

## **WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL**

At the Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held in the Council Chambers, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton on Wednesday, 28 October 2009 at 6.00 p.m.

**Present:** Provost Denis Agnew and Councillors Jim Brown, Geoff Calvert, Gail Casey, Jim Finn, William Hendrie, Douglas McAllister, David McBride, Jonathan McColl, Ronnie McColl, Jim McElhill, Patrick McGlinchey, Craig McLaughlin, Willie McLaughlin, Marie McNair, John Millar, Iain Robertson, Martin Rooney and May Smillie.

**Attending:** David McMillan, Chief Executive; Bill Clark, Executive Director of Social Work and Health; Joyce White, Executive Director of Corporate Services; Elaine Melrose, Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development; Terry Lanagan, Executive Director of Educational Services; David Connell, Head of Finance and ICT; Liz Cochrane, Head of Service, Policy & Performance; Tricia O'Neill, Head of Human Resources and Organisational Development; Anne Ritchie, Head of Service, (Children and Families and Criminal Justice); Patricia Marshall, Manager of ICT; Andrew Fraser, Head of Legal, Administrative and Regulatory Services and George Hawthorn, Senior Administrative Officer.

**Apologies:** Apologies for absence were intimated on behalf of Councillors George Black, Margaret Bootland and James Bollan.

### **Provost Denis Agnew in the Chair**

### **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

It was noted that there were no declarations of interest in any item of business on the agenda.

### **MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

The Minutes of Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held on Wednesday, 30 September 2009 were submitted and approved as a correct record, subject to the undernoted corrections:-

With reference to the item under the heading "Strategic Plan for the Regeneration of West Dunbartonshire Schools' Estate: Phase 2" (Page XXX refers), it was noted:-

- (a) that that the wording of the fourth paragraph on Page XXX should have read as follows:-

“At this point Councillor McNair raised the issue of consistency with the Provost and thereafter Councillor W.McLaughlin challenged the legal advice and the decision of the Provost”; and

- (b) that the words “and 3 Members abstained” be added to the wording of the vote on the Suspension of Standing Orders (Page XXX refers); and
- (c) that the vote recorded on Page XXX, should have read “12 Members voted for the amendment, none for the motion and 8 Members abstained”.

With reference to the item under the heading “Delays to traffic on A82 – Works on Erskine Bridge” (Page XXX refers), it was noted that the item should not have been recorded as the item did not appear on the agenda of the meeting”.

With reference to the item under the heading “Corporate Plan 2010 - 2014” (Page XXX refers), it was agreed that the second paragraph should have read as follows:-

“In response to a question by Councillor Rooney on the issue of targets to demonstrate continuous improvements....”

### **VARIATION IN ORDER OF BUSINESS**

Following discussion, the Council agreed to vary the order of business as hereinafter minuted in order to allow the open forum question to be asked by Ms Bolton in person, if she arrived later in the meeting.

### **RETIRAL OF MR WILLIAM CLARK, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF SOCIAL WORK AND HEALTH**

At this point in the meeting, Councillor J. McColl informed the Council that this would be the last meeting of the Council which Mr Clark, Executive Director of Social Work and Health would attend as he was retiring from Council service on 30 October 2009.

Councillor J. McColl thanked Mr Clark for his many years of service with the Council as a Senior Officer within the Social Work Department and latterly in his position of Executive Director of Social Work and Health. In particular, he thanked Mr Clark for all the advice and support he had received as Spokesperson for Social Work and Health. In so doing, Councillor J. McColl made reference to the high esteem with which Mr Clark was held by the Association of Directors of Social Work and other external bodies. In closing, Councillor J. McColl, on behalf of the SNP Group, wished Mr Clark a long and happy retirement and presented him with a card and a gift.

Councillor Rooney, on behalf of the Labour Group, thanked Mr Clark for all his hard work and in particular made reference to Mr Clark’s ability to attract a high level of additional partnership funding to the benefit of the most vulnerable people of West

Dunbartonshire. Thereafter, Councillor Casey, on behalf of the Labour Group, presented Mr Clark with a card and gift.

Thereafter Councillor R. McColl, in his capacity as COSLA Spokesperson for Health and Wellbeing and Councillor Robertson, as Leader of the Council, gave their personal thanks to Mr Clark for all his advice and support which had assisted them to carry out their duties.

In response Mr Clark thanked all elected members for their kind words and support. He informed the Council that it had been a privilege to serve as Executive Director of Social Work and Health and took the opportunity to thank all elected members, the Corporate Management Team, social work staff and in particular Anne Ritchie, Head of Service (Operations) for their hard work and support during his time in West Dunbartonshire. In closing, he expressed his best wishes to the Council for the future.

Provost Agnew, on behalf of all elected members and staff, wished Mr Clark a very long and happy retirement.

#### **MINUTES OF THE AUDIT AND PERFORMANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE ON 23 SEPTEMBER 2009**

The Minutes of the Special Meeting of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held on 23 September 2009 were submitted and all decisions contained therein were approved.

#### **MINUTES OF THE JOINT CONSULTATIVE FORUM ON 24 SEPTEMBER 2009**

The Minutes of the Meeting of the Joint Consultative Forum held on 24 September 2009 and all decisions contained therein were approved.

#### **NEW MOBILE PHONE CONTRACT**

With reference to the Minutes of Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held on 24 June 2009 (Page 2038 refers), a report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services providing the Council with an update on the procurement of a new mobile phone contract for West Dunbartonshire Council.

Councillor Robertson, seconded by Councillor R. McColl, moved:-

That the recommendations of the report are approved (as follows):-

The Council agrees:-

- (1) to instigate negotiations with Supplier D, T-Mobile with a view to awarding a contract;

- (2) to note that the new contract would commence in March 2010 for a period of two years;
- (3) to note the implementation of a new WDC Blackberry solution and its inclusion in a new mobile phone contract;
- (4) to note the rental costings of new connections:-  
  
Blackberry £13.00 per month  
Mobile phone £2.50 per month (previously charged at £3 on old contract); and
- (5) to note that, as the decision was taken by Council, it would not be necessary to remit this decision to the Tendering Committee.

At this point Councillor Calvert moved an amendment. Following discussion, the Head of Legal, Administrative and Regulatory Services confirmed that the amendment was legally competent. Provost Agnew informed the Council that he accepted the legal advice and ruled that he was willing to accept the amendment, if seconded.

At this point the Chief Executive, the Executive Director of Corporate Services and the Manager of ICT were heard in answer to Members' questions. Councillor Calvert then withdrew his amendment prior to it being seconded.

Following discussion, the Council agreed:-

- (1) to approve the recommendations of the report, as shown above; and
- (2) to note that Councillor Calvert could be issued with a Vodaphone mobile phone in place of his existing mobile phone.

### **DEVELOPING THE NEW BEST VALUE IMPROVEMENT PLAN**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive updating the Council on further progress towards developing a Best Value Improvement Plan.

Following discussion and having heard the Chief Executive in answer to Members' questions, the Council agreed:-

- (1) to review the progress of developing governance arrangements; and
- (2) to note that the next meeting of the Improvement and Efficiency Executive in November would review the detailed Improvement Plan before being submitted to Council at the end of November 2009.

## OPEN FORUM

The following question was submitted to the Council for consideration:-

### **Ms Gillian Bolton (Parent Carer on behalf of Have Your Say) – Service User/Parent Carer Involvement on Children with Disability Strategy Group**

I am writing on behalf of “Have Your Say”; a network of parents and carers of children who have a disability within West Dunbartonshire.

Why is the Social Work Department’s Children with Disability Strategy Group the only Strategy Group which has no service user or parent carer involvement?

Parents did meet (until May 2008) with senior managers in the Parent’s Forum. However we have never had involvement at the Strategy Group level in spite of asking for this.

The Council’s Social Work and Health Improvement Partnership has 10 Strategy Groups which represent all care groups which the Council works with. All of these, except Children with Disability have user representation.

### **Councillor Jonathan McColl responded in the following terms:-**

The assertion that ‘Children with Disabilities’ is the only strategy group not to have parental representation is very misleading.

None of the other strategy groups have parental involvement, including, Child Protection, Young People who Offend, Children in Need, Mental Health and Well-Being, Looked After and Accommodated Children and Young People Affected by Domestic Abuse.

Parental involvement has been attempted in the Children with Disabilities Strategy Group, but the numbers of parents attending dwindled as the group lost its strategic focus.

Given the diverse nature of the clients involved, it was too difficult for parents on the group to represent the wider client group and parents instead tended to move the conversation away from a strategic discussion to a personal discussion about their individual circumstances; the sort of thing they should have been raising with Social Work themselves.

Consultation and involvement of not just parents, but also the children themselves takes place on a regular basis in varying formats and this has been found to be a more constructive way of engaging and allowing parents and children to influence policy and service delivery at a strategic level.

This approach has been recognised by both the Social Work Inspection Agency and Her Majesty’s Inspectors of Education as a good way of working, and I believe it to be crucial, that we continue to involve the wider children and parent community, rather than limiting involvement to a very small number of parents.

**Ms Bolton asked the following question:-**

The meetings in the past were well attended but attendance fell away as we were not involved in decision making or strategy. I feel it is important that parents are involved at a strategic level as we know what services our children need. Will the Council consider this?

**Councillor J. McColl responded in the following terms:-**

I will take your comments on board. The issue of parent and child engagement is very serious. I can confirm that discussions are ongoing around the formation of a broad based parental involvement forum and I will write to you with a fuller response in due course.

**£7 MINIMUM LIVING WAGE**

With reference to the Minutes of Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held on 29 April 2009 (Page 1139 refers), a report was submitted by the Chief Executive on the possibility of adopting a £7 per hour minimum wage policy.

Councillor Robertson, seconded by Councillor R. McColl, moved:-

That the recommendation of the report be approved as follows:-

The Council agrees that no alterations be made in relation to the current pay and grading structure and that Grade 1 remains at £6.32 - £6.92.

As an amendment, Councillor McBride, seconded by Councillor McGlinchey, moved:-

This Council supports the £7 per hour Living Wage Campaign. We note that Glasgow City Council successfully introduced the £7 per hour minimum wage by advancing all staff currently on Grade 1 to the top point of the pay scale. We further note this action neither compromised nor had a detrimental effect on either Equal Pay or Single Status issues.

Bearing in mind that the cost of implementing this policy would be approximately £140,000 per year, the Council therefore gives a commitment to work towards implementing the £7 per hour living wage by advancing Grade 1 staff to the top point by 1 Apr 2010.

All Executive Directors are therefore instructed to calculate and build in this policy in their departmental budget submissions for the 2010/11 budget.

In response to a question by Councillor McBride, the Head of Legal, Administrative and Regulatory Services confirmed that the amendment was legally competent i.e. not contrary to law.

The Chief Executive and the Head of Human Resources and Organisational Development were heard in answer to Members' questions.

Following the debate, at the request of Councillor Rooney, the Council agreed to proceed by way of a roll call vote.

On a vote being taken, 7 Members, namely Councillors Calvert, Casey, McAllister, McBride, McGlinchey, Millar and Rooney voted for the amendment and 12 Members, namely Provost Agnew, Councillors Brown, Finn, Hendrie, J. McColl, R. McColl, J. McElhill, C. McLaughlin, W. McLaughlin, McNair, Robertson and Smillie voted for the motion which was accordingly declared to be carried.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

After hearing Provost Agnew, the Council agreed to adjourn for a short period of time.

The meeting reconvened at 7.50 p.m. with all those Members shown on the sederunt in attendance.

### **FINANCIAL STATEMENTS 2008/2009**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services asking the Council to consider the Financial Statements for 2008/2009.

The Council agreed to note the financial statements for the year to 31 March 2009.

### **GENERAL SERVICES REVENUE BUDGETARY CONTROL REPORT – PERIOD 5 (2009/10)**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services advising the Council of the performance of the General Services Revenue Budget for the period to 15 September 2009.

Councillor C. McLaughlin, seconded by Councillor J. McColl, moved:-

That the recommendations of the report be approved (as follows):-

- (1) to note that the report identified an adverse variance against budget of £0.404m but did not take account of the spending freeze saving of £1m agreed by the Corporate Management Team; and
- (2) to endorse the decision taken by the Corporate Management Team to freeze the filling of non-essential spending on goods, services and vacancies to bring the budget into line within the current financial year.

As an amendment, Councillor Rooney, seconded by Councillor McBride, moved:-

This Council notes that the SNP budget has resulted in the reserve position being reduced by £2.019m during the last financial year and Council is now left with prudential reserves of £258,000 for the financial year 2009/10.

Council also notes the adverse variance of £404,000 at 15 September identified in Executive Director of Corporate Services Report.

Council further notes that the freeze on the filling of vacancies and a freeze on non-essential spending on goods and services agreed by the CMT on 4 September will save £1m across departmental budgets.

This Council accepts that the current financial situation justifies the urgent CMT action as a consequence of the incompetence of the SNP administrations budget. However Council calls for a further report to the November meeting identifying the specific reductions in departmental budgets and any impact on service users.

The Chief Executive and the Head of Finance were heard in answer to Members' questions.

During the debate, several points of order were raised concerning Members asking questions. Provost Agnew informed the Council that Standing Order No. 12 (a) referred to the right for questions to be asked prior to the debate and that Standing Order Nos. 20 (d) and (j) referred to during the debate.

On a vote being taken, 7 Members voted for the amendment and 12 for the motion which was accordingly declared to be carried.

#### **GENERAL SERVICES CAPITAL BUDGETARY CONTROL REPORT – PERIOD 5 (2009/10)**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services providing the Council with an update on the General Services Capital Plan 2009/2010 for the period to 15 September 2009.

The Council approved the updated capital plan and noted the position to date as outlined in Appendices I and II of the report.



## **BUDGET 2010/11 – PROPOSED OUTLINE TIMESCALE**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services seeking Council approval for the preferred date for setting the 2010/11 Council Tax and Council Housing Rents.

Councillor C. McLaughlin, seconded by Councillor R. McColl, moved:-

That the proposed date for setting the 2010/11 budget for both Council Tax and Housing Rents be set at 28 January 2010 and the timetable adjusted accordingly, subject to the final settlement information being received in sufficient time to allow officers to prepare the necessary paperwork.

As an amendment, Councillor McBride, seconded by Councillor Calvert, moved:-

That the proposed date for setting the 2010/11 budget for both Council Tax and Housing Rents be set at 11 February 2009, due to the uncertainty over availability of the final settlement information. The Council can consider an earlier date for future years' budget meetings together with appropriate timescales.

On a vote being taken, 8 Members voted for the amendment and 11 for the motion which was accordingly declared to be carried.

## **REVIEW OF SALES, FEES AND CHARGES**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services seeking Council approval for a mid-year increase to the levels of existing sales, fees and charges and recommending the introduction of some additional charges on new income streams.

Councillor Robertson, seconded by Councillor R. McColl, moved:-

That the issue of sales, fees and charges be continued to the meeting of Council in November 2009 to allow Members more time to consider the proposals.

As an amendment, Councillor McBride, seconded by Councillor McAllister, moved:-

This Council calls on the SNP Government to fund West Dunbartonshire Council adequately, particularly in relation to funding their election manifesto commitments e.g. Council Tax freeze, free school meals for primary 1 to 3 children, lower class sizes and police numbers.

The SNP West Dunbartonshire Council budget, based on the inadequate budget settlement agreed in Feb 09 is clearly unable to meet these commitments.

This Council agrees that West Dunbartonshire's most vulnerable residents should not subsidise SNP non funded election commitments.

Therefore this Council agrees no action is taken to increase charges to the young, elderly and disabled and calls on the Leader of the Council to lobby the SNP Government for them to fund their election commitments.

During the debate the Head of Legal, Administrative and Regulatory Services was heard in further explanation of Standing Order Nos. 12 (a) and 20 (j).

On a vote being taken, 7 Members voted for the amendment and 12 for the motion which was accordingly declared carried.

### **HOUSING REVENUE ACCOUNTS 2009/2010 BUDGETARY CONTROL STATEMENTS TO 15 SEPTEMBER 2009 (PERIOD 5)**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development providing the Council with an update on the financial performance of the Housing Revenue Account (HRA) to the period ending 15 September 2009.

The Council agreed to note the contents of the report.

### **HRA CAPITAL PROGRAMME 2009/2010 BUDGETARY CONTROL REPORT TO 15 SEPTEMBER 2009 (PERIOD 5)**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development advising the Council of progress of the HRA Capital Programme 2009/2010.

The Council agreed to note the contents of the report.

### **NHS INTEGRATION PROPOSALS**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive seeking the Council's approval, in principle, to commit to a new level of partnership and integration with the NHS. The goal would be the development of a local integrated partnership model for the strategic planning and delivery of local authority and community health services within a new combined Council/NHS structure, with particular emphasis on the integration of community based health and social work services through a single management team.

Councillor R. McColl, seconded by Councillor J. McColl, moved;-

That Council approves the recommendation of the report (as follows):-

The Council agrees to ask the Chief Executive to meet with the Chief Executive of Greater Glasgow and Clyde NHS Board to consider proposals for integration; and to invite the Chair of the Board to meet with senior elected members to consider these proposals, providing regular reports on progress to Council.

The Chief Executive and Head of Legal, Administrative and Regulatory Services were heard in answer to Members' questions. It was clarified that if the above motion was approved the Council was not committed to further integration with the NHS.

Following discussion, as an amendment, Councillor Casey, seconded by Councillor McGlinchey, moved:-

Council believes that a full time dedicated Council-employed, Corporate Executive Director of Social Work and Health is the best option for the Council in line with the statement in paragraph 9.2 of the report.

This Council agrees to take no further action on the proposals for NHS Integration outlined in the report at this time.

The Council agreed to proceed by way of a roll call vote.

On a vote being taken, 7 Members, namely Councillors Calvert, Casey, McAllister, McBride, McGlinchey, Millar and Rooney voted for the amendment and 11 Members, namely Provost Agnew, Councillors Brown, Finn, Hendrie, J. McColl, R. McColl, J. McElhill, C. McLaughlin, McNair, Robertson and Smillie voted for the motion and 1 member abstained, namely Councillor W. McLaughlin.

The motion was accordingly declared carried.

At this point Provost Agnew informed the Council that as it was after 10.00 p.m., in terms of the Standing Order No 6 (c), the Council should adjourn and reconvene on the following day in the same venue to consider all business which had not been completed before the meeting was brought to an end. However, he pointed out that given that there was only one item remaining on the agenda the Council might wish to consider suspending Standing Orders (requires two-third majority of those present and voting) to allow the business to be concluded.

Councillor Rooney, seconded by Councillor McGlinchey, moved:-

That the Council agrees to suspend Standing Order No 6 (c) to allow the Council to conclude all business tonight.

On a vote being taken, 11 Members voted for the suspension of Standing Orders and 8 against. Accordingly, Standing Orders were not suspended as two-thirds of those present and voting did not vote in favour of the motion.

## ADJOURNMENT

In terms of Standing Order No 6 (c), the Council adjourned until 10.00 a.m. the following day.

The meeting adjourned at 10.20 p.m.

## RECONVENED MEETING

The Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council was reconvened in the Council Chambers, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton, on Thursday 29 October 2009 at 10.00 a.m.

**Present:** Provost Denis Agnew and Councillors Jim Brown, Geoff Calvert, Jim Finn, William Hendrie, Jonathan McColl, Ronnie McColl, Craig McLaughlin, Marie McNair, Iain Robertson and May Smillie.

**Attending:** David McMillan, Chief Executive; Bill Clark, Executive Director of Social Work and Health; Joyce White, Executive Director of Corporate Services; Elaine Melrose, Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development; Terry Lanagan, Head of Educational Services; Andrew Fraser, Head of Legal, Administrative and Regulatory Services and George Hawthorn, Senior Administrative Officer.

**Apologies:** Apologies for absence were intimated on behalf of Councillors George Black, Margaret Bootland, James Bolland, Gail Casey, Douglas McAllister, David McBride, Jim McElhill, Patrick McGlinchey, Willie McLaughlin, John Millar and Martin Rooney.

## QUESTIONS

### **Questions by Councillor Patrick McGlinchey to the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee**

In the absence of Councillor McGlinchey, the following questions (with the exception of Question (g)) were asked by Councillor Calvert.

#### **Question (a)**

Can the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee give a detailed timescale for consultation with parents of Edinbarnet Primary?

**Reply by Councillor Smillie:-**

A public consultation meeting will take place in Edinbarnet Primary on the evening of Wednesday 18 November 2009.

Views expressed at the meeting will be noted. Questionnaires will also be issued at the meeting for immediate return or for submission by post by Wednesday 25 November 2009.

**Question (b)**

Can the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee give a detailed timescale for consultation with parents of St Joseph's Primary?

**Reply by Councillor Smillie:-**

A public consultation meeting will take place in St Joseph's Primary on the evening of Monday 30 November 2009.

Views expressed at the meeting will be noted. Questionnaires will also be issued at the meeting for immediate return or for submission by post by Monday 7 December 2009.

**Question (c)**

Can the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee give a detailed timescale for consultation with parents of St Martin's Primary?

**Reply by Councillor Smillie:-**

A public consultation meeting will take place in St Martin's Primary on the evening of Tuesday 10 November 2009.

Views expressed at the meeting will be noted. Questionnaires will also be issued at the meeting for immediate return or for submission by post by Tuesday 17 November 2009.

**Question (d)**

Can the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee give a detailed timescale for consultation with parents of Vale of Leven Nursery?

**Reply by Councillor Smillie:-**

Parents of children at Vale of Leven Early Education and Childcare Centre will be part of the public consultation meeting in St Martin's Primary on Tuesday 10 November 2009.

**Question (e)**

Can the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee give a detailed timescale for consultation with parents of Renton Nursery?

**Reply by Councillor Smillie:-**

Parents of children at Renton Early Education and Childcare Centre will be part of the public consultation meeting in St Martin's Primary on Tuesday 10 November 2009.

A report on the results of all the consultations I have outlined will be presented to the December Council meeting or to the January meeting, if the results cannot be collated in time for the December meeting.

**Question (f)**

Can the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee explain how the Council plans to improve upon the previous consultations with these schools, and how this set of consultations will be different?

**Reply by Councillor Smillie:-**

As Councillors McGlinchey and Calvert should be aware, Council itself determined the nature of these meetings.

They will focus on the officers' proposals as outlined in the Report to Council on 30 September 2009. This consultation is not meant to be better than the original consultation process which everyone except the Labour Party agrees was the most open and constructive consultation process ever undertaken by West Dunbartonshire Council.

Had Councillors McGlinchey and Calvert attended all the previous consultation meetings – as I did – and were they to attend all of the forthcoming meetings – as I will - then they would be in a better position to express an informed opinion of the relative merits of the two sets of meetings.

Since they did not attend the first set of meetings, Councillors McGlinchey and Calvert have missed a personal development opportunity on the merits of real community consultation.

Also, Labour's withdrawal from the Working Group before the first set of meetings began meant that Councillor McGlinchey and his colleagues forfeited their opportunity to influence the format of those meetings and in my opinion, they have failed in their duty to represent the communities that elected them.

Incidentally, had Councillor McGlinchey remained on the Working Group, or even read the minutes, he would already have known the answers to all these questions and I would not have had to waste Council's time telling Cllrs McGlinchey and Calvert what genuinely interested Members already know.

**Question (g)**

Can the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee confirm that this set of consultation will not be done in clusters and that each school will be consulted with individually?

Note: Councillor Calvert indicated that given Councillor Smillie's response to previous questions, a reply was not required.

**Question (h)**

Can the Convener of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee explain to the parents of Jamestown, Ladyton, Highdykes, St. Ronans, St. Kessogs, and Haldane Primary why they will not be part of the upcoming consultations?

**Reply by Councillor Smillie:-**

Councillors McGlinchey and Calvert have saved their most inane question until last.

I can only assume they missed the decision of the September Council meeting when Council voted to approve the terms of the officers' report, with the exception of those relating to St Martin's Primary and the proposed co-location in Faifley?

The parents of Jamestown, Ladyton, Highdykes, St Ronan's, St Kessog's and Haldane are in exactly the same position as the parents of every other school in West Dunbartonshire.

They have already been informally consulted, not once but twice over the last year, and they will be involved in statutory consultation in the future, if changes to the status or location of their schools are proposed.

The meeting closed at 10.10 a.m.