

## **AUDIT & PERFORMANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

At a Meeting of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held in Meeting Room 3, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton on Wednesday, 8 September 2010 at 10.00 a.m.

**Present:** Councillors George Black\*, Jonathan McColl, Craig McLaughlin, John Millar and Martin Rooney and Mr Francis McNeil, Representative, Community Councils.

\* Attended later in the meeting.

**Attending:** David McMillan, Chief Executive; David Connell, Head of Finance and ICT; Lorraine Coyne, Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning; Vincent Gardiner, Manager of Exchequer; Sandra Brysland, Manager of Quality; Craig Jardine, Manager of Educational Estates; Colin McDougall, Manager of Risk & Performance; Joe Gillespie, Section Head (Operations); John Duffy, Section Head, Risk Management and Craig Stewart, Committee Officer, Legal, Administrative and Regulatory Services.

**Also**

**Attending:** Grant Macrae (Director) and Keith Macpherson (Manager), KPMG LLP.

**Apologies:** Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf of Councillors Margaret Bootland, Jim Brown and Geoff Calvert and Mr John Corcoran, Representative, Business Community and Selina Ross, Representative, Voluntary Sector.

**Councillor Martin Rooney in the Chair**

### **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

It was noted that there were no declarations of interest in any of the items of business on the agenda.

### **MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS**

The Minutes of Meetings of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held on 7 April 2010 (Ordinary) and 9 June 2010 (Inquorate) were submitted and approved as a correct record.

## **INTERIM MANAGEMENT REPORT: ORGANISATION WIDE CONTROLS AUDIT: YEAR ENDED 31 MARCH 2010**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services presenting KPMG LLP's: Interim Management Report.

After discussion and having heard Mr. Macrae, Director, KPMG LLP and the Chief Executive, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the contents of the report and the appendix;
- (2) to note that an indicator would be included on Covalent in future in respect of process review; and
- (3) that a report reviewing the role of Lay Members would be prepared for consideration at the next meeting of the Committee.

Note: Councillor Black entered the meeting during consideration of this item.

### **PROGRESS ON SEEMIS CLICK & GO ACTION PLAN**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Educational Services providing an update on progress regarding the application review of SEEMIS Click & Go.

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Educational Estates in elaboration and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the contents of this report and the progress made to date as detailed within the action plan.

### **ANNUAL HEALTH AND SAFETY REPORT**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive advising of the Council's health and safety performance for the period April 2009 – March 2010.

After discussion and having heard the Section Head, Risk Management in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the contents of the annual report and the health and safety improvements made as outlined therein.

### **SICKNESS ABSENCE REPORTING – QUARTER 1 (2010/2011)**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services advising on the levels of employee sickness absence for the first Quarter 2010/2011 (April, May and June 2010).

After discussion and having heard the Chief Executive in elaboration and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the contents of this report; and
- (2) to note that new targets would be set for sickness absence when Audit Scotland published all Scottish local authority sickness absence figures for 2009/2010.

### **CORPORATE COMPLAINTS SYSTEM – STATISTICS FROM 2009/10**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive providing information on corporate complaints received for the period April 2009 to March 2010.

After discussion and having heard the Chief Executive and the Manager of Quality in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the contents of this report.

### **KEY CORPORATE PERFORMANCE INDICATORS FOR THE YEAR 2009/10**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive reviewing the performance of the Key Corporate Performance Indicators for 2009/10.

It was noted that an erratum sheet had been issued in advance of the meeting which corrected errors in the reported 2009/10 annual value for three of the Statutory Performance Indicators (SPIs).

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Risk & Performance and the Chief Executive in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to approve the use of the SPI 1 and SPI 2 measures as the basis for a 2009/10 Public Performance Report – which was due to be published by the end of September 2010; and
- (2) that the poorly performing SPIs for 2009/10 (listed in Appendices 2A & 2B), the poorly performing locally derived measures for 2009/10 (listed in Appendix 3a) and Performance Indicator 'RL1v: Overall percentage of road network that should be considered for maintenance treatment' under the heading 'SP2-Service Performance 10-Roads & Lighting' (Appendix 1 refers), be the subject of a further report to the relevant Service Committees in order to enable corrective Action Plans to be drawn up.

### **KEY CORPORATE PERFORMANCE INDICATORS FOR QUARTER 1: 2010/11**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive reviewing the performance of the Key Corporate Performance Indicators for 2010/11, quarter 1.

It was noted that an erratum sheet had been issued in advance of the meeting which corrected errors in the reported quarter 1 value for 2010/11 for two of the Statutory Performance Indicators (SPIs).

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Risk & Performance in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the changes made by Social Work and Health to the local measures included in SPI 1 and SPI 2; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

### **PROGRESS OF ACTION PLANS FOR THE REVENUE BUDGET PROPOSALS**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive presenting an update in relation to the action plans drawn up from the Revenue Budgets proposals agreed by Council in February 2008, February 2009 and January 2010.

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Risk & Performance in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that Members be encouraged to assist in the process of rationalisation of action plans by engaging in the planned Corporate and Departmental consultation for 2011/12; and
- (2) that the information contained in this report would be consolidated into one report in future in order to give greater focus and scrutiny on actions that were still outstanding.

### **CORPORATE PLAN 2009/13 – PROGRESS IN 2009/10**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive setting out the Council's progress in meeting the corporate objectives in the first year of the Corporate Plan 2009/13, which is 2009/10.

After discussion and having heard the Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning, the Committee agreed that the contents of this report be approved for publication in other formats for a range of audiences.

### **INTERNAL AUDIT ANNUAL REPORT TO 31 MARCH 2010**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive:-

- (a) advising of the work undertaken by Internal Audit in respect of the Annual Audit Plan 2009/10; and

- (b) advising of the contents of the Assurance Statement given to the Executive Director of Corporate Services in support of the Statement of Internal Financial Control.

Having heard the Section Head (Operations), the Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

### **INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN 2010/11**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive advising of the planned programme of work for the Internal Audit Section for the year 2010/11.

The Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

### **INTERNAL AUDIT ACTION PLANS ISSUED DURING THE PERIOD FROM 15 MARCH TO 14 JULY 2010 AND REVIEW OF PROGRESS IN ACTIONING RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED WITHIN INTERNAL AUDIT AND EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORTS**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive:-

- (a) presenting the Internal Audit Section action plans issued to directorates during the period from 15 March to 14 July 2010; and
- (b) advising of the progress being made in actioning recommendations contained within key Internal Audit and External Audit reports which management have committed to implementing.

After discussion and having heard the Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the contents of this report.

### **INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS REPORT TO 30 JUNE 2010**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive advising of the work undertaken by the Internal Audit Section against the Audit Plan 2010/11.

Having heard the Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning, the Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

### **ACTIVITY ON WHISTLEBLOWING HOTLINE TO 31 MARCH 2010**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive advising of the level of activity on the whistleblowing hotline to 31 March 2010, which had initially been prepared for the inquorate meeting of the Committee on 9 June 2010.

The Committee agreed to note the contents of this report.

### **ACTIVITY ON WHISTLEBLOWING HOTLINE TO 30 JUNE 2010**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive advising of the level of activity on the whistleblowing hotline to 30 June 2010.

After discussion and having heard the Chief Executive in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that, in view of the concerns expressed by Members on a particular case outlined in Appendix A to the report, a report be prepared for consideration at a future meeting of the Joint Consultative Forum which would give further information on the stage at which disciplinary action takes place in relation to an ongoing investigation following a whistleblowing complaint; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

The meeting closed at 11.40 a.m.