

## **AUDIT & PERFORMANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

At a Meeting of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held in Meeting Room 3, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton on Wednesday, 9 December 2009 at 10.00 a.m.

**Present:** Councillors George Black, Jim Brown, Geoff Calvert, Jonathan McColl, Craig McLaughlin, John Millar and Martin Rooney and Mr Francis McNeil, Representative, Community Councils.

**Attending:** Joyce White, Executive Director of Corporate Services; Gillian McNeilly, Manager of Accounting; Lorraine Coyne, Manager of Audit; Colin McDougall, Section Head, Internal Audit; Joe Gillespie, Section Head (Operations); David Webster, Performance and Improvement Manager; Patricia Marshall, Manager of ICT; Stephen McGonagle, Manager of Repairs and Maintenance; Martin Feeney, Section Head, Housing Maintenance (Clydebank); Dave Clarke, Head of Service (Resources), Educational Services Department; Craig Jardine, Manager of Educational Estates and Craig Stewart, Committee Officer, Legal, Administrative and Regulatory Services.

**Also**

**Attending:** Grant Macrae (Director) and Keith Macpherson (Manager), KPMG LLP.

**Apologies:** Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf of Councillor Margaret Bootland, Mr John Corcoran, Representative, Business Community and Hugh O'Donnell, Representative, Tenants and Residents Groups.

**Councillor Martin Rooney in the Chair**

### **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

It was noted that there were no declarations of interest in any of the items of business on the agenda.

### **MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

The Minutes of Meeting of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held on 23 September 2009 were submitted and approved as a correct record.

## **SYSTEMS REVIEW STORES – BAR CODING**

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development providing further information on the bar coding system purchased by the Council for use within stores and the controls and safeguards in place for stock taking.

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Repairs and Maintenance in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that a report be prepared for consideration at a future meeting of the Housing, Environment and Economic Development Committee on the cost/benefit analysis of procurement of a brand new system as compared to upgrading of the existing system; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

## **DEVELOPING AND MONITORING OF ACTION PLANS FOR THE REVENUE BUDGET PROPOSALS**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive providing an update on progress on the action plans drawn up from the Revenue Budgets proposals agreed by Council in February 2008 and February 2009.

After discussion and having heard the Performance and Improvement Manager and the Executive Director of Corporate Services in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that any actions that were giving rise to concern, in terms of their timescale for completion etc., be submitted to the relevant Service Committees for further consideration;
- (2) that action plan arising from (1) above should be submitted to this Committee for an overview; and
- (3) that in future this report should be submitted on an exception basis and therefore should only include actions that required attention and/or further action.

## **STATUTORY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive providing an update on the performance of the Statutory Performance Indicators deemed to be 'poorly-performing'.

After discussion and having heard the Performance and Improvement Manager in elaboration and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that in future this report should be submitted on an exception basis to the relevant Service Committees in order to enable an action plan to be drawn up; and
- (2) that any action plan would then be sent to this Committee in order that it could take a monitoring role.

### **SINGLE OUTCOME AGREEMENT – PROGRESS REPORT**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive providing a progress report on the Single Outcome Agreement.

After discussion and having heard the Performance and Improvement Manager and the Executive Director of Corporate Services, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note that the Executive Director of Corporate Services would contact the Community Planning Executive Group to ascertain whether an Action Plan, in respect of some of the performance aspects of community planning, had been drawn up; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

NOTE: Councillor McColl left the meeting during consideration of the above item.

### **CORPORATE COMPLAINTS SYSTEM – STATISTICS FROM 2008/09 AND FUTURE DEVELOPMENT**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive providing an update on corporate complaints received in 2008/09 and an update on the development of a new complaints process and system.

After discussion and having heard the Executive Director of Corporate Services and the Manager of ICT in elaboration and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note that the Executive Director of Corporate Services would email Members of the Committee in order to clarify the statement contained in paragraph 3.2 of the report (bullet point 5) concerning correspondence "issued from Housing Allocations relating to any individual who do not reside at property in question";
- (2) that a Briefing Note would be issued to Members which would provide more comprehensive information with regard to upgrading the corporate complaints system; and
- (3) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

## **CORPORATE PLAN 2009/13 – MID YEAR REVIEW**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive setting out progress against the Corporate Plan 2009/13 objectives in the first six months of 2009/10, that is, from 1 April to 30 September 2009.

After discussion and having heard the Performance and Improvement Manager in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to request that the Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development prepare a report for consideration at a future meeting of the Housing, Environment and Economic Development Committee providing further information in respect of Objective (CP9-13) concerning the number of reported incidents of fly tipping; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

## **INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS REPORT TO 30 SEPTEMBER 2009**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive advising of the work undertaken by the Internal Audit Section against the Audit Plan 2009/2010.

Having heard the Manager of Audit in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the report.

## **ACTIVITY ON WHISTLEBLOWING HOTLINE TO 30 SEPTEMBER 2009**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive advising of the level of activity on the whistleblowing hotline.

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Audit in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

## **SCRUTINY TRAINING FOR COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive providing an update on progress of scrutiny training for Elected and Lay Members of Committees.

After discussion and having heard the Improvement and Performance Manager in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that Members be encouraged to support the process by completion of the training needs questionnaire; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

## **VARIATION OF ORDER OF BUSINESS**

After hearing the Chair, Councillor Rooney, the Committee agreed to vary the Order of Business as hereinafter recorded.

### **KPMG LLP – 2008/09 AUDIT – FINAL REPORT TO MEMBERS**

With reference to the Minutes of Meeting of Council held on 25 November 2009 (Page XXX refers), a report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services advising the Committee of the findings in relation to KPMG LLP's Final Report to Members for the completion of their 2008/2009 Audit.

After discussion and having heard Mr. Macrae, Director, KPMG LLP and the Executive Director of Corporate Services in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the findings of the 2008/09 audit as detailed in Audit Scotland's report to Members, attached as an appendix to the report;
- (2) that a Briefing Note be prepared for Members on some of the measures that were being taken by the Corporate Management Team to deal with sickness and absence; and
- (3) to note that the Council had received an unqualified audit opinion on the accounts for 2008/09.

NOTE: Councillor Millar left the meeting during consideration of the above item.

## **EXCLUSION OF PRESS AND PUBLIC**

The Committee approved the following resolution:-

"That under Section 50A (4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act, 1973 the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it may involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 14 of Part 1 of Schedule 7A of the Act".

### **INTERNAL AUDIT ACTION PLANS ISSUED DURING THE PERIOD FROM 1 SEPTEMBER 2009 TO 31 OCTOBER 2009**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive presenting the Internal Audit Section action plans issued to directorates during the months of September and October 2009.

After discussion and having heard the Manager of Audit and relevant officers in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) that a further report on the SEEMIS Click & Go (integrated school management system) be submitted to the next meeting of the Committee in relation to the concerns outlined in the report and expressed by Members on the adequacy of the system; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

### **COMPLIMENTS OF THE SEASON**

Councillor Rooney, Chair, wished everyone a Merry Christmas and a Happy New Year.

The meeting closed at 12.26 p.m.