

Agenda



Tendering Committee

Date: Wednesday, 27 June 2018

Time: 09:15

Venue: Civic Space,
Council Offices, 16 Church Street, Dumbarton

Contact: Scott Kelly, Committee Officer
Tel: 01389 737220 scott.kelly@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Dear Member

Please attend a meeting of the **Tendering Committee** as detailed above. The business is shown on the attached agenda.

Yours faithfully

JOYCE WHITE

Chief Executive

Distribution:

Councillor J. Finn (Chair)
Councillor G. Casey
Councillor I. Dickson (Vice Chair)
Councillor D. Docherty
Provost W. Hendrie
Councillor M. McNair
Councillor L. O'Neill
Councillor B. Walker

All other Councillors for information

Strategic Director - Transformation & Public Service Reform
Strategic Lead - Regulatory

Date of Issue: 14 June 2018

TENDERING COMMITTEE
WEDNESDAY, 27 JUNE 2018

AGENDA

1 APOLOGIES

2 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members are invited to declare if they have an interest in the items of business on this agenda and the reasons for such declarations.

3 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING 5 – 6

Submit, for approval as a correct record, the Minutes of Meeting of the Tendering Committee held on 30 May 2018.

4 OPEN FORUM

The Committee is asked to note that no open forum questions have been submitted by members of the public.

5 SUPPLY AND DISTRIBUTION OF MILK AND ASSOCIATED PRODUCTS – CALL-OFF FROM SCOTLAND EXCEL FRAMEWORK AGREEMENT (19-17) 7 – 12

Submit report by the Strategic Lead - Resources seeking approval to authorise the Strategic Lead - Regulatory to conclude the award of the contract for the Supply and Distribution of Milk and Associated Products across West Dunbartonshire Council.

6 TENDER OUTCOME REPORT: PROVISION OF VENDING MACHINES – LEASING AND MAINTENANCE (LOT 1) AND FULLY MANAGED SERVICES (LOT 2) 13 – 17

Submit report by the Strategic Lead - Resources providing an update on the outcome of a recent process to procure providers of vending machines.

7 FRAMEWORK/CONTRACT AUTHORISATION REPORT: 19 – 39
CORPORATE TAXI SERVICES

Submit report by the Strategic Lead - Resources seeking approval to authorise the Strategic Lead - Regulatory to conclude the award of the Framework Agreement (FA) and associated call-off contracts for the Provision of Corporate Taxi Services.

8 CONTRACT AUTHORISATION REPORT: SCHOOL 41 – 47
TRANSPORT SESSION 2018/2019

Submit report by the Chief Education Officer seeking approval to authorise the Chief Education Officer, in liaison with Strathclyde Partnership for Transport, to conclude and award contracts for mainstream school transport from August 2018 and up to end of school session 2022/23.

TENDERING COMMITTEE

At a Meeting of the Tendering Committee held in Committee Room 3, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton on Wednesday, 30 May 2018 at 9.15 a.m.

Present: Provost William Hendrie and Councillors Gail Casey, Ian Dickson, Diane Docherty, Jim Finn, Marie McNair and Brian Walker.

Attending: Stephen West, Strategic Lead - Resources; Annabel Travers, Procurement Manager; David Aitken, Business Partner - Strategic Procurement; Angus Cameron, Senior Procurement Officer; and Craig Stewart, Committee Officer.

Apology: An apology for absence was intimated on behalf of Councillor Lawrence O'Neill.

Councillor Jim Finn in the Chair

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

It was noted that there were no declarations of interest in any of the items of business on the agenda.

MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The Minutes of Meeting of the Tendering Committee held on 25 April 2018 were submitted and approved as a correct record.

OPEN FORUM

The Committee noted that no open forum questions had been submitted by members of the public.

**CONTRACT AUTHORISATION REPORT: GROUNDS INVESTIGATION WORKS
AT SITE OF FORMER ST ANDREWS HIGH SCHOOL**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead - Resources seeking approval to authorise the Strategic Lead - Regulatory to conclude the award of the contract for Grounds Investigation Works at the site of the former St Andrews High School to Dunelm Geotechnical and Environmental Limited.

The Committee agreed:-

- (1) that the Strategic Lead - Regulatory be authorised to conclude on behalf of West Dunbartonshire Council, the award of the contract for Grounds Investigation Works at the site of the former St Andrews High School to Dunelm Geotechnical and Environmental Limited; and
- (2) to note that the contract shall be for a period of 9 weeks at a cost of £73,277.00, excluding VAT.

**CONTRACT AUTHORISATION REPORT: APPOINTMENTS OF
STRUCTURAL/CIVIL ENGINEER AND MECHANICAL/ELECTRICAL ENGINEER
FOR THE NEW BUILD HOUSING PROJECT AT THE SITE OF THE FORMER ST
ANDREWS HIGH SCHOOL**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead - Resources seeking approval to authorise the Strategic Lead - Regulatory to conclude the award of the contracts for Structural/Civil Engineer and Mechanical/Electrical Engineer for the new build housing project at the site of the former St Andrews High School.

The Committee agreed:-

- (1) that the Strategic Lead - Regulatory be authorised to conclude the award of the call off contract for the appointment of a Structural/Civil Engineer for the New Build Housing project at the site of the former St Andrews High School, under the Crown Commercial Services Framework Agreement - RM 3741, Lot 5 to Atkins Ltd for a contract period of 12 weeks at an estimated value of £89,040, excluding VAT; and
- (2) that the Strategic Lead - Regulatory be authorised to conclude the award of the call off contract for the appointment of a Mechanical/Electrical Engineer for the New Build Housing project at the site of the former St Andrews High School, under the Crown Commercial Services Framework Agreement - RM 374, Lot 6 to Atkins Ltd for a contract for a period of 12 weeks at an estimated value of £94,478, excluding VAT.

The meeting closed at 9.18 a.m.

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

Report by Strategic Lead – Resources

Tendering Committee: 27th June 2018

Subject: Supply & Distribution of Milk and Associated Products – call-off from Scotland Excel Framework Agreement (19-17)

1. Purpose

1.1 The purpose of this report is to seek the approval of Tendering Committee to authorise the Strategic Lead - Regulatory to conclude the award of the contract for the Supply & Distribution of Milk and Associated Products across West Dunbartonshire Council (the Council).

2. Recommendations

2.1 It is recommended that the Tendering Committee:

- a) Authorise the Strategic Lead Regulatory to conclude, on behalf of the Council, the direct award of a contract under the Scotland Excel Framework Agreement (FA) (19-17) for the Supply & Distribution of Milk & Associated Products to Müller Milk.
- b) Note that the contract shall be for a period of 2 years 8 months with the option to extend for up to a potential 12 month period until 28 February 2022. The overall estimated value of the contract, including the 12 months extension, will be £631,991.18 ex VAT.

3. Background

3.1 The Council has a requirement for Education establishments, Health and Social Care establishments and Clydebank Town Hall to source a range of dairy products, including whole milk, semi-skimmed milk, skimmed milk and various other products.

3.2 Historically, the Council has used Scotland Excel FAs to source these products. The current FA commenced on 1 March 2018 and the contract strategy identified that this is the best route to market for this requirement. There is no disruption to the current supply due to the incumbent supplier maintaining the supply and delivery of the milk however, it should be noted that, until this call-off is finalised, the Council will be contracting on the terms and conditions of the previous FA.

- 3.3** The Contract Strategy for this call-off contract took account of the recently passed Council motion to reduce the use of Single Use Plastics (SUP) such as straws, stirrers, plastic cups etc. within existing budgets.
- 3.4** This procurement exercise has been conducted in accordance with the Council's Standing Orders and Financial Regulations and the Public Contracts (Scotland) Regulations 2015 (above the EU threshold) for Goods. A Contract Strategy document has been approved by the Procurement Manager.

4. Main Issues

- 4.1** There are 2 suppliers on the new Scotland Excel FA who meet the requirements to supply and deliver the Milk and Associated Products for the Council: Grahams Dairy and Müller Milk, overall scores from FA award were as follows:

		Technical (30)	Commercial (70)	Overall Scoring
Ranked 1st	Grahams	23	70	93
Ranked 2nd	Muller	29.75	61.7	91.45

- 4.2** The FA allows Councils to direct award to suppliers on the basis of best value therefore further commercial and technical evaluation was not carried out by the Council. A desk top comparison of suppliers' rates and discounts was carried out by the Corporate Procurement Unit which identified the following costs and savings:

	Current Total Cost Per Annum	New Total Cost Per Annum	Saving (£) Per Ann	Saving (%) Per Ann	Overall Savings Based on 3.5 years
Graham	£176,646	£170,059	£6,588	3.73%	£23,057
Muller	£176,646	£172,361	£4,285	2.43%	£14,998

In light of the recent Council motion on Single Use Plastics, a review of packaging offerings was carried out as part of the Contract Strategy development. Both suppliers offer their milk in containers that can be recycled and the Council's waste services team currently collects both types of containers for recycling. As the use of these containers cannot be removed, in the short term at least, there is a requirement to maximise the recycling of plastic milk containers in order to achieve the goals of the Council motion.

Containers of milk over 189ml ml are offered in plastic bottles by both suppliers. Individual classroom milk is offered in a plastic bottle by Grahams and in a Tetra Pak carton with a straw by Muller. Classroom milk represents 85% of the overall Council volume within the contract with the remainder of 15% being spread across Facilities Management (c.4%) and HSCP (c.11%). Muller has

offered to collect plastic straws from individual milk tetra pak cartons for recycling (schools only). They have also committed to replace the plastic straws with paper straws by the end of 2018.

- 4.3** Tetra Pak cartons are 75% paper board; the rest of the package contains aluminum and polyethylene (plastic). A typical 200ml carton with a plastic straw contains only 2.5g of plastic compared to 12.5g of plastic for an equivalent plastic bottle (80% less plastic). This is because cartons are predominantly produced from renewable paperboard which enables a minimal amount of plastic to be used. In a report to its Executive Sub Committee in April 2018, Scotland Excel noted that Tetra Pak cartons are one of the best environmental packaging choices that local authorities can make. They are mostly made from renewable raw materials (trees used to produce paper), have a very low impact on climate change and are recyclable.
- 4.4** Facilities Management, Education, Finance, HSCP and Legal Services have been extensively consulted to identify the packaging solution that will provide the overall best value. While the plastic bottles option offered by Grahams is at less cost to the Council, there are additional costs associated with the requirement to rinse the containers prior to recycling to ensure there is no milk residue. This can result in contamination of mixed recyclate in the waste stream which negatively affects the quality of the recyclate and the overall percentage that can be recycled. The additional time required for teaching staff to empty and rinse the plastic bottles would directly impact on teaching time with children. The design of the Tetra Pak containers means that milk is contained to a greater extent and requires no rinsing.
- 4.5** The above operational burden associated with plastic bottles, together with the environmental benefits of the Tetra Pak containers and the additional innovation being undertaken by Muller in relation to eradication of plastic straws mitigates against the marginal cost differential between the two suppliers. The Muller offering still represents a saving of £4,285 per annum against current costs.
- 4.6** It is recommended that the contract is awarded to Muller Milk of Market Drayton, Shropshire, UK. The contract's overall value including any extensions will be £631,991.18 ex VAT. The value of the contract has been approved by all participating services. The duration of the contact shall be from 1st July 2018 for 2 years 8 months with the option to extend for a further potential 12 months which will expire on 28 February 2022.
- 4.7** The value of the contract is slightly below the budget amounts approved by the full Council Meeting on the 5 March 2018.
- 4.8** In relation to Fair Working Practices, Muller Milk and Graham's are not accredited Living Wage Employers and do not pay the living wage.
- 4.9** Müller Milk have committed to delivery of a range of community benefits based on the National Outcomes and a range of benefits offered are detailed below;

National Outcome D – Our Young people are successful learners, confident individuals, effective contributors and responsible citizens;

- Staff can provide presentations on careers in schools and use resources e.g. our new careers development website to highlight curriculum linked values of Leadership, Entrepreneurship and Thinking, fitting well in the Curriculum. This also shows Scotland in the context of European Business and the opportunities.
- Working with partners e.g. Food and Drink Scotland to share events connected to careers in the Dairy Industry.
- Funded trips can be enabled to appropriate educational theatre to enhance children's understanding of the Arts.

National Outcome F - We live longer, healthier lives;

- Müller is the main sponsor for the National Obesity Campaign for Scotland, Inch by Inch (CMO Scottish Government Endorsed). This inclusive campaign draws in health educator and chefs from most highly deprived areas. It focuses on exercise and diet making small changes. It is realistic and has particular regard to young people and families. Emphasis is on social media and with affordable ingredients for healthy cooking. Notably this supports all 32 Scottish Councils and will be fully evaluated.
- We will work with the Scottish Grocers Committee groups to promote school nutrient guidelines for a joined up approach.
- Product can be provided for events linked to education and catering promoting healthy nutrition.

National Outcome L - We value and enjoy our built and natural environment and protect it and enhance it for future generations;

- Müller investment e.g. Bellshill Dairy £12m - in using innovative machinery sits within the Climate change agreement and we will be investing in Combined Heating and power units and water recycling to reduce reliance on local water supplies and enhance biodiversity.
- We will continue investing in our modern fleet of vehicles.
- We will work to enhance performance with councils e.g. reducing delivery days.

National Outcome M – We take pride in a strong, fair and inclusive national identity;

- Funding the Scottish School Meals website and Assist Scotland as resources for Scottish Councils.
- We will use accessible Learning Management software platforms for equity in staff training.
- Opportunities to train young people on how to engage with businesses and be work ready by hosting events at our premises.

National Outcome N – We reduce the local and global environmental impact of our consumption and production.

- We will collaborate with Tetra Pak in our new highly invested E3 machinery for 189mls product cartons, leading to more efficiency and speed of production. The carton is produced from FSC board and carries the FSC stamp to show that the timber used to produce the paperboard is responsibly sourced. The product is lightweight to transport. This usually translates to a low carbon footprint compared to alternatives e.g. PET poly bottles.
- We will engage local authorities with recycling and packaging resources connected to Tetra Pak.
- We place our blow moulding facilities adjacent to our dairies to reduce transport of empty plastic.

Once the contract is awarded, the Corporate Procurement Unit will follow up with the supplier to agree and record all community benefits to be provided through the contract.

5. People Implications

5.1 There are no people implications.

6. Financial and Procurement Implications

6.1 Financial costs in respect of this call off contract (£172,361 per annum) will be met from the approved revenue budgets of HSCP, Education establishments, Clydebank Town Hall & Facilities Management approved at the Council Meeting of 5 March 2018 and subsequently reduced by the Management Adjustment.

6.2 This procurement exercise was conducted in accordance with the agreed contract strategy produced by the Corporate Procurement Unit in close consultation with Education Services & Facilities Management and the provisions of Contract Standing Orders, the Financial Codes and relevant procurement legislation.

6.3 The Supply & Distribution of Milk and Associated Products will contribute to delivery of the Council strategic priorities by supporting the provision of a balanced diet for school pupils, HSCP clients and other customers and promoting health and wellbeing.

7. Risk Analysis

7.1 The successful supplier has no known links to Serious and Organised Crime which would have significant political and reputational ramifications for the Council.

8. Equalities Impact Assessment (EIA)

8.1 An equalities screening was undertaken to determine if there is an equalities impact. The results were that there is no equalities impact.

9. Consultation

9.1 Legal Services and the Strategic Leads from Education, Environmental & Neighborhood Services, and HSCP have been consulted regarding the contents of this report and agree that Muller Milk is the recommended supplier.

10. Strategic Assessment

10.1 The use of the Scotland Excel framework agreement for the provision of milk, including free school milk for school pupils, supports the following Council strategic priority:

- Efficient and effective frontline services that improve the everyday lives of residents.

Name: Stephen West
Designation: Strategic Lead - Resources
Date:

Person to Contact: Christina Fraser - Senior Procurement Officer, Corporate Procurement Unit, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton. Telephone: 01389 737857

. Lynda Dinnie - Facilities Management
Julie McGrogan – Education Officer

Appendices: None

Background Papers: Contract Strategy
EIA Screening

Wards Affected: All

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

Report by Strategic Lead – Resources

Tendering Committee: 27th June 2018

Subject: Tender Outcome Report - Provision of Vending Machines – Leasing and Maintenance (Lot 1) & Fully Managed Services (Lot 2)

1. Purpose

1.1 The purpose of this report is to update Tendering Committee on the outcome of a recent process to procure providers of vending machines.

2. Recommendations

2.1 It is recommended that the Tendering Committee:

- i) Note that Lot 1 will be retendered to ensure provision procured is all brand new;
- ii) Authorise the Strategic Lead Regulatory to conclude, on behalf of West Dunbartonshire Council (WDC) and West Dunbartonshire Leisure Trust (WDLT), the award for the Provision of Fully Managed Services Lot 2 only, to Ideal Services Ltd.; and
- iii) Note that the contract shall be for a period of 3 years with the option to extend for up to an additional 2 x 12 month periods until 1 July 2023 and at a revenue value to the supplier of potential income of around £128,624 per year (potential overall value of around £643,120) and potential commission to WDC & WDLT of around £33,128 per year (potential overall commission of around £165,640 net of VAT).

3. Background

3.1 WDC and WDLT have tendered for vending services: Lot 1- the provision of 16 leased machines supported by a full maintenance contract and Lot 2 - the provision of a fully managed and operated vending service for WDC and WDLT on a nil rental basis with commission payable monthly with all risks for the equipment and its contents remaining with the supplier.

3.2 This requirement for vending machines has not been tendered for some time and was previously procured through a Scotland Excel Framework Agreement which is no longer in place. WDC and WDLT have been operating under previous legacy agreements, extended on a rolling basis.

- 3.3** Approval to tender for the provision of vending machines was given at the Infrastructure Regeneration and Economic Development committee held on the 16 December 2016. The budget for the provision of vending machines leasing and maintenance (Lot 1) is contained within the Facilities Management annual budget which was approved at the Council meeting held on the 5 March 2018. The expected income of £12,000 for Lot 2 was included within the overall revenue budget for WDLT which was approved at the WDLT Board on 22 February 2018.
- 3.4** This procurement exercise has been conducted in accordance with the Council's Standing Orders and Financial Regulations and the Public Contracts (Scotland) Regulations 2015 for Goods and Services. A Contract Strategy document has been approved by the Procurement Manager.
- 3.5** A contract notice was published on the Public Contracts Scotland advertising portal on 7 February 2018. For Lot 1, sixteen suppliers expressed an interest, with four suppliers submitting a response and for Lot 2, fifteen suppliers expressed an interest with four submitting a response by the deadline for the submissions of 12 noon on 8 March 2018.

4. Main Issues

- 4.1** Lot 1: The three tender submissions were evaluated by representatives from Facilities Management, Leisure Trust, Corporate Procurement Unit and Finance against pre-determined selection criteria forming part of the published tender documents which assessed competence, experience, and capacity. Three tender submissions passed the selection criteria and were evaluated against a set of award criteria which was based on a Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) / Quality ratio of 70%/30%.
- 4.2** The specification for Lot 1 for the supply of leased vending machines did not specify that the requirement was for brand new machines and, following evaluation, the preferred bidder offered a mixture of new and refurbished machines (two new and the remainder refurbished). Facilities Management has completed an appraisal to evaluate the benefits and risks of accepting refurbished machines against brand new machines. On the basis of this appraisal, it is recommended that Lot 1 should be re-tendered with brand new machines only being specified.
- 4.3** Lot 2: The 5 tender submissions were evaluated by representatives from Facilities Management, Leisure Trust, Corporate Procurement Unit and Finance against pre-determined selection criteria forming part of the published tender documents which assessed competence, experience, and capacity. Four tender submissions passed the selection criteria.
- 4.4** Four tender submissions were evaluated for Lot 2 against a set of award criteria which was based on a TCO / Quality ratio of 60% / 40 %. The scores relative to the award criteria of each tenderer, are as follows:

	Weighting	Ideal Services	Excel Vending	Selecta	Kittle
Quality (40%)					
Project Plan and Project Staffing Structure	4%	1.00	2	2.50	1
Service Delivery & Methodology	4%	1.50	3	2.50	1.5
Product Range	8%	4	2	6.00	6
Contract Monitoring and Management	8%	4.50	4.5	4.00	0.5
Business Continuity Planning, Reactive Repairs / Proactive Servicing Schedule	10%	3.125	1.25	5.00	3.125
Sustainability (Sustainable Procurement)	2%	0	0.5	0.50	1
Community Benefits	2%	0.50	1.5	1.50	0.5
Phase Out Plan & Exit Strategy	1.6%	0	0	0	0
Commitment to Fair Working Practices	0.4%	0.10	0.3	0.10	0.1
Quality Sub-Total %:	40%	14.73	15.05	22.10	13.725
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (60%)					
Delivery of a Fully Managed Service (commission)	60%	Commission offered based on previous avg usage	Commission offered based on previous avg usage	Commission offered based on previous avg usage	Commission offered based on previous avg usage
Potential Revenue to Suppliers		£128,624	£120,536	£109,052	£106,645
Potential Income - WDC /WDLT	(Incl VAT)	£41,411	£35,248	£33,368	£10,664
TCO Sub Total £		£128,624	£120,536	£109,052	£106,645
TCO Sub Total %		60	51.07	48.35	15.45
Total Score	100%	74.73	66.12	70.45	29.18

4.5 It is recommended that the contract is awarded for Lot 2 only to Ideal Services Ltd of Taxi Way, Hillend Industrial Estate, Dalgety Bay, Fife KY11 9JT who has provided the most economically advantageous tender. The contract shall be for a period of 3 years with the option to extend for up to an additional two 12 month periods until 1 July 2023 with an overall potential income value to the supplier of around £643,120.

5. Options Appraisal

5.1 An options appraisal has been carried out by the Facilities Manager supported by the Corporate Procurement Unit which demonstrates both the benefits and the risks of new machines versus refurbished machines and justifies the reasoning behind the decision to retender Lot 1.

6. People Implications

6.1 There are no people implications.

7. Financial and Procurement Implications

- 7.1** There are no financial costs in respect of this contract for Lot 2 (Fully Managed Service) as the revenue is retained by the supplier with a percentage based commission coming back to the Council and the Leisure Trust. Based on historic usage, the estimated annual commission would be £33,128 (net of VAT). The projected income for 2018/19 is £12,000.
- 7.2** This procurement exercise was conducted in accordance with the agreed contract strategy produced by the Corporate Procurement Unit in close consultation with Facilities Management and WDLT officers and the provisions of Contract Standing Orders, the Financial Codes and relevant procurement legislation.
- 7.3** The provision of a fully managed vending service at two Council offices and Sports and Community Centres will contribute to delivery of the Council strategic priorities by supporting the provision of efficient and effective front line services that improve the everyday lives of residents.

8. Risk Analysis

- 8.1** The successful supplier has no known links to Serious and Organised Crime which would have significant political and reputational ramifications for the Council.

9. Equalities Impact Assessment (EIA)

- 9.1** An equalities screening was undertaken to determine if there is an equalities impact. The results were that there is no equalities impact.

10. Consultation

- 10.1** Facilities Management, West Dunbartonshire Leisure Trust and Finance and have been consulted regarding the contents of this report.

11. Strategic Assessment

- 11.1** The provision of a fully managed vending service at two Council offices and Sports and Community Centres will contribute to delivery of the Council strategic priorities by supporting the provision of efficient and effective front line services that improve the everyday lives of residents.

Name: Stephen West
Designation: Strategic Lead - Resources
Date:

Person to Contact: Christina Fraser - Senior Procurement Officer, Corporate Procurement Unit, 16 Church Street, Dumbarton.
Telephone: 01389 737857

Lynda Dinnie - Facilities Management
Sandra Colraine - Leisure Trust

Appendices: None

Background Papers: The Contract Strategy
EIA Screening
Options Appraisal

Wards Affected: All

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

Report by Strategic Lead – Resources

Tendering Committee: 27 June 2018

Subject: Framework / Contract Authorisation Report – Corporate Taxi Services

1. Purpose

1.1 The purpose of this report is to seek the approval of Tendering Committee to authorise the Strategic Lead - Regulatory to conclude the award of the Framework Agreement (FA) and associated call off contracts for the Provision of Corporate Taxi Services.

2. Recommendations

2.1 It is recommended that the Tendering Committee:

- a) Authorise the Strategic Lead Regulatory to conclude on behalf of West Dunbartonshire Council, the award of the FA and associated call off contracts for the Provision of Corporate Taxi Services; and
- b) Note that the FA shall be for a period of 24 months with an optional extension of 12 months and at an indicative cost of £136,281.00 ex VAT for Health and Social Care Partnership (HSCP) requirements and £411,673.00 ex VAT for currently specified Education Learning and Attainment (ELA) requirements over 1, 2 and 3 years. The costs for ELA will increase as new requirements are identified during the term of the FA.

3. Background

3.1 A collaborative tendering exercise has been undertaken to secure services for scheduled and non-scheduled taxi journeys for the following requirements:

- HSCP - to assist service users, with or without escort, from pick-up points to required destinations both within and outside the Council area (Lots 1 – 3);
- NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde – for transfer mainly of records and samples to and from Health Board establishments in the West Dunbartonshire area (Lot 4); and
- ELA - for pupils with additional support needs to attend an educational establishment to meet their requirements.

3.2 This is a renewal of the previous collaborative FA incorporating HSCP, NHS and ELA requirements that has run successfully for the last two years.

- 3.3** Approval to tender these requirements was given at the Education Services Committee on 7 March 2018 where an estimated cost of £577,841 for session 2018/19 was noted and at the HSCP Audit Committee on 14 March 2018 where estimated annual costs of between £123,779 and £151,355 were noted.
- 3.4** This procurement exercise has been conducted in accordance with the Council's Standing Orders and Financial Regulations and the Public Contracts (Scotland) Regulations 2015 (above the EU threshold) for services. A contract strategy document was also approved by the Corporate Procurement Manager on 6 April 2018.
- 3.5** A contract notice was published on the Public Contracts Scotland advertising portal and the Official Journal of the European Union (OJEU) Ref: 2018/S 075-167257 on 18 April 2018. Twelve suppliers expressed an interest, with twelve suppliers submitting a response by the deadline for the submissions of 12 noon on 21 May 2018.

4. Main Issues

- 4.1** A total of 20 tender submissions from twelve bidders were evaluated by representatives from ELA, HSPC, the NHS Procurement Unit (PU), Corporate Procurement Unit (CPU) and Finance against pre-determined selection criteria forming part of the published tender documents which assessed competence, experience, and capacity. The table below provides a breakdown of the number of bids evaluated against each lot:

Tender Lot	Number of tenders evaluated	Service
1	2	HSPC/CPU
2	2	HSPC/PU
3	2	HSPC/CPU
4	2	NHS/PU
5	12	Education/CPU

- 4.2** All twelve bidders met the minimum selection standards to be accepted on to the FA. The above bids were evaluated against a set of award criteria which was based on a Total Cost of Ownership / Quality ratio of 80 % /20 %. The scores, relative to the award criteria, of each tenderer for Lots 1-3 and 5 are detailed in Appendix 1 attached. The NHS has evaluated and will award Lot 4 separately.
- 4.3** It should be noted that for each of the HSCP lots, two suppliers are being accepted to the FA on a ranked basis. For individual call offs, HSCP will

approach the first ranked provider and, if they are unable to provide the service required, the second ranked supplier will be approached. This known as a direct award.

4.4 For Lot 5 (ELA), the recommended suppliers for each of the currently identified contracts as detailed in the appendix have been highlighted in white text on a black background. All suppliers have been accepted to the FA and will be approached for any new requirements arising during the period of the FA. The FA call offs will be run as a mini competition (Competitive process for suppliers already on the FA).

4.5 It is recommended that the FA and associated contracts be awarded to the suppliers in the table below who have provided the most economically advantageous tender for each of the requirements as identified in Appendix 1. The FA shall be for a period of 24 months with an option to extend for up to an additional 12 month period. The total value of the currently identified contracts within ELA is £411,673 ex VAT. Individual call offs for ELA within Lot 5 will be of varying durations of 1, 2 and 3 years. The estimated annual value of the 3 HSCP lots is £136,281 per annum.

Lot	<u>Name</u>	<u>Town/City</u>
1 HSCP Dumbarton	1 st ranked - The Wright Taxi Co (Scotland) Ltd	Alexandria
	2nd ranked - Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA Ltd	Alexandria
2 HSCP- Alexandria	1 st ranked - The Wright Taxi Co (Scotland) Ltd	Alexandria
	2nd ranked - Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA Ltd	Alexandria
3 HSCP- Clydebank	1 st ranked - Clydebank & District TOARS Ltd T/A Clydebank Taxis	Clydebank
	2nd ranked - The Wright Taxi Co (Scotland) Ltd	Alexandria

NB The following suppliers to Lot 5 are not ranked.

5 Education	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA Ltd	Alexandria
	Andrew Buist	Alexandria

	Clydebank & District Toars Ltd T/A Clydebank Taxis	Clydebank
	D J Driver Services	Alexandria
	G T Taxis	Clydebank
	John Smyth Taxis	Clydebank
	Kenny Warren	Alexandria
	KWM Taxis	Alexandria
	OK Taxi Group	Clydebank
	Ryan Kidd T/A Ryan Kidd Hires	Paisley
	The Wright Taxi Co (Scotland) Ltd	Alexandria
	Titan Taxis Ltd	Clydebank

4.6 As the supply base for this requirement is predominantly self-employed sole traders, a fair working practice question was not included within the tender.

4.7 A question on social issues including environmental aspects of the vehicle operation was included in the tender and the majority of tenderers scored reasonably well on this. Examples of benefits are phased migration to electric vehicles, efficient driving to minimize fuel consumption and carbon emissions and route optimization to avoid congestion and engine idling.

5. People Implications

There are no people implications.

6. Financial and Procurement Implications

6.1 Financial costs in respect of this Corporate Taxis FA will be met from the approved revenue budgets of ELA and HSCP. The combined value of the commercial bids for the currently identified ELA contracts is £411,673 .This represents the aggregate value of all contracts, whether of one, two or three year durations. There will be new requirements identified throughout the duration of the FA which cannot be quantified at present. All ELA requirements are anticipated to be met within the approved budget. The value of the HSCP requirement cannot be accurately predicted at this stage however, based on historic demand, it is anticipated that this will be within the approved budget of £136,281 per annum.

- 6.2** This procurement exercise was conducted in accordance with the agreed contract strategy produced by the Corporate Procurement Unit in close consultation with ELA and HSCP officers and the provisions of Standing Orders, the Financial Codes and relevant procurement legislation.

The Corporate Taxi FA will allow young people to be transported safely to education establishments and thus supports the achievement of positive outcomes for young people. It also supports the strategic priority of supporting individual, families and carers to live independently with dignity. It will allow the delivery of efficient and effective frontline services that improve the everyday lives of residents. In addition, it provides employment opportunities for small local suppliers.

7. Risk Analysis

- 7.1** The successful suppliers have no known links to Serious and Organised Crime which would have significant political and reputational ramifications for the Council.
- 7.2** Should the Tendering Committee decide not to proceed as recommended, this will delay the project and result in us not meeting our statutory duties. It may also have financial implications or result in legal challenge.

8. Equalities Impact Assessment (EIA)

- 8.1** An Equalities Impact Assessment has been carried out by ELA. The assessment demonstrates that the school transport arrangements promote equality in terms of access to education for pupils with additional support needs through the provision of an appropriate transport and escort service. An Equalities Screening was carried out by HSCP which identified no issues for potential equalities impact.

9. Consultation

- 9.1** ELA, HSCP and Finance have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

10. Strategic Assessment

- 10.1** Delivery of this contract will support the following strategic objectives:
- Efficient and effective frontline services that improve the everyday lives of residents.
 - A strong local economy and improved employment opportunities.
 - Supported individuals, families and carers living independently and with dignity.

Name: Stephen West

Designation: Strategic Lead - Resources

Date:

Person to Contact: Fred Dapaah - Senior Procurement Officer, Corporate Procurement Unit, 16 Church Street, Dumbarton.
Telephone: 01389 737755

Appendices: Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown.

Background Papers: Contract Strategy
EIA Screening

Wards Affected: All

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

Lot 1 – HSCP Dumbarton

	Weighting	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA
Quality 20%			
Service Continuity	10%	10.000%	5.000%
Quality of Service	6%	4.500%	3.000%
Invoicing	2%	2.000%	2.000%
Customer Care	1%	0.750%	0.500%
Environmental / Sustainability	1%	0.875%	0.625%
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	18.125%	11.125%
TCO (80%)			
HSCP Journey Planning	72%	72.000%	57.273%
Escort Cost	8%	8.000%	7.949%
*TCO Sub Total £	80%	18.35	21.10
TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	65.222%
Total Score	100%	98.125%	76.347%

* In Lots 1-3, the TCO was deemed for the purposes of evaluation to be the total of the following:

Flag fall/starting rate +
 Cost of short journey (miles 1-4.99 per mile) x 1 +
 Cost of medium journey (miles 5-9.99 per mile) x 1 +
 Cost of long journey (miles 10+ per mile) x 1 +
 Escort rate per hour for 1 hour.

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

Lot 2 – HSCP Alexandria

	Weighting	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA
Quality (20%)			
Service Continuity	10%	10.000%	5.000%
Quality of Service	6%	4.500%	3.000%
Invoicing	2%	2.000%	2.000%
Customer Care	1%	0.750%	0.500%
Environmental / Sustainability	1%	0.875%	0.625%
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	18.125%	11.125%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%)			
HSCP Journey Planning	72%	72.000%	57.273%
Escort Cost	8%	8.000%	7.949%
*TCO Sub Total £	80%	18.35	21.10
TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	65.222%
Total Score	100%	98.125%	76.347%

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

Lot 3 – HSCP Clydebank

	Weighting	Clydebank Taxis	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)
Quality (20%)			
Service Continuity	10%	5.000%	10.000%
Quality of Service	6%	4.500%	4.500%
Invoicing	2%	2.000%	2.000%
Customer Care	1%	0.750%	0.750%
Environmental / Sustainability	1%	0.750%	0.875%
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	13.000%	18.125%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%)			
HSCP Journey Planning	72%	72.000%	41.280%
Escort Cost	8%	6.731%	8.000%
*TCO Sub Total £	80%	22.23	30.35
TCO Sub Total %	80%	78.731%	49.280%
Total Score	100%	91.731%	67.405%

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

Lot 5 – Education

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Service Continuity	10%	5.000%	7.500%	5.000%	5.000%	2.500%	2.500%	0.000%	5.000%	7.500%	0.000%	10.000%	7.500%
Quality of Service	6%	3.000%	4.500%	4.500%	3.000%	1.500%	1.500%	1.500%	3.000%	6.000%	1.500%	4.500%	3.000%
Invoicing	2%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%	2.000%
Customer Care	1%	0.500%	1.000%	0.750%	1.000%	0.500%	0.250%	0.250%	0.250%	0.750%	0.000%	0.750%	0.750%
Environmental / Sustainability	1%	0.750%	0.375%	0.875%	0.625%	0.250%	0.250%	0.250%	0.250%	0.500%	0.125%	1.000%	0.625%
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDO01L TCO Sub Total £	---	£19,950.00	---	£20,520.00	---	---	---	---	£20,064.00	---	---	£18,620.00	---
WDO01L TCO Sub Total %	80%	74.667%	---	72.593%	---	---	---	---	74.242%	---	---	80.000%	---
WDO01L Total Score	100%	85.917%	---	85.718%	---	---	---	---	84.742%	---	---	98.250%	---

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDO03L TCO Sub Total £	---	£16,150.00	---	£13,680.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£14,136.00	£13,490.00
WDO03L TCO Sub Total %	80%	66.824%	---	78.889%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	76.344%	80.000%
WDO03L Total Score	100%	78.074%	---	92.014%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	94.594%	93.875%
WDO05L TCO Sub Total £	---	£5,320.00	---	---	---	---	---	£9,120.00	---	£11,970.00	---	£8,341.00	---
WDO05L TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	46.667%	---	35.556%	---	51.025%	---
WDO05L Total Score	100%	91.250%	---	---	---	---	---	50.667%	---	52.306%	---	69.275%	---
WDO07L TCO Sub Total £	---	£1,995.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDO07L TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDO07L Total Score	100%	91.250%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDO08L TCO Sub Total £	---	£13,870.00	£34,200.00	£39,520.00	---	---	---	---	---	£30,780.00	---	£24,700.00	£32,680.00
WDO08L TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	32.444%	28.077%	---	---	---	---	---	36.049%	---	44.923%	33.953%
WDO08L Total Score	100%	91.250%	47.819%	41.202%	---	---	---	---	---	52.799%	---	63.173%	47.828%
WDO09L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£45,600.00	---	---	---	---	---	£42,750.00	---	£34,200.00	---
WDO09L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	60.000%	---	---	---	---	---	64.000%	---	80.000%	---
WDO09L Total Score	100%	---	---	73.125%	---	---	---	---	---	80.750%	---	98.250%	---
WDO10L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£9,500.00	---	£8,170.00	---	---	£12,023.20	£8,550.00	£10,450.00	£11,400.00	£9,500.00
WDO10L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	68.800%	---	80.000%	---	---	54.362%	76.444%	62.545%	57.333%	68.800%
WDO10L Total Score	100%	---	---	81.925%	---	86.750%	---	---	64.862%	93.194%	66.170%	75.583%	82.675%

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDO11L TCO Sub Total £	---	£27,360.00	---	£98,800.00	---	---	---	£53,200.00	£50,540.00	£65,360.00	£64,980.00	---	---
WDO11L TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	---	22.154%	---	---	---	41.143%	43.308%	33.488%	33.684%	---	---
WDO11L Total Score	100%	91.250%	---	35.279%	---	---	---	45.143%	53.808%	50.238%	37.309%	---	---
WDO12L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£5,700.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£6,080.00
WDO12L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	75.000%
WDO12L Total Score	100%	---	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	88.875%
WDO13L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£25,840.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£32,300.00	£24,320.00
WDO13L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	75.294%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	60.235%	80.000%
WDO13L Total Score	100%	---	---	88.419%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	78.485%	93.875%

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDO14L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£20,520.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£30,400.00	£21,280.00
WDO14L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	54.000%	77.143%
WDO14L Total Score	100%	---	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	72.250%	91.018%
WDO15L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£20,520.00	---	---	---	---	---	£25,080.00	---	£30,400.00	£22,800.00
WDO15L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	65.455%	---	54.000%	72.000%
WDO15L Total Score	100%	---	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	82.205%	---	72.250%	85.875%
WDS01L TCO Sub Total £	---	£13,300.00	---	£13,300.00	---	---	---	---	£13,680.00	---	---	£12,350.00	£13,300.00
WDS01L TCO Sub Total %	80%	74.286%	---	74.286%	---	---	---	---	72.222%	---	---	80.000%	74.286%
WDS01L Total Score	100%	85.536%	---	87.411%	---	---	---	---	82.722%	---	---	98.250%	88.161%

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDS03L TCO Sub Total £	---	£2,432.00	---	£4,864.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£5,168.00
WDS03L TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	---	40.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	37.647%
WDS03L Total Score	100%	91.250%	---	53.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	51.522%
WDS05L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£3,344.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS05L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS05L Total Score	100%	---	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS06L TCO Sub Total £	---	£16,720.00	---	£13,680.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£14,060.00	£12,160.00
WDS06L TCO Sub Total %	80%	58.182%	---	71.111%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	69.189%	---
WDS06L Total Score	100%	69.432%	---	84.236%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	87.439%	---

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDS10L TCO Sub Total £	---	£13,300.00	---	£13,300.00	---	---	---	---	£15,960.00	---	---	£14,250.00	£12,350.00
WDS10L TCO Sub Total %	80%	74.286%	---	74.286%	---	---	---	---	61.905%	---	---	69.333%	80.000%
WDS10L Total Score	100%	85.536%	---	87.411%	---	---	---	---	72.405%	---	---	87.583%	93.875%
WDS11L TCO Sub Total £	---	£14,250.00	---	£12,540.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£12,730.00
WDS11L TCO Sub Total %	80%	70.400%	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	78.806%
WDS11L Total Score	100%	81.650%	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	92.681%
WDS12L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£26,220.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS12L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS12L Total Score	100%	---	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDS13L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£25,650.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£26,220.00
WDS13L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	78.261%
WDS13L Total Score	100%	---	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	92.136%
WDS14L TCO Sub Total £	---	£12,350.00	---	£12,540.00	---	---	---	---	£14,193.00	---	---	---	£12,160.00
WDS14L TCO Sub Total %	80%	78.769%	---	77.576%	---	---	---	---	68.541%	---	---	---	80.000%
WDS14L Total Score	100%	90.019%	---	90.701%	---	---	---	---	79.041%	---	---	---	93.875%
WDH01L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£3,040.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£5,700.00
WDH01L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	42.667%
WDH01L Total Score	100%	---	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	56.542%

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDH02L TCO Sub Total £	---	£3,800.00	---	---	---	---	---	£4,560.00	---	---	---	---	---
WDH02L TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	66.667%	---	---	---	---	---
WDH02L Total Score	100%	91.250%	---	---	---	---	---	70.667%	---	---	---	---	---
WDP01L TCO Sub Total £	---	£11,400.00	---	---	---	---	---	£13,680.00	---	---	---	---	---
WDP01L TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	66.667%	---	---	---	---	---
WDP01L Total Score	100%	91.250%	---	---	---	---	---	70.667%	---	---	---	---	---
WDP02L TCO Sub Total £	---	£7,600.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDP02L TCO Sub Total %	80%	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDP02L Total Score	100%	91.250%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDO02L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£13,680.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£18,050.00	£12,540.00
WDO02L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	73.333%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	55.579%	80.000%
WDO02L Total Score	100%	---	---	86.458%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	73.829%	93.875%
WDO04L TCO Sub Total £	---	£13,300.00	---	£13,376.00	---	£9,500.00	£9,500.00	---	---	£8,588.00	---	£9,386.00	£11,020.00
WDO04L TCO Sub Total %	80%	51.657%	---	51.364%	---	72.320%	72.320%	---	---	80.000%	---	73.198%	62.345%
WDO04L Total Score	100%	62.907%	---	64.489%	---	79.070%	78.820%	---	---	96.750%	---	91.448%	76.220%
WDO06L TCO Sub Total £	---	£8,550.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£6,840.00	---
WDO06L TCO Sub Total %	80%	64.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	80.000%	---
WDO06L Total Score	100%	75.250%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	98.250%	---

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDS02L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£5,434.00	---	---	---	---	---	£4,294.00	---	---	---
WDS02L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	63.217%	---	---	---	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---
WDS02L Total Score	100%	---	---	76.342%	---	---	---	---	---	96.750%	---	---	---
WDS04L TCO Sub Total £	---	---	---	£4,940.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£6,460.00
WDS04L TCO Sub Total %	80%	---	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	61.176%
WDS04L Total Score	100%	---	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	75.051%
WDS07L TCO Sub Total £	---	£18,810.00	---	£16,340.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	£20,520.00
WDS07L TCO Sub Total %	80%	69.495%	---	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	63.704%
WDS07L Total Score	100%	80.745%	---	93.125%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	77.579%

Appendix 1 – Corporate Taxi FA Scoring Breakdown

	Weighting	Alexandria & Dumbarton TOA	Andrew Buist	Clydebank Taxis	DJ Driver Services	GT Taxis	John Smyth Taxis	Kenny Warren	KWM Taxis	OK Taxi Group	Ryan Kidd Hires	The Wright Taxi Co. (Scotland)	Titan Taxis
Quality (20%)													
Quality Sub-Total %	20%	11.250%	15.375%	13.125%	11.625%	6.750%	6.500%	4.000%	10.500%	16.750%	3.625%	18.250%	13.875%
Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) (80%) By Schedule/Route													
WDS08L TCO Sub Total £	---	£19,000.00	£9,500.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS08L TCO Sub Total %	80%	40.000%	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS08L Total Score	100%	51.250%	95.375%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS09L TCO Sub Total £	---	£19,000.00	£9,500.00	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS09L TCO Sub Total %	80%	40.000%	80.000%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---
WDS09L Total Score	100%	51.250%	95.375%	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL**Report by the Chief Education Officer****Tendering Committee: 27 June 2018**

Subject: Contract Authorisation Report - School Transport Session 2018/2019**1. Purpose**

- 1.1** The purpose of this report is to seek approval of the Tendering Committee to authorise the Chief Education Officer in liaison with Strathclyde Partnership for Transport (SPT) to conclude and award contracts for mainstream school transport from August 2018 and up to end of school session 2022/23.

2. Recommendations

- 2.1** It is recommended that the Tendering Committee:

- a) Authorise the Chief Education Officer in liaison with SPT to conclude on behalf of West Dunbartonshire Council, the award of the provision of mainstream school transport contracts from August 2018 as detailed in appendix 1;
- b) Note that the contracts shall be for a maximum period of 5 years and at the cumulative value of £1,308,150 (ex VAT);
- c) Note the decision not to award one contract for Dumbarton Academy because the contract does not represent best value and authorise the Chief Education Officer in liaison with SPT to make necessary arrangements for the contract provision;
- d) Authorise the Chief Education Officer in liaison with SPT to approve any further contracts during school term 2018/2019 for contracts not exceeding £50,000.

3. Background

- 3.1** The Education Services Committee at its meeting on 7 March 2018, approved arrangement to secure mainstream school transport contracts in liaison with SPT for session 2018/2019 and up to school session 2022/2023 where contracts are for a 5 year duration.
- 3.2** The procurement exercise was conducted on the Council's behalf by SPT under their Dynamic Purchasing System which offers open access to suppliers and enables the Council to take advantage of supplier competition and capacity. The procurement was carried out in accordance with the Public Contracts (Scotland) Regulations 2015 (above the EU threshold).

3.3 Members will be aware that:

- a) Contracts for sums not exceeding £50,000 may be awarded by the appropriate Strategic Lead following appropriate procurement processes; and
- b) Contracts for sums exceeding £50,000 require to be notified to Members for approval.

3.4 As contracts are aggregated for European Procurement purposes, they have been reported here regardless of their individual values.

4. Main Issues

4.1 Tender submissions were evaluated by representatives from SPT (as laid down in West Dunbartonshire Council's mainstream school transport agency agreement) against pre-determined selection criteria forming part of the published tender documents which assessed contingency planning, presentation and livery and community benefit. Eight tender submissions passed the selection criteria.

4.2 Tender submissions were evaluated against a set of award criteria which was based on a Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) / Quality ratio of 90% / 10 %. The quality element reflects 80% contingency planning, 10% relating to presentation and livery and 10% relating to community benefit.

4.3 Lists of contracts are appended showing:

- a) those for sums exceeding £50,000 for Members approval (Appendix 1); and
- b) comparison report (Appendix 2).

4.4 The contracts recommended for award are for a range of 36 and 60 month period and include dedicated vehicle provision and service bus passes. Where dedicated contracts are approved, all vehicles must be fitted with seatbelts. The annual value of the contracts awarded as listed at appendix 1 is £275,310 (exc VAT).

One contract for Dumbarton Academy (7 pupils) does not represent best value at a cost of £22,800 per annum and the Chief Education Officer in liaison with SPT will ensure necessary arrangements for contract provision will be in place for the new school term.

The award of contracts will be subject to meeting the terms and conditions as stated in the Conditions of Contract.

10% of the available quality marks (20% weighting overall) were attributed to community benefits and this will be explored further with the appointed contractors under the terms of the contract and in consultation with SPT.

5. People Implications

5.1 There are no people implications related to this report.

6. Financial and Procurement Implications

6.1 Financial:

Financial costs in respect of these contracts will be met from the approved revenue budgets of Education, Learning and Attainment. As noted in 4.4 above, there will be a decrease in annual cost of £2,197.

6.2 Procurement:

This procurement exercise was conducted in accordance with the relevant procurement legislation.

7. Risk Analysis

7.1 There is a risk that the Authority will not deliver its statutory duties under the Education Scotland Act (1980) should the committee decide not to proceed as recommended.

7.2 The successful contractors have no known links to Serious and Organised Crime which would have significant political and reputational ramifications for the Council.

8. Equalities Impact Assessment (EIA)

8.1 An equalities impact assessment screening has been carried out which confirmed there is no negative impact on any protected characteristic.

9. Consultation

9.1 Legal, Finance and Corporate Procurement have been consulted in relation to the content of this report.

10. Strategic Assessment

10.1 Proper procurement is a cornerstone of good governance and supports Council and officers to pursue the 5 strategic priorities of the Council's Strategic Plan. This report forms part of the financial governance of the Council.

Laura Mason
Chief Education Officer

Person to Contact: Susan Mullin, Transport Coordinator
Education, Learning and Attainment,
Telephone: 01389 737313
e-mail: susan.mullin@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Claire Cusick, Senior Education Officer
Education, Learning and Attainment
Telephone: 01389 737380
e-mail: claire.cusick@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Appendices: As attached

Background Papers: Report on school transport to Education Services Committee
on 7 March 2018;
EIA screening

Wards Affected: All

Appendix 1: Contracts recommended for award:

Contract No	Contract details	Contractor	Duration of contract	Value of Contract (per annum)
2020F1	Clydebank High (Bowling/Old Kilpatrick)	First Bus Ltd	60 months	£40,432
2021E1	St Peter the Apostle High (Bowling/Old Kilpatrick)	First Bus Ltd	60 months	£45,486
2464N1	Linnvale Primary	Clydebank & District TOARS	60 months	£7600
2689Q1	St Peter the Apostle High (Whitecrook area)	First Bus Ltd	60 months	£6498
8011M	Gartocharn Primary – Gartocharn Farms	McColls Travel Ltd	36 months	£21,850
8122K	Vale of Leven Academy (Gartocharn Farm link contract)	McColls Travel Ltd	36 months	£12,350
8136E1	Dumbarton Academy – Dumbarton (Lennox Gardens)	First Bus Ltd	60 months	£2888
8032K1	Knoxland Primary/St Patrick's Primary	McColls Travel Ltd	60 months	£138,206*
8155A1	St Mary's Primary, Alexandria	McColls Travel Ltd	60 months	£138,206*
8060K1	Vale of Leven Academy (Haldane)	McColls Travel Ltd	60 months	£138,206*
8061K1	Vale of Leven Academy (Balloch)	McColls Travel Ltd	60 months	£138,206*
8141C	Vale of Leven Academy (Beechwood)	First Bus Ltd	60 months	£138,206*
			Total	£275,310

*denotes package bid

Appendix 2: Comparison report:

Contract	Contractor	Duration of contract	Range of Contract Values per annum
Clydebank High – Bowling/Old Kilpatrick	First Glasgow Marbil Coach Services Ltd McColls Travel Ltd	3 & 5 year options	£40,432 – £71,250
St Peter the Apostle High - Bowling/Old Kilpatrick/Dalmuir	First Glasgow Marbil Coach Services Ltd McColls Travel Ltd	3 & 5 year options	£45,486 – £77,900
Linnvale Primary – Dumbarton Road	Clydebank & District TOARS	3 & 5 year options	£7600
St Peter the Apostle High – Whitecrook	First Glasgow McColls Travel Ltd	3 & 5 year options	£6498 - £45,600
Dumbarton Academy – Milton	PJ Travel Ltd	3 & 5 year options	£22,800 - £23,750*
Gartocharn Primary – Gartocharn Farms	McColls Travel Ltd William Mccoll TA Mccolls C Garelochhead Minibuses & Co	3 & 5 year options	£21,850 – £34,200
Knoxland Primary/St Patrick’s Primary – high Overton/Milton	Marbil Coach Services Ltd McColls Travel Ltd PJ Travel Ltd Campbells Coaches	3 & 5 year options	£21,375 - £32,300
St Mary’s Primary, Alexandria – Tullichewan/Strathleven Estate	Marbil Coach Services Ltd McColls Travel Ltd PJ Travel Ltd Garelochhead Minibus & Co	3 & 5 year options	£33,133 - £47,500
Vale of Leven Academy – Haldane	Marbil Coach Services Ltd McColls Travel Ltd	3 & 5 year options	£42,750 - £66,310

Vale of Leven Academy (Link contract) – Gartocharn Farms	McColls Travel Ltd	3 & 5 year options	£14,250
Dumbarton Academy – Dumbarton (Lennox Gardens)	First Glasgow	3 & 5 year options	£2888
Vale of Leven Academy – Beechwood	Marbil Coach Services Ltd McColls Travel Ltd Garelochhead Minibus & Co First Glasgow	3 & 5 year options	£9386 - £47,500
Vale of Leven Academy – Balloch	Marbil Coach Services Ltd McColls Travel Ltd PJ Travel Ltd	3 & 5 year options	£24795 - £38950

,
*not recommended for award

