

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

Report by Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economical Development Tendering Committee: 28 May 2008

Subject: Tender for the supply of temporary agency staff (Craft)

1. Purpose

- 1.1 This report seeks Committee approval to award a framework contract for the supply of temporary agency staff (Craft).

2. Background

- 2.1 A request was submitted to the Committee on 24 October 2007 for the initiation of an open tendering route for the supply of temporary agency staff (Craft).

- 2.2 The Committee agreed to approve this route.

3. Main Issues

- 3.1 An advert inviting tenders was placed in the Herald on 15 November 2007. Tender packs were issued by Corporate Procurement Unit to eighteen (18) companies which responded to the advert. On the closing date, nine valid tenders were received from the following companies:

- (a) ASA International Ltd, 6 Coates Crescent, Edinburgh, EH3 7AL
- (b) The Prime Group, 10 Bothwell Street, Glasgow, G2 6LU
- (c) First People Solutions Group Ltd, 33 Bothwell Street, Glasgow, G2 6NL
- (d) ABC Contract Services Ltd, 200 Bath Street, Glasgow, G2 4HG
- (e) Staffwise Plc, 34 St Enoch Square, Glasgow, G1 4DF
- (f) Brightwork Ltd, Lower Ground Floor, 209/211 St Vincent Street, Glasgow, G2 5QY
- (g) Manpower UK Ltd, Capital Court, Windsor Street, Uxbridge, Middlesex, UB8 1AB

- (h) Scotweld Employment Services Ltd, 270 Petershill Road, Glasgow, G21 4AY
- (i) Hays Construction & Property, Edbury Gate, 2nd Floor, Lower Belgrave Street, Victoria, London, SW1W 0NT

3.2 The nine valid tenders have been comprehensively evaluated on the following criteria:

- (a) Financial 75%,
- (b) Service 10%
- (c) Quality 10%
- (d) Administration 5%

3.3 The evaluation team comprised staff from the Corporate Procurement Unit together with the Surveying and Monitoring Manager from the Council's Housing Maintenance Section.

3.4 Having assessed all offers perceived risks were identified with a number of bidders. Based on the level of risk, the following suppliers have subsequently not been considered on the framework for the following reasons:

(a) Manpower – The supplier does not hold the required level of Professional Indemnity and Third Party/Public Liability insurance per the tender document and are unwilling to increase if successful. Manpower has also qualified their offer and a number of the qualifications are unacceptable. The supplier was given the opportunity to remove the qualifications that were unacceptable and were unable to do so.

(b) Scotweld – The supplier does not hold the required level of Professional Indemnity insurance per the tender document and are unwilling to increase if successful.

(c) ABC Contract Services - ABC have qualified their offer and a number of the qualifications are unacceptable. The supplier was given the opportunity to remove the qualifications that were unacceptable and were unable to do so; the supplier further qualified their offer at this stage.

3.5 The completed evaluation matrix is attached for information at Appendix 1 from which it can be seen that Suppliers 2, 4, 5, 6, 7 & 9 are the preferred bidders.

4. Personnel Issues

- 4.1** The use of agency staff will not impact on Housing Maintenance Trading Operation's core workforce and this will enable flexibility in available resources to meet demand and ensure service provision is maintained.

5. Financial Implications

- 5.1** The completed tender cost matrix is attached for information at Appendix 2 which details the prices offered from each supplier and the score achieved.
- 5.2** The tender costs will be met from the existing budget within Housing Maintenance Trading Account.

6. Risk Analysis

- 6.1** Failure to award this contract is regarded as a risk to providing a flexible service to meet peaks of demand.

7. Conclusions

- 7.1** The tendering process has successfully identified six suppliers which can provide the overall best service at a competitive price for Council over the period of the framework.

8. Recommendations

- 8.1** **The Committee is invited to consider and approve the award of this framework to Suppliers 2, 4, 5, 6, 7 & 9 for a period of one year with the option to extend for two further periods of 12 months. Any extension of this contract will be the subject of a future report to the Tendering Committee.**

Elaine Melrose
Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economical Development

Date: 20 May 2008

Person to Contact: Stephen McGonagle – Manager of Repairs and Maintenance,
Housing Repairs, Overburn Avenue, Dumbarton. G82 2RL
Telephone Number: 01389 608338
E-mail address: Stephen.McGonagle@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Martin Feeney – Section Head, Housing Maintenance, Clydebank,
Housing Repairs, 57 Cochno Street, Clydebank, G81 1RQ.
Telephone Number: 0141 562 2381
E-mail address: Martin.Feeney@west-dunbarton.gov.uk

Appendices: Appendix 1: Tender for the supply of Temporary Agency Staff
(Craft) Evaluation Scoring

Appendix 2: Tender for the supply of Temporary Agency Staff
(Craft)
Financial Evaluation

Background: Request to the Committee on 24 October 2007 entitled “Tender for
the Supply of Temporary Agency Staff”

Wards Affected: All

**Appendix 1
Evaluation Scoring**

Award Criteria 1a		Supplier 1	Supplier 2	Supplier 3	Supplier 4a	Supplier 4b	Supplier 5	Supplier 6	Supplier 7	Supplier 8	Supplier 9
1. Financial - 70%					Min price	Max price					
LOT 1a - Painter & Decorator	70%	59.06	58.56	69.15	62.58	57.25	70.00	55.40	69.13	61.09	66.16
LOT 1 - TOTAL SCORE		78.61	76.41	92.51	86.36	81.03	91.79	73.44	90.25	84.67	89.73
LOT 2a - Bricklayer	70%	53.42	62.52	48.61	70.00	60.06	62.70	59.28	69.48	62.64	67.80
LOT 2 - TOTAL SCORE		72.97	80.37	71.98	93.78	83.84	84.49	77.32	90.61	86.22	91.37
LOT 3a - Plasterer	70%	61.98	64.68	61.11	68.64	59.94	65.49	57.31	70.00	63.32	67.71
LOT 3 - TOTAL SCORE		81.53	82.54	84.47	92.42	83.72	87.28	75.35	91.12	86.89	91.28
LOT 4a - Wall & Floor Tiler	70%	59.36	61.96	65.02	66.70	59.40	62.73	48.72	68.95	54.42	70.00
LOT 4 - TOTAL SCORE		78.91	79.81	88.38	90.48	83.19	84.52	66.75	90.07	77.99	93.57
LOT 5a - Slater	70%	59.36	0.00	59.62	60.61	54.40	62.73	54.90	60.62	60.65	70.00
LOT 5 - TOTAL SCORE		78.91	17.86	82.98	84.39	78.18	84.52	72.93	81.74	84.22	93.57
LOT 6a - Roughcaster	70%	67.44	66.87	64.34	66.69	60.13	67.70	63.27	69.45	65.46	70.00
LOT 6 - TOTAL SCORE		86.99	84.73	87.71	90.47	83.91	89.49	81.30	90.57	89.03	93.57
LOT 7a - Joiner	70%	49.32	62.48	48.59	66.73	61.01	68.84	59.25	69.45	65.46	70.00
LOT 7 - TOTAL SCORE		68.87	80.34	71.95	90.51	84.80	90.63	77.29	90.57	89.03	93.57
LOT 8a - Advanced Plumber	70%	52.09	63.90	44.48	66.35	59.96	70.00	58.85	69.81	62.03	65.76
LOT 8 - TOTAL SCORE		71.64	81.76	67.84	90.13	83.75	91.79	76.88	90.93	85.60	89.34
LOT 9a - Approved Electrician	70%	59.61	64.73	45.22	66.88	61.19	67.91	59.61	70.00	62.84	66.62
LOT 9 - TOTAL SCORE		79.16	82.59	68.58	90.66	84.98	89.69	77.65	91.12	86.41	90.19
LOT 10a - Glazier	70%	58.03	60.57	0.00	60.32	53.47	70.00	50.47	62.91	59.29	63.41
LOT 10 - TOTAL SCORE		77.58	78.43	23.36	84.10	77.25	91.79	68.50	84.03	82.86	86.98
LOT 11a - Labourer	70%	46.53	68.87	58.97	62.33	51.69	64.64	48.61	70.00	62.40	59.59
LOT 11 - TOTAL SCORE		66.08	86.73	82.34	86.11	75.47	86.42	66.65	91.12	85.97	83.16
SUMMARY TOTAL SCORE											
Award Criteria 1a (Cost)	70%										
Award Criteria 1b (Price stability)	5%	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.50	0.00	5.00	2.50
Award Criteria 2 (Service)	10%	6.07	5.36	6.07	7.14	7.14	9.29	6.79	10.00	6.07	6.07
Award Criteria 3 (Quality)	10%	7.50	5.00	10.00	10.00	10.00	5.00	3.75	7.50	7.50	10.00
Award Criteria 4 (Admin)	5%	3.48	5.00	4.79	4.14	4.14	5.00	5.00	3.62	5.00	5.00
TOTAL TECHNICAL SCORE		19.55	17.86	23.36	23.78	23.78	21.79	18.04	21.12	23.57	23.57

Appendix 2 Cost Evaluation

(insert A3 size price evaluation details)

TENDERING COMMITTEE...28 May 2008

Item XX - Tender for Supply of Temporary Agency Staff (Craft)

This report seeks Committee approval to award a framework for the supply of temporary agency staff.

This report includes:

- A brief outline on the background and main issues regarding the need to tender for this service.
- Appendix 1...Evaluation Scoring
- Appendix 2...Cost Evaluation
- Conclusions and Recommendations and details on preferred supplier.

The recommendation on page XX invites the Committee to note the content of the report and approve the award of a framework for the supply of temporary agency staff (Craft).