

## WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

### Report by Acting Executive Director of Housing, Environment and Economic Development (Housing and Regeneration Services)

Tendering Committee: 5 September 2007

---

**Subject: Tender for the Supply and Delivery of PVCu Doors, Windows and Screens**

#### **1. Purpose**

**1.1** This report seeks Committee approval to award a contract for the supply and delivery of PVCu doors, windows and screens.

#### **2. Background**

**2.1** A report was submitted to the Tendering Committee on 28 February 2007, seeking approval for the initiation of an open tendering route for the supply and delivery of PVCu doors, windows and screens.

**2.2** The Committee agreed to approve this route subject to:-

(a) the two year option to extend the contract being considered and determined at a future meeting of the Tendering Committee; and

(b) legal advice being obtained in respect of whether the contract could be weighted in favour of local companies.

**2.3** Legal advice was sought in respect of 2.2 (b) above and it was determined that it would be anti-competitive to weight the evaluation criteria in favour of local companies.

#### **3. Main Issues**

**3.1** An advert inviting tenders was placed in the Herald on Thursday 12 April 2007. Tender packs were issued by Corporate Procurement Unit to seventeen (17) companies which responded to the advert. None of these companies was located in the West Dunbartonshire Council area. On the closing date, six valid tenders were received from the following companies:

- Sash UK Limited, Barnsley, S72 7BN
- Sidey Limited, Perth, PH1 2AS
- Thermashield Insulation Limited, Stepps, G33 6EN
- Avonholm Windows Limited, Hillington Park, G52 4LT
- Andrew Wright (UPVC) Limited, Irvine, KA11 4HW
- CMS Enviro Systems Limited, Cumbernauld, G67 2TT

**3.2** The six tenders have been comprehensively evaluated on the basis of Cost (60%), Quality (25%), Financial Stability (5%), References/Experience (5%) and Value Added Services (5%). The evaluation team comprised staff from the Corporate Procurement Unit together with the Surveying Manager and Contracts Manager from the Council's Housing Maintenance Section.

**3.3** The completed evaluation matrix is attached for information at Appendix 1 from which it can be seen that Supplier 1, Avonholm Windows is the preferred bidder.

#### **4. Personnel Issues**

**4.1** Nil.

#### **5. Financial Implications**

**5.1** Part of the tender evaluation was "quality" and although Supplier 3 is the most competitive on price, they could not offer the measuring service that was required as part of the specification, therefore they were marked down on that aspect.

**5.2** The completed tender amounts matrix is attached for information at Appendix 2 from which it can be seen that Supplier 3 is the most competitive tenderer with Supplier 1, Avonholm Windows the second overall, however, when the additional criteria is evaluated (3.2 above), Supplier 1, Avonholm Windows offers the best value to the Council.

**5.3** Avonholm Windows bid prices have been compared with the prices offered by the Council's interim supplier - CMS Enviro systems Ltd. Overall, Avonholm's prices are in excess of 7% cheaper.

#### **6. Risk Analysis**

**6.1** Risk has been considered from the point of view of transferring to a new supplier giving consideration to issues such as inability to meet demand and quality of product. A meeting with Avonholm Windows has taken place to confirm their ability to meet the Council's operational requirements and to clarify certain qualitative aspects of their bid. From this meeting, we are comfortable that Avonholm are capable of meeting the Council's requirements.

## **7. Conclusions**

- 7.1** The tendering process has successfully identified a supplier which can provide the specified service at a competitive price for Council over the period of the contract.

## **8. Recommendation**

- 8.1** **The Committee is invited to consider and approve the award of this contract to Avonholm Windows for a period of three years. Any extension of this contract will be the subject of a future report to the Tendering Committee.**

**Irving Hodgson**

**Acting Executive Director of Housing, Environment  
and Economic Development (Housing and Regeneration Services)**

**Date: 30 August 2007**

---

<b>Person to Contact:</b>	Stephen McGonagle - Manager of Repairs and Maintenance, telephone: 01389 778338  Martin Feeney - Section Head, Housing Maintenance (Clydebank), telephone: 0141 562 2381
<b>Appendices:</b>	Appendix 1: Tender for Supply of PVCu Windows and Doors - Evaluation Scoring Appendix 2: Tender for Supply of PVCu Windows and Doors - Tender Amounts
<b>Background Papers:</b>	Report to Tendering Committee of 28 February 2007 entitled "Tender for the Supply and Delivery of PVCu Doors, Windows and Screens"
<b>Wards Affected:</b>	All



### Tender for Supply of PVCu Windows and Doors - Evaluation Scoring

Criteria	Supplier 1	Supplier 2	Supplier 3	Supplier 4	Supplier 5	Supplier 6
Total cost to the Council	96	93	108	78	84	48
Quality	48	44	29	47	30	47
Financial Stability	9	10	8	8	8	10
Value added services	7	6	7	10	5	5
Customer references / experience	10	10	10	10	10	10
<b>Total</b>	<b>170</b>	<b>163</b>	<b>162</b>	<b>153</b>	<b>137</b>	<b>120</b>

Appendix 2

**Tender for Supply of PVCu Windows and Doors – Tender Amounts**

	Number of Windows	Supplier 3	Supplier 1	Supplier 2	Supplier 5	Supplier 4	Supplier 6
Window Type A	70	£6,679.00	£7,987.00	£8,764.25	£8,694.00	£8,825.00	£13,012.00
Window Type B	108	£19,447.00	£23,401.00	£24,117.75	£23,606.68	£25,573.00	£32,579.00
Window Type C	63	£12,668.00	£15,252.00	£14,882.91	£15,972.00	£16,745.00	£20,927.00
Window Type D	60	£6,693.00	£8,257.00	£8,630.87	£8,972.00	£9,830.00	£12,874.00
Window Type E	84	£18,322.00	£22,684.00	£22,522.05	£25,327.00	£26,449.00	£29,136.00
Window Type F	54	£13,432.00	£16,480.00	£15,308.58	£18,386.00	£19,520.00	£20,523.00
Window Type G	60	£3,269.00	£3,798.00	£3,847.17	£4,953.00	£4,770.00	£8,382.00
Window Type H	81	£9,784.00	£11,718.00	£12,209.61	£12,309.00	£12,934.00	£17,207.00
Window Type J	90	£21,609.76	£25,049.82	£24,093.41	£28,637.66	£29,291.00	£32,257.00
Window Type K	81	£10,653.00	£12,533.00	£12,546.26	£15,294.33	£15,348.00	£19,366.00
Window Type L	117	£26,132.00	£31,221.00	£31,035.96	£35,382.00	£34,761.00	£39,848.00
Window Type Y	48	£6,284.00	£7,987.00	£8,271.39	£8,505.00	£8,942.00	£11,956.00
Window Type Z	72	£18,270.00	£22,886.00	£22,778.78	£23,876.00	£24,904.00	£28,950.00
Window Total	988	£173,242.76	£209,253.82	£209,008.99	£229,914.67	£237,892.00	£287,017.00
		<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>
	Number of Doors						
Door Screen Type SC1T	50	£7,020.00	£8,791.00	£9,577.11	£10,772.00	£10,000.00	£12,692.00
Door Screen Type SC2P	50	£7,597.00	£8,388.00	£9,164.96	£10,772.00	£12,309.00	£12,188.00
Door Screen Type SC3	180	£7,316.08	£10,195.08	£13,708.37	£13,643.08	£9,715.08	£21,426.00
Door Screen Type SC4T	180	£9,393.00	£11,640.00	£12,033.45	£13,640.00	£12,963.00	£26,112.00
Door Type Lennox	16	£4,163.00	£4,603.00	£4,699.61	£4,054.66	£5,088.00	£6,160.00
Door Type Antonine	16	£1,672.00	£2,079.00	£1,987.13	£1,832.19	£2,226.00	£2,969.00
Door Type Lomond	16	£4,247.00	£4,810.00	£4,765.21	£3,924.04	£5,200.00	£6,368.00

Door Type Clyde	16	£4,107.00	£4,683.00	£4,544.73	£4,213.48	£5,200.00	£6,256.00
Door Type Erskine	16	£3,896.00	£4,266.00	£4,259.93	£4,133.08	£5,200.00	£5,920.00
Door Type Kilpatrick	16	£4,056.00	£4,810.00	£4,480.25	£4,133.08	£5,200.00	£6,256.00
Door Type Leven	16	£4,163.00	£4,683.00	£4,627.46	£4,205.49	£5,200.00	£6,416.00
Door Total	572	£57,630.08	£68,948.08	£73,848.21	£75,323.10	£78,301.08	£112,763.00
		<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>
Grand Total	1560	£230,872.84	£278,201.90	£282,857.20	£305,237.77	£316,193.08	£399,780.00