	SC113186	6514324	195704	686377
Org Structure	Attached	attached	attached	attached	attached	attached	attached	attached	attached
Account Co-ordinator	David Campbell	Scott Fraser	David Loughran	Gail Allan	Paul Kelly	john mcbride	Robert Phillips	john docherty	william sweeney
Account Manager	Peter Campbell	Ken Fraser	adrian conduit	Maureen Osbourne	Jim McLaughlin	john mcbride	David Ronan	stephen herriot	Steven Dickson
New Business	Designated staff for WDC contract	given written assurance	additional services specific to WDC, premises in area	specific to WDC requirements	given assurance	given details of how they will deal with response and spec.	Will supply 2 dedicated teams for the contract + 1 additional if required	given assurance of ability to fulfill contract inc. adding additional personnel/equipment/vehicles	confident they can provide the necessary resources to cover any scenario within current structure
Compliance with EU Legislation	N/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	didn't answer	n/a	didn't answer
Financial Accounts	Attached	attached	attached	attached	attached	attached	only in operation since April 08.	yes	yes
Experian Report	new company???	attached	attached	attched	attached	attached	yes	yes	yes
Areas of Business	cleaning, industrial, commercial and domestic	cleaning, clearing, fumigation, disenfestation, disinfection, refuse property maintenance	valets, clearance & furnishing supplier (already WDC furnishings supplier)	valets, clearance & furnishing supplier to other Authorities	window/common area cleaning/construction cleaning/trauma cleaning	, void property protection, commmunal doors and door entry systems.	specialise in crime and trauma cleaning, needle disposal.	drainage, pest control, hygiene services	cleaning/clearing, deep cleaning, windows,stairs/ hygiene/ consumable supply, housekeeping services/ancillary services/buildings & security
Quality Assurance/Accreditation	Policy only	policy only	certificate ISO 9001:2000	policy only	policy only	ISO 9001:2000 - BS8800,	policy only	policy only - have applied for ISO 9001	policy and certificates - several memberships
References	provided - excellent - 1 written + 1 verbal	provided good - both written	provided - both written excellent.	provided - 2 - indifferent	provided 2 - good references - some relevance to our spec/needs	provided 2 - no replies	only able to prove 1 due to new business	provided 2 - no replies	1 provided - 1 reply
Any contracts Terminated	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	yes - details provided in ref 11.2 in file
PROFESSIONAL ORGANISATIONS	none	SEPA	federation of Small Businesses	none	British Inst of Cleaning Science, federation of master general and	BSI, EXOR, CHAS, ROSPA, IM, IRM, NEBOSH, IQSH, SQMC,	CHAS - certificate of H&S	BICS, ROSPA, CHAS british safety council, CBI	multitude of organisations - some relevant
Insurances	EL £10m, Third Party £1m	EL £10m, third party £10m	EL £10m, third party £10m	EL £10m, third party £10m	EL £10m, Third Party £5m	EL £10m, Third party £5m	£5m PL & £10m EL	EL £10m, Third Party £5m	EL £10m third party £10m
Insurance Renewal Date	Monday, April 20, 2009	Saturday, November 29, 2008	Tuesday, April 21, 2009	Wednesday, April 01, 2009	Saturday, March 21, 2009	7th August 2008	28 February 2009	31st july 2008	not known - not provided
Insurance Certificates attached	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
Willing to increase Insurance	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	yes	yes	yes	no	n/a
Subcontractors Used	no	no	no	no	no	NO	no answer	no	no
H&S Policy	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	YES	yes	yes	yes
Complaints procedure	provided		provided		policy only	POLICY ONLY	provided	policy only	policy only
rebates	yes see worksheets	yes see worksheet	yes see worksheet	yes see worksheet	none offered	NIL	yes see worksheets	none	yes see worksheets
Statement of intent	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated		signed and dated	signed and dated
Equality & Diversity	ok	ok	ok	ok	ok	ok	ok	ok	ok
No Collusion	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated	signed and dated
Fixed Prices	Yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	retain prices for 36 months
Yellow Page	no qualifications signed and dated	no qualifications signed and dated	no qualifications signed and dated	no qualifications signed and dated	no qualifications signed and dated	no qualifications signed and dated	no qualifications signed and dated	additional costs for disposal of any items removed from properties - signed and dated.	no qualifications - signed and dated

	Supplier 1		Supplier 2		Supplier 3		Supplier 4		Supplier 5		Supplier 6		Supplier 7		Supplier 8		Supplier 9
Growth Value	Campbell Cleaning		newton		Absolute Furnishings		CF Services		Caledonian		SPS Doorguard		Crime Scene Cleaning		Active Hygiene		Mitie
£200,000 - £300,000	2%		2.50%		2.50%		1.00%		0%		0%		0.50%		0%		1.75%
£300,001 - £400,000	4%		2.50%		5.00%		1.50%		0%		0%		0.75%		0%		2.00%
£400,001 - £500,000	5%				7.50%		2.00%		0%		0%		1.00%		0%		2.25%
£500,000+	10%				10.00%		2.00%		0%		0%		1.00%		0%		2.50%

Tender Evaluation

1. Financial - 50%
2. Service - 22%
3. Quality - 22%
4. Administration - 6%

Score: Is determined by a fomula which is **Lowest Total Cost** divided by **Total (of each supplier)** multiplied by **Score Available (44)**.

Scoring Matrix

Award Criteria										
		1. Financial - 50%								
		2. Service - 22%								
Award Criteria		3. Quality - 22%								
		4. Administration - 6%								
		Supplier 1	Supplier 2	Supplier 3	Supplier 4	Supplier 5	Supplier 6	Supplier 7	Supplier 8	Supplier 9
		Campbell Cleaning	Newton security	Absolute Furnishings	CF Services	Caledonian	SPS Doorguard	Crime Scene Cleaning	Active Hygiene	Mitie
Award Criteria 1										
1. Financial -										
Commercial Summary - Offer Page	44%	16.83	25.61	41.70	12.40	20.85	7.73	44.00	19.78	8.48
Firm Price		2.00	2.00	2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	3.00
Financial Stability		0.00	4.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	2.00	2.00	4.00
Growth Rebate		2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	0.00	0.00	2.00	0.00	2.00
Total Achievable Score -	53	20.83	33.61	50.70	22.40	27.85	14.73	50.00	23.78	17.48
Total Achievable Score -	50.00%	19.65	31.70	47.83	21.13	26.28	13.90	47.17	22.43	16.49
Award Criteria 2										
2. Service - 22%										
Q3 Delivery Timescales		2	2	2	2	2	2	0	2	2
Q4 Delivery Areas		1	1	1	1	1	1	0	1	1
Q8 High Level Support		2	2	2	2	1	2	0	1	2
Clause 3.31 Performance Reviews		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Previous Experience/References		2	1	2	1	1	0	0	1	1
Total Achievable Score -	8	8	7	8	7	6	6	1	6	7
Total Award Criteria Score -	22.00%	22.00	19.25	22.00	19.25	16.50	16.50	2.75	16.50	19.25
Award Criteria 3										
3. Quality - 22%										
Q1 Compliance to Specification		2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	0.00	2.00	2.00
Q6 Disclosure Scotland Checks		1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
Q7 Contract Standard Clause		2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Q9 Added Value		2	1	2	1	1	1	0	1	0
Complaints Procedure		1	1	2	2	1	2	0	2	1
Total Achievable Score -	9	8.00	7.00	9.00	8.00	7.00	8.00	3.00	8.00	6.00
Award Criteria Total Score	22.00%	19.56	17.11	22.00	19.56	17.11	19.56	7.33	19.56	14.67
Award Criteria 4										
4. Administration - 6%										
Employers Liability £10m		2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Third Party/Public Liability £10m		2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Q8 Health & Safety		2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	0
Equality & Diversity		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Compliance to WDC T&C's		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Total Achievable Score -	11	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	6
Award Criteria Total Score	6.00%	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	3.27

SUMMARY TOTAL SCORE										
Award Criteria 1		19.65	31.70	47.83	21.13	26.28	13.90	47.17	22.43	16.49
Award Criteria 2		22.00	19.25	22.00	19.25	16.50	16.50	2.75	16.50	19.25
Award Criteria 3		19.56	7.00	22.00	19.56	17.11	19.56	7.33	19.56	14.67
Award Criteria 4		4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	4.36	3.27
TOTAL TECHNICAL SCORE		65.57	62.32	96.19	64.30	64.25	54.32	61.62	62.85	53.68

180 days	yes	No longer trading yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
----------	-----	--------------------------	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----

Formula for Award Criteria Total Score = Supplier Achieved Score divided by (Total Achievable Score divided by Award Criteria %)

Scoring System

Award Criteria

1. Financial - 50%
2. Service - 22%
3. Quality - 22%
4. Administration - 6%

Award Criteria 1					
1. Financial - 50%	SCORE				
Commercial Summary - Offer Page	See valet tender evaluation worksheet				
Firm Price	>24 months = 3	24 months = 2	> 24 months = 1	> 12 months = 0	
Financial Stability	1 star = 1	2 star = 2	3 star = 3	4 star = 4	5 star = 5
Growth Rebate	Yes = 1	No = 0			
Total Achievable Score -					
Total Award Criteria Score - 50%					

Award Criteria 2					
2. Service - 22%	SCORE				
Delivery Timescales	Full/Willing to = 2	Limited = 1	Unable to comply = 0		
Delivery Areas	Yes = 1	No = 0			
High Level Support	Excellent = 2	Satisfactory = 1	Unsatisfactory = 0		
Performance Reviews	Yes = 1	No = 0			
Previous Experience/References	Excellent = 2	Satisfactory = 1	Unsatisfactory = 0		
Total Achievable Score -					
Total Award Criteria Score - 22%					

Award Criteria 3					
3. Quality - 22%	SCORE				
Compliance to Specification	Full/Willing to = 2	Limited = 1	Unable to comply = 0		
Disclosure Scotland Checks	Yes = 1	No = 0			
Contract Standard Clause	Full/Willing to = 2	Limited = 1	Unable to comply = 0		
Added Value	Excellent = 2	Satisfactory = 1	Unsatisfactory = 0		
Complaints Procedure	Excellent = 2	Good = 1	Poor = 0		
Total Achievable Score -					
Award Criteria Total Score 22%					

Award Criteria 4					
4. Administration - 6%	SCORE				
Employers Liability £10m	Exceed = 3	Full/Willing to = 2	Limited = 1	Unable to comply = 0	
Third Party/Public Liability £10m	Exceed = 3	Full/Willing to = 2	Limited = 1	Unable to comply = 0	
Q8 Health & Safety	Excellent = 2	Satisfactory = 1	Unsatisfactory = 0		
Equality & Diversity	Excellent = 2	Satisfactory = 1	Unsatisfactory = 0		
Compliance to WDC T&C's	Yes = 1	No = 0			
Total Achievable Score -					
Award Criteria Total Score 6%					