

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL

At the Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held in the Council Chamber, Clydebank Town Hall, Dumbarton Road, Clydebank on Wednesday, 26 February 2020 at 2.00 p.m.

Present: Provost William Hendrie, Bailie Denis Agnew and Councillors Jim Bollan, Jim Brown, Gail Casey, Karen Conaghan, Ian Dickson, Diane Docherty, Jim Finn, Daniel Lennie, Caroline McAllister, David McBride, Jonathan McColl, Iain McLaren, Marie McNair, John Millar, John Mooney, Lawrence O'Neill, Sally Page and Martin Rooney.

Attending: Joyce White, Chief Executive; Angela Wilson, Strategic Director – Transformational & Public Service Reform; Richard Cairns, Strategic Director – Regeneration, Environment & Growth, Beth Culshaw, Chief Officer, Health & Social Care Partnership, Peter Hessem, Strategic Lead – Regulatory (Legal Officer); Stephen West, Strategic Lead – Resources; Malcolm Bennie, Strategic Lead – Communications, Culture & Communities; Michael McGuinness, Manager – Economic Development; Pamela Clifford, Planning & Building Standards Manager; Antony McGuinness, Team Leader – Forward Planning; Christine McCaffary, Senior Democratic Services Officer and Nuala Borthwick, Committee Officer.

Also Attending: Zahrah Mahmood, Senior Auditor, Audit Scotland.

Apologies: An apology for absence was intimated on behalf of Councillor Brian Walker.

Provost William Hendrie in the Chair

STATEMENT BY CHAIR – AUDIO STREAMING

The Provost advised that the meeting was being audio streamed and broadcast live to the internet and would be available for playback.

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations were made at this point in the meeting:-

Councillor McColl declared a non-financial interest in Item 6 - Planning Application DC19/203: Erection of Residential Development at Farm Road, Duntocher by Barratt Homes West Scotland, stating that he would leave the meeting during consideration of the item.

Bailie Agnew and Councillors McNair and Mooney declared non-financial interest in Item 10 - Membership of West Dunbartonshire Health & Social Care Partnership Board (Integration Joint Board), all being the current members of the Board.

Councillor Bollan declared a non-financial interest in Item 14(a) - Independent Resource Centre, stating that he would move the Motion and then leave the meeting during consideration of same.

Councillors Brown, Docherty and Mooney also declared non-financial interests in Item 14(a) – Independent Resource Centre and would leave the meeting during discussion.

MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The Minutes of Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held on 29 January 2020 were submitted and approved as a correct record.

OPEN FORUM

The Council noted that no open forum questions had been submitted by members of the public.

Note: Councillor McColl left the meeting at this point, having declared an interest in the following item of business.

PLANNING APPLICATION - DC19/203: ERECTION OF RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT AT FARM ROAD, DUNTOCHER CLYDEBANK BY BARRATT HOMES WEST SCOTLAND

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Regulatory on the above planning application for a major development which would be a significant departure from the adopted development plan.

A short presentation on the site involved was given by the Planning & Building Standards Manager.

Note: Councillor McLaren declared a non-financial interest at this point and left the meeting before consideration of the matter commenced.

Having heard the Planning & Buildings Standards Manager and Team Leader – Forward Development in answer to Members' questions, the Council agreed:-

That the Council refuse planning permission for the reasons set out in Section 9 of Appendix 1 of the report and attached as the Appendix to these minutes, with an additional Condition 5 that 'the development would exacerbate traffic congestion in the area and in and around Farm Road, Duntocher.'

Note: Councillors McColl and McLaren returned to the meeting at this point.

GLASGOW CITY REGION, CITY DEAL - UPDATE

A report was submitted by Strategic Lead – Regeneration advising of progress with the implementation of the Glasgow City Region, City Deal.

After discussion having heard officers in answer to Members' questions, the Council agreed:-

- (1) to note the progress of the Glasgow City Region;
- (2) to note progress with the Council's City Deal project for the Exxon site; and
- (3) that future update reports will include any information available on the Renfrewshire Bridge project.

Councillor Bolla, having failed to find a seconder for a proposed amendment, asked that his dissent be recorded in the Minutes.

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COMMUNITY FOODSHARE

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Housing & Employability providing an update on the financial challenges facing West Dunbartonshire Community Foodshare.

Following a question from Councillor Rooney, the Strategic Lead – Housing & Employability confirmed an error in the report, namely that paragraph 2.1(i) should read 3.2, not 4.2 as shown.

Councillor McColl, seconded by Councillor Dickson moved:-

That Council agrees to:-

- (1) note the position regarding the £50,000 agreed by Council as a stop-gap for 2019/20 as detailed in paragraph 3.2 of the report; and
- (2) to provide a one-off earmarked contingency fund of up to £50,000 that can be drawn on up to September 2022 contingent on due diligence by Council officers and based on the development and implementation of a full plan for sustainability and would only be utilised if West

Dunbartonshire Community Foodshare is unsuccessful in securing external funding.

As an amendment Councillor Mooney, seconded by Councillor Lennie moved:-

It is recommended that Council:-

- (i) notes the position regarding the £50,000 agreed by Council as a stop-gap for 2019/20 as detailed at 3.2 below, and agrees to extend this to September 2022: and, in addition
- (ii) agrees to provide a further, one-off earmarked contingency fund of up to £70,000 that can be drawn on up to September 2022 contingent on due diligence by Council officers; and based on the development and implementation of a full plan for sustainability; and would only be utilised if WDCF are unsuccessful in securing external funding.

At this point in the meeting a representative of West Dunbartonshire Community Foodshare was heard in reply to questions from Members.

Following discussion, the Legal Officer advised Members what was required to allow the motion and amendment to be withdrawn.

Accordingly, the Members who had moved and seconded the motion and amendment confirmed their agreement to withdraw this and the Council concurred.

The Council then agreed:-

- (1) to continue consideration of the report to the meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council to be held on Wednesday, 27 May 2020 and that the £50,000 contingency remain in place until such time as the Council had taken a decision; and
- (2) that representatives of West Dunbartonshire Community Foodshare be invited to attend the meeting in May.

WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE BEST VALUE ASSURANCE REPORT

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive on the completion of the Best Value Improvement Plan approved by Council in August 2018 following the Audit Scotland Best Value Assurance Review (BVAR) of West Dunbartonshire Council.

The Council agreed to note that the Council's Improvement Plan, developed in response to the recommendations contained in the BVAR, has been fully delivered.

ADJOURNMENT

Having heard the Provost, the Council agreed to a short adjournment.

The meeting reconvened at 3.35 p.m. with all those Members listed in the sederunt present.

MEMBERSHIP OF WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE HEALTH & SOCIAL CARE PARTNERSHIP BOARD (INTEGRATION JOINT BOARD)

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Regulatory on the Council's membership of the West Dunbartonshire Health & Social Care Partnership Board (Integration Joint Board).

Following discussion, the Council agreed to re-appoint Bailie Denis Agnew and Councillors Marie McNair, John Mooney to the Integration Joint Board.

REVIEW OF INTEGRATION SCHEME

A report was submitted by the Chief Officer, West Dunbartonshire Health & Social Care Partnership on the above.

The Council agreed:-

- (1) to note the content of the report; and
- (2) to approve the draft revised Integration Scheme for consultation.

GENERAL SERVICES BUDGETARY CONTROL REPORT PERIOD 10

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Resources advising on the General Services revenue budget and the approved capital programme to 31 January 2020 (Period 10).

After discussion and having heard officers in answer to Members' questions, the Council agreed:-

- (1) to note that the revenue account currently shows a projected annual favourable variance of £0.246m (0.11% of the total budget);
- (2) to note that the capital account shows that planned expenditure and resource for 2019/20 is lower than budgeted by £20.118m (25.88% of the budget), made up of £20.368m relating to project slippage, partially offset by £0.250m relating to an in year overspend (as noted within appendices 5 to 8 of the report); and
- (3) that officers consider which committee Post Project Reviews should be submitted to in future.

HOUSING REVENUE ACCOUNT BUDGETARY CONTROL REPORT PERIOD 10

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Housing & Employability providing an update on the financial performance of the HRA revenue and capital budgets to 31 January 2020 (Period 10).

The Council agreed:-

- (1) to note the contents of the report which shows the revenue budget forecast to underspend against budget by £0.015m (0.04%) at the year-end; and
- (2) to note the net projected annual position in relation to relevant capital projects which is highlighting an in-year variance of £11.050m (17.7%) due to projected net slippage of £12.498m (20.1%) and an overspend of £1.448m (-2.3%).

Note: Councillors Brown, Docherty and Mooney, having declared an interest in the following item of business, left the meeting at this point.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

(a) Motion by Councillor Jim Bollan – Independent Resource Centre

Councillor Bollan, seconded by Councillor O'Neill, moved:-

All members will be aware from the correspondence they have received from the Independent Resource Centre that there is a very real risk of possible closure of the Independent Resource Centre in Clydebank due to under funding. Council agrees to provide the IRC with additional ring fenced funding of £143,519.00 from reserves, each year over a 5 year period starting in 2020/2021.

Note: Councillor Bollan, having declared an interest in this item of business, left the meeting at this point.

As an amendment Councillor McColl, seconded by Bailie Agnew moved:-

Council notes the current financial situation as intimated by the Independent Resource Centre (IRC) to all elected members.

IRC has dealt with approximately 3000 cases in the 2019/20 financial year so far and has brought in more than £7m for their clients.

Council agrees that the Debt/Welfare and Money Advice services provided by IRC are vital to the wellbeing of the people who rely on them. Should IRC cease to exist, the Council would struggle to take on the complex workload required to support these vulnerable people.

Council agrees that the Leader of the Council should continue to liaise with IRC to provide support in their search for sustainable long term funding.

Council further notes that elected members sit on the Management Committee on a cross party basis and will therefore be involved.

Based on IRC's plans to utilise the entirety of the £112k of their reserves, Council agrees as a matter of immediacy to fund the projected 2020/21 shortfall of approximately £31k from our free reserves and commits to continue to work on a cross party basis to find sustainable funding going forward.

Council agrees that it would be beneficial to have at least a further 12 month contingency in place to provide financial support beyond 20/21, but we will not know our own financial position until we know the outcome of cross party negotiations at stage one of the Scottish Parliament budget process. Council will consider how we can provide this further support in our budget considerations, which will come before the Council in due course.

At the request of Councillor O'Neill the Council proceeded by way of a roll call vote.

On a vote being taken 9 Members voted for the amendment, namely Provost Hendrie, Baillie Agnew and Councillors Conaghan, Dickson, Finn, Caroline McAllister, McColl, McLaren and McNair and 7 Members voted for the motion, namely Councillors Casey, Lennie, McBride, Millar, O'Neill, Page and Rooney. The amendment was accordingly declared carried.

Note: ⁱⁱCouncillors Bollan, Brown, Docherty and Mooney returned to the meeting at this point.

(b) Motion by Councillor Jonathan McColl – Independence Referendum

Councillor McColl, seconded by Bailie Agnew moved:-

Given the range of circumstances that have changed since the independence referendum held more than half a decade ago, West Dunbartonshire Council supports the right of our constituents and everyone living in Scotland to choose their future in a new independence referendum.

Council calls on the UK Government to transfer the relevant powers to the Scottish Parliament to facilitate a legally binding referendum, and mandates the Council Leader to write to the Prime Minister urging him to respect the right of the Scottish People to have their views heard and enacted.

As an amendment Councillor Rooney, seconded by Councillor McBride moved:-

That Council notes the motion and takes no further action.

At the request of Bailie Agnew the Council proceeded by way of a roll call vote.

On a vote being taken 7 Members abstained from voting, namely Councillors

Casey, Lennie, McBride, Millar, Mooney, O'Neill and Rooney, 1 Member voted for the amendment, namely Councillor Page and 12 Members voted for the motion, namely Provost Hendrie, Bailie Agnew and Councillors Bolla, Brown, Conaghan, Dickson, Docherty, Finn, Caroline McAllister, McColl, McLaren and McNair. The motion was accordingly declared carried.

The meeting closed at 5.43 p.m.

DC19/203: ERECTION OF RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT AT FARM ROAD, DUNTOCHER, CLYDEBANK BY BARRATT HOMES WEST SCOTLAND.

PERMISSION REFUSED FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS:-

1. There is no requirement for additional green belt land to be identified to meet the strategic housing requirement, and therefore the principle of residential development is contrary to Policies GB1 and H2 of the West Dunbartonshire Local Plan 2010, Policies DS2 and BC1 of West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan 1 (Proposed Plan) and Policies GB1 and H1 of the West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan 2 (Proposed Plan).
2. The site is located within the green belt which is an inappropriate location for housing development and the proposal is therefore contrary to the vision, spatial strategy, and Policy 14 of Clydeplan, Policies RD1 and GB1 of the adopted West Dunbartonshire Local Plan 2010, Policy DS2 of the West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan 1 (Proposed Plan) and Policy GB1 of the West Dunbartonshire Local Development Plan 2 (Proposed Plan).
3. In principle, the proposed indicative masterplan conveys a general layout, which is considered to be unacceptable on design grounds, and is therefore contrary to policies GD1 and H4 of the Adopted Local Plan; policies DS1 and GN2 of the Local Development Plan 1 (Proposed Plan); and policies CP1 and CP2 of the Local Development Plan 2 (Proposed Plan).
4. The development would significantly undermine and prejudice the Spatial Strategy of the emerging Local Development Plan 2, as the proposal does not re-use and redevelop brownfield land in preference to greenbelt land, and is therefore contrary to Scottish Planning Policy.
5. The development would exacerbate traffic congestion in the area and in and around Farm Road, Duntocher.

ⁱ As amended by West Dunbartonshire Council at its meeting on 24 June 2020

ⁱⁱ As amended by West Dunbartonshire Council at its meeting on 24 June 2020