

## **WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL**

At the Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held in the Council Chamber, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton on Wednesday, 26 April 2017 at 5.00 p.m.

**Present:** Provost Douglas McAllister and Councillors Denis Agnew, George Black, Jim Bolland, Jim Brown, Gail Casey, Jim Finn, William Hendrie, David McBride, Jonathan McColl, Patrick McGlinchey, John Millar, John Mooney, Michelle McGinty, Ian Murray, Lawrence O'Neill, Tommy Rainey, Gail Robertson, Martin Rooney, Kath Ryall and Hazel Sorrell.

**Attending:** Joyce White, Chief Executive; Angela Wilson, Strategic Director – Transformation & Public Service Reform; Richard Cairns, Strategic Director – Regeneration, Environment & Growth; Keith Redpath, Chief Officer, West Dunbartonshire Health & Social Care Partnership; Laura Mason, Chief Education Officer; Peter Hessest, Strategic Lead – Regulatory; Ronnie Dinnie, Strategic Lead – Environment & Neighbourhood; Jim McAloon, Strategic Lead – Regeneration; Stephen West, Strategic Lead – Resources; Malcolm Bennie, Strategic Lead – Communications, Culture & Communities; Michael McGuinness, Economic Development Manager and Craig Stewart, Committee Officer.

**Apology:** An apology was intimated on behalf of Councillor Marie McNair.

### **Provost Douglas McAllister in the Chair**

## **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Having heard the Legal Officer, Members, who were members of the Strathclyde Pension Fund, declared an interest in the item on the agenda entitled 'Motion by Councillor George Black – Strathclyde Pension Fund', but would remain within the meeting and take part in any decision thereon.

## **MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

The Minutes of Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held on 22 February 2017 were submitted and approved as a correct record.

## **MINUTES OF MEETING OF AUDIT & PERFORMANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE – 8 MARCH 2017**

The Minutes of Meeting of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held on 8 March 2017 were submitted and all decisions contained therein approved.

### **OPEN FORUM**

The Council noted that no open forum questions had been submitted by members of the public.

### **PLANNING APPLICATION**

In view of there being a statutory requirement for applications of this nature to be determined by full Council, a report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Regulatory in respect of the following planning application.

#### **DC16/282: Residential development of 99 houses and associated roads, landscaping and drainage on land at Farm Road, Duntocher by Taylor Wimpey West Scotland**

After discussion and having heard the Planning & Building Standards Manager in further explanation of the report and in answer to Members' questions, the Council refused planning permission for the reasons set out in Section 9 of Appendix 1 to the report as detailed within the Appendix hereto, with the following additional reason (7) to reflect the provisional view of the Planning Committee:-

7. *The additional traffic would contribute to localised traffic congestion in the residential streets leading to the site, to the inconvenience of local residents and other road users.*

### **GLASGOW CITY REGION CITY DEAL - UPDATE**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Regeneration noting the progress with the implementation of the Glasgow City Region, City Deal and the Council's City project.

Councillor McGlinchey provided Council with an update on various matters including the current position with regard to progress, etc. in relation to the Glasgow City Region, City Deal and the Council's City project.

After discussion and having heard the Strategic Lead – Regeneration in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Council:-

- (1) agreed to note the progress of the Glasgow City Region City Deal;

- (2) agreed to note progress with the Council's project for the Exxon site; and
- (3) agreed to note the terms of the discussion around Compulsory Purchase Orders including the requirement, that this would be a decision for Council to take at the appropriate time, if necessary.

### **GENERAL SERVICES BUDGETARY CONTROL REPORT TO 28 FEBRUARY 2017 (PERIOD 11)**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Resources advising on the progress of both the General Services revenue budget 2016/17 and the approved capital programme for the period to 28 February 2017.

After discussion, the Council agreed:-

- (1) to note that the revenue account currently shows a projected annual favourable variance of £2.120m (0.99% of the total budget); and
- (2) to note that the capital account shows a projected annual favourable variance of £36.496m (34.09% of the budget) and a projected project life adverse variance of £2.851m (0.90% of project life budget).

### **HOUSING REVENUE ACCOUNT BUDGETARY CONTROL REPORT TO 28 FEBRUARY 2017 (PERIOD 11)**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Director – Regeneration, Environment and Growth providing an update on the financial performance to 28 February 2017 (Period 11) of the HRA revenue and capital budgets.

After discussion and having heard the Chief Executive and the Strategic Lead – Resources in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Council agreed:-

- (1) to note the projected favourable revenue variance of £0.270m (0.6%);
- (2) to note the position advised in relation to the capital budget which is currently projecting an in-year favourable variance of £12.116m (42.6%), of which £11.878m (41.79%) relates to project re-phasing and an in-year underspend of £0.238m (0.84%); and
- (3) the virement of £0.119m as detailed in section 4.3 of the report.

### **EQUALITY OUTCOMES & MAINSTREAMING REPORT**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Communications, Culture & Communities seeking approval from Council for the Equality Outcomes and Mainstreaming Report for 2017-2021.

After discussion and having heard Councillor Sorrell, Chair of the Council's Equality & Diversity Working Group, the Council agreed:-

- (1) to note progress made in delivery of the 2013-2017 Equality Outcomes; and
- (2) to approve the 2017-2021 Equality Outcomes and Mainstreaming Report.

### **MINUTES OF OTHER COMMITTEES**

The Minutes of Meetings of the following Committees were submitted and approved as correct records:-

- (1) Tendering Committee held on 5 August 2015;
- (2) Local Review Body held on 10 February 2016;
- (3) Housing and Communities Committee held on 1 February 2017;
- (4) Corporate Services Committee held on 8 February 2017;
- (5) Housing and Communities Committee (Special) held on 22 February 2017;
- (6) Educational Services Committee held on 1 March 2017;
- (7) Infrastructure, Regeneration and Economic Development Committee held on 15 March 2017;
- (8) Licensing Committee held on 19 April 2017;
- (9) Appeals Committee held on 20 April 2017; and
- (10) Appeals Committee held on 31 October 2016.

Note: Councillor Agnew left the meeting at this point.

### **NOTICES OF MOTION**

#### **(a) Motion by Councillor Jim Bolla – Winter Gritting Programme**

Council agrees to a review of the Winter Gritting Programme with a view to improving and increasing the measures currently in place. The review needs to recognise that the vast majority of Constituents live in streets which under the current policy are not a priority for gritting. Council agrees to task the relevant Director with bringing a report back to Council which takes into account this fact and also attaches the same priority to pavements in housing estates adjoining bus routes. The report's recommendations must be fully compatible with the Roads Scotland Act (1984).

Councillor McColl asked Councillor Bollan whether he would be willing to accept the following as an addendum to his motion:-

Add after “bus routes”, “and areas with steep inclines that can be particularly dangerous for pedestrians and vehicles when left untreated”.

Councillor Bollan indicated that he was willing to accept the addendum to his motion, which was then approved by Council.

**(b) Motion by Councillor George Black – Strathclyde Pension Fund**

In relation to the Strathclyde Pension Fund. We should be horrified to learn that the pension fund currently has holdings in 6 out of 10 of the world’s largest arms manufacturers.

This is Council recognises that "Crimes against humanity" are the gravest category of crimes in international law.

The ‘broader objectives of society’ would be served by SPF divesting from the companies below:

We therefore call upon the trustees of the Strathclyde Pension Fund to withdraw any and all monies invested with these Companies as we feel that the ethos and aims of their fund are not met by such associations attachments.

Companies here are listed for information purposes:-

Caterpillar Inc.  
 Exxon Mobil Corp.  
 General Dynamics [#6]  
 General Electric [#27]  
 Heidelberg Cement Group  
 Hewlett-Packard [#43]  
 Lockheed Martin [#1]  
 Motorola  
 Northrop Grumman [#5]  
 Page 5 of 232  
 Raytheon Company [#4]  
 RE/MAX  
 The Boeing Company [#2]  
 United Technologies Corp. [#8]  
 #ranking in top 100 arms companies  
 You can find full information about the complicity of these companies at  
[www.timetodivest.net](http://www.timetodivest.net).

The Council agreed to approve the above motion.

**(c) Motion by Councillor George Black – Winter Maintenance Payments**

In view of the public interest generated by the large sums of public money paid to officers whose grade is above the agreed level for overtime payments linked to winter maintenance, we call upon the appropriate officer to bring forward a report based on the information contained and forming the briefing paper produced for Elected Members.

The Council agreed to approve the above motion.

**(d) Motion by Councillor George Black – Bedroom Tax**

Given that all housing benefit will be capped at the local housing allowance rate for one bedroom in the private sector, 241,000 tenants will be affected. The LHA rate for one bedroom is £83.16 on average across Scotland as sheltered housing costs on average £100 to £120 per week. The disabled in supported accommodation costs are even higher at up to £200 per week and we therefore believe that these complexes will be closed down and new ones will be mothballed because of financial shortfalls. The under 35s on housing benefit will be put onto the local housing allowance shared accommodation rate which at current rates would mean that they are averaging £92.06 per week in Glasgow for example on housing benefit and that would reduce to £68.28 per week if shared accommodation rate of local housing allowance was applied. We oppose these cuts completely as thousands will be made homeless if they go ahead.

We call upon Council to lead a local campaign rejecting these measures and the Tory Austerity cuts.

Councillor McColl asked Councillor Black whether he would be willing to accept the following as an addendum to his motion:-

Add after “go ahead”, “When the Scottish Government is forced to mitigate Westminster cuts, it reduces the amount of public money available for other services, and this cannot be a sustainable solution. We need to oppose so that we don’t need to mitigate”.

Councillor Black indicated that he was willing to accept the addendum to his motion, which was then approved by Council.

**(e) Motion by Councillor Michelle McGinty – Vale of Leven Hospital**

This Council notes the community campaign being coordinated by Hospitalwatch to protect health services at the Vale of Leven Hospital.

Council commends Hospitalwatch for their 13 years of campaigning against cuts to local NHS services. The local community has a crucial role to play in helping to secure the future of our health services.

West Dunbartonshire residents are therefore invited to give up 15 minutes of their time in support of a 24-hour vigil to send a message to the Scottish Government that our communities reject the reduction of NHS services at the Vale.

The Council also calls on all local government election candidates in the Dumbarton, Leven and Lomond Ward to demonstrate their commitment to the Vale of Leven Hospital by supporting the vigil between 8am on Friday 28<sup>th</sup> April and 8am Saturday 29th April.

The Council is concerned about plans for further reductions in services and the centralisation of services to the RAH in Paisley including:-

Birthing services at the Community Maternity unit.

Pharmacy staff being reduced and prescribing cut.

Haematology clinics, staffed by locums and clinics cut from 19 to 12.

The GP out-of-hours service, threatened with being closed during the week with patients having to travel to Paisley for treatment.

A review of acute admission, designed to reduce the number of admission points, including the Medical Assessment Unit at the Vale.

All of these are on the back of cuts which have seen a reduction in:

Bed numbers – down by 48, a 38% cut.

Staff numbers – down by 272, a 30% cut, of which nurses and midwives are down by 113, a 28% cut.

Clinics - 714 cancelled over past 3 years.

Lab services cut and transferred to Paisley.

Given the above, the Council asks that the Leader of the Council and the Leader of the Opposition sign the attached letter in support of the Vale of Leven Hospital services.

This Council also calls on the Cabinet Secretary for Health to meet with Hospitalwatch, the local constituency MSP and councillors to stop the cuts at the Vale of Leven hospital.

Letter:

Shona Robison MSP  
Cabinet Secretary for Health and Sport  
The Scottish Government  
St Andrew's House  
Edinburgh  
EH1 3DG

Dear Cabinet Secretary

Vale of Leven Hospital

I write to highlight the very real concerns among our local communities in West Dunbartonshire regarding services at the Vale of Leven Hospital.

It has recently emerged that the future of GP Out of Hours services at the Vale of Leven Hospital is under review, with the initial proposals suggesting a withdrawal of the service during the evening between Mondays and Fridays. This follows numerous temporary closures over the past few months at weekends where NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde has diverted local residents to Paisley to access emergency primary care services due to shortages of medical staff.

I also understand that the pharmacy service is under review and that staff have been notified that half of the posts will be transferred to other hospitals in the region. There can be no substitute for a fully-functioning pharmacy at the Vale of Leven Hospital and we will oppose any attempts by NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde to reduce the service and staff numbers.

Dr Patricia Clarke, the recently retired Haematology consultant, has also spoken publicly about the health board's failure to recruit a permanent replacement for the service despite being informed of her retirement a year in advance. As a result, this much-valued service is now being provided by locums and the consultant-led sessions have been reduced, prompting her concerns for the sustainability of the service and the impact on patients.

Furthermore, the "Transforming the Delivery of Acute Services" NHS board paper proposed reducing the number of unscheduled admissions sites across Greater Glasgow and Clyde. As you will know, the Medical Assessment Unit at the Vale of Leven Hospital is one of only five such departments in the region and we urge you to provide a firm reassurance that the Vale of Leven Hospital's MAU will not be affected.

The cumulative effect of these concerns, alongside the reduction in staffing levels and bed numbers at the Vale of Leven Hospital in recent years, has created an impression that the commitments made in the Vision for the Vale agreement are not being delivered.



West Dunbartonshire Council fully supports the Hospitalwatch campaign and we add our voices to their calls for an urgent meeting to discuss the future of our local NHS services.

In light of the above, West Dunbartonshire Council would welcome the opportunity to host a ministerial visit to provide you with the opportunity to hear first-hand the concerns of representatives from Hospitalwatch, councillors and the local MSP.

We look forward to your response.

Yours sincerely

Martin Rooney, Council Leader

The above motion was moved by Councillor McGlinchey, seconded by Councillor Sorrell.

As an amendment, Councillor McColl, seconded by Councillor Hendrie, moved:-

Council thanks Hospitalwatch, other campaign groups, and individuals in our community who continue to stand up for the Vale of Leven Hospital.

Council agrees that Greater Glasgow and Clyde Health Board must start delivering, not only Hospital services, but also non-hospital based services, which are planned to meet the needs of our community; they must get away from their current Glasgow centered approach to service provision.

Council fully supports Hospitalwatch and asks everyone with an interest in protecting and improving services at the Vale of Leven Hospital to give what time they can to be part of the 24 hour vigil to send a message to the Health Board and Scottish Government, reaffirming that we value the services the Hospital provides and need to see them expanded and improved.

Council welcomes the commitments from the Health Board and Cabinet Secretary for Health that the Vale of Leven Hospital is a vital part of local health delivery and it is not at any risk of closure. We also welcome the public statement from the new Chair and new Chief Executive, following Martin Docherty MP and Brendan O'Hara MP's meeting, that Haematology and Pharmacy Dispensing are not at risk of closure and the board are working to resolve GP contract issues so that vital out of hours services can continue.

This Council must develop a constructive approach on this issue, and to that end, the Council Chief Executive is instructed to include the Vale of Leven Hospital as an item on the agenda for her first meeting with the Council Leader after the Statutory Council meeting on May 17<sup>th</sup>.

Council agrees that if we are to have a positive impact on local Health Services, the new Administration, whoever they may be, must develop a positive and influencing relationship with the new Health Board Chair and Chief Executive and our Health Board representative must be a strong advocate for our community.

The next Council Leader, HSCP Convener and Council's Health Board Nominee should seek a meeting with the Health Board Chair and Chief Executive as soon as possible in the new term.

The public and Councillors have a right to know what is going on with our local health services, and Council agrees that the next Administration's Health Board representative should provide feedback to full Council following, Health Board meetings and whenever other issues arise.

Furthermore, Council agrees that Hospitalwatch should be afforded the opportunity to meet with the Cabinet Secretary for Health, and that the Council should host such a meeting. All political parties and independent Councillors have a part to play and Council agrees that at the first ordinary meeting of the new Council, an item will be on the agenda to allow Council to agree the wording of a letter to the Cabinet Secretary, to be signed by the Leader, Leader of the Opposition, other Party Group Leaders and any Independent Councillor who wishes to sign.

On a vote being taken, 6 Members voted for the amendment and 12 for the motion, which was accordingly declared carried.

**(f) Motion by Councillor Gail Casey – Provision of defibrillators**

Council notes the roll out of defibrillators into public and private establishments such as workplaces, shopping centres, leisure centres and schools.

Council notes that West Dunbartonshire schools are leading the way with the roll out of defibrillators at the following establishments:-

Gavinburn Primary  
 Linnvale Primary  
 Our Lady of Loretto  
 Carleith Primary  
 Clydebank High School  
 Saint Peter the Apostle  
 Vale of Leven  
 Our Holy Redeemers

Council notes that Whitecrook Primary is also in the process of raising funds towards the costs of a defibrillator.

Mr Brian Martin has contacted the Hodgkinson Trust Community resuscitation officer and has secured a partnership approach where the Hodgkinson Trust will pay £700 towards the cost of each defibrillator.

Given the above, this council agreed that the Chief Executive brings forward a report to a future Council meeting identifying options and priorities for the further roll out to West Dunbartonshire schools.

The report should identify potential funding options, to support the purchase of additional defibrillators. The report should consider other locations that could benefit from the introduction of defibrillators.

Councillor McColl asked Councillor Casey whether she would be willing to accept the following as an addendum to her motion:-

Add after the first paragraph, "Council thanks Norma and Andy Docherty, who after their 17 year old son Scott's sudden arrhythmic death in 2011, have worked tirelessly for public defibrillator provision. Scott was a pupil of Clydebank High School and his family have been successful in their extremely brave campaign, carried out in Scott's memory.

In 2012, Scott's parents, along with his Auntie Lilian Albertis donated one of these lifesaving defibrillator machines to Clydebank High School, raised £10,000 for the charity SADS UK and have since donated numerous defibrillators to our schools and other public places. In Norma's own words, "Scott went to sleep and never woke up". He leaves a legacy behind him that will save untold lives across West Dunbartonshire."

Councillor Casey indicated that she was willing to accept the addendum to her motion, which was then approved by Council.

**(g) Motion by Councillor Lawrence O'Neill – Sky Lanterns**

Council notes the campaign organised by NFU Scotland regarding:-

the growing popularity of Sky Lanterns;

the inherent problems related to their mass release; and

the calls for greater controls from many organisations.

Council recognises the concerns of:-

NFU Scotland in relation to threats to livestock and fire damage to crops;

Civil Aviation Authority in that Sky Lanterns could be drawn into aircraft engines;

The Coastguard receiving numerous calls assuming that they are distress signals;

RSPCA and SSPCA growing concerns regarding the risk to animals; and

Fire and rescue services have issued warnings following a number of fire incidents.

Council further notes that to date eight Scottish local authorities have banned Sky Lanterns being launched from their land.

Council instructs officers to take steps to ban the use of Sky Lanterns on Council controlled land.

The Council agreed to approve the above motion.

**(h) Motion by Councillor Kath Ryall – Ethical Investment**

This Council intends to implement an ethical investment policy, as follows:-

This Council, in making investments through its Treasury Management function, fully supports the ethos of socially responsible investment. We will actively seek to communicate this support to those institutions we invest in as well as those we are considering investing in by:-

- (1) encouraging those institutions to adopt and publicise policies on socially responsible investments;
- (2) requesting those institutions to apply council deposits in a socially responsible manner.

Counterparties shall be advised of the above statement each time a deposit is placed with them.

This policy will apply to all cash investments made by, or on behalf of, the Council.

Council therefore requests officers to bring a report to a future Council meeting identifying any implications of implementing such a policy.

The Council agreed to approve the above motion.

**VALEDICTORY**

As this was the last ordinary meeting of Council, the Provost took the opportunity to pass on his thanks to all Elected Members and officers for the hard work done during this Council's term, which had resulted in significant achievements throughout West Dunbartonshire.

He referred in particular to those Members who were retiring and, on behalf of the Council acknowledged the considerable work ethic and commitment shown by them and wished them well for the future.

In closing, the Provost also took the opportunity to wish all those Members well who were standing in the forthcoming local government elections on 4 May.

Members warmly concurred with the Provost's remarks and passed on their own appreciation and best wishes to him.

The meeting closed at 7.50 p.m.

**APPENDIX****DC16/282: Residential development of 99 houses and associated roads, landscaping and drainage on land at Farm Road, Duntocher by Taylor Wimpey West Scotland**

Permission **refused** for the following reasons:-

1. The site is in the green belt and is not in accordance with the Spatial Development Strategies of the approved Glasgow and the Clyde Valley Strategic Development Plan or of the emerging Clydeplan.
2. The site is in the green belt which is an inappropriate location for housing development, and the proposal fails to create a distinctive development in line with the six qualities of good design. The proposal is therefore contrary to the principles of Scottish Planning Policy.
3. The site is in the green belt which is an inappropriate location for housing development and the proposal is therefore contrary to policies GB1, RD1 and H2 of the adopted West Dunbartonshire Local Plan 2010.
4. There is no requirement for additional green belt land to be identified to meet the strategic housing requirement, and therefore the principle of residential development is contrary to policies DS2 and BC1 of the West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan (Proposed Plan).
5. The layout of the proposed development fails to create an appropriate sense of place. The proposed development is therefore contrary to policies DS1 and GN2 of the Local Development Plan (Proposed Plan) and policies GD1 and H4 of the adopted Local Plan.
6. The proposed development is not in accordance with the principles of Designing Streets, the Council's Residential Design Guidance or the Council's Our Green Network guidance and fails to create a distinctive development that would comply with the six qualities of good design.
7. The additional traffic would contribute to localised traffic congestion in the residential streets leading to the site, to the inconvenience of local residents and other road users.