

## **WEST DUNBARTONSHIRE COUNCIL**

At the Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held in the Council Chamber, Clydebank Town Hall, Dumbarton Road, Clydebank on Wednesday, 28 June 2017 at 5.00 p.m.

**Present:** Provost William Hendrie, Bailie Denis Agnew, Councillors Jim Bolland, Jim Brown, Gail Casey, Karen Conaghan, Ian Dickson, Diane Docherty, Jim Finn, Daniel Lennie, Caroline McAllister, Douglas McAllister, David McBride, Jonathan McColl, Iain McLaren, Marie McNair, John Millar, Lawrence O'Neill, Sally Page, Martin Rooney and Brian Walker

**Attending:** Joyce White, Chief Executive; Angela Wilson, Strategic Director – Transformation & Public Service Reform; Richard Cairns, Strategic Director – Regeneration, Environment & Growth; Peter Hissett, Strategic Lead – Regulatory; Stephen West, Strategic Lead – Resources; Peter Barry, Strategic Lead – Housing & Employability; Malcolm Bennie, Strategic Lead – Communications, Culture & Communities; Victoria Rogers, Strategic Lead – People & Transformation; Jim McAloon, Strategic Lead – Regeneration; Ronnie Dinnie, Strategic Lead – Environment & Neighbourhood; Laura Mason, Chief Education Officer; Jackie Irvine, Chief Social Work Officer; Gillian McNeilly, Finance Manager; and Christine McCaffary, Senior Democratic Services Officer.

**Apology:** An apology for absence was intimated on behalf of Councillor John Mooney.

**Also Attending:** Ms Zahrah Mahmood, Senior Auditor, Audit Scotland.

**Provost William Hendrie in the Chair**

### **TWO MINUTE SILENCE**

Having heard Provost Hendrie, the Council observed a two minute silence as a mark of respect for those who had died in recent tragic events across the UK and for a local boy, Aaron Keenan.

## **URGENT ITEMS OF BUSINESS**

Councillor McBride advised that he had an urgent item of business concerning cuts to the GP Out-of-Hours service at the Vale of Leven Hospital.

The Provost advised that he was aware of 3 proposed urgent items of business, however in accordance with Standing Order 7 he was not of the opinion that any of them were urgent and therefore did not agree to any of the 3 items being considered by Council.

Having heard the Strategic Lead – Regulatory clarify the Standing Order, Councillor McBride proceeded to read the terms of his motion concerning the GP Out-of-Hours service at the Vale of Leven Hospital.

Councillor Rooney then read the terms of his proposed items of business concerning Singer Station – Dalmonach Reading Room and Armed Forces Day 2017.

## **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Councillor Jonathan McColl declared an interest in Item 15(e) – Motion by Councillor Rooney – Equal Pay, stating that he would leave the meeting during its consideration.

Councillor Caroline McAllister declared a financial interest in Item 15(c) – Motion by Councillor David McBride – Our Lady and St Patrick's High School – Transport Commitment.

## **MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

The Minutes of the Statutory Meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council held on 17 May 2017 were submitted and approved as a correct record.

## **REQUEST FOR DEPUTATION – CLOSURE OF SOCIAL WORK OFFICE IN ALEXANDRIA**

In accordance with Standing Order 17 the Council agreed to hear a deputation from Ms Helen Short in connection with the above.

Provost Hendrie invited Ms Short forward to join the meeting. Ms Short advised the Council that she had gathered a petition of support asking the Council to reconsider the decision to close the Social Work Office in Alexandria, and she then spoke in connection with the matter.

The Provost thanked Ms Short for her contribution and she returned to the public gallery.

## **VARIATION TO THE ORDER OF BUSINESS**

The Provost advised that the order of business would be varied, and Item 14 – Office Rationalisation Programme – Alexandria Social Work Office would be considered at this point in the meeting.

### **OFFICE RATIONALISATION PROGRAMME – ALEXANDRIA SOCIAL WORK OFFICE**

A report was submitted by Chief Social Work Officer outlining the strategic case and rationale for moving the current Children and Families Social Work Under 12's team from Church Street, Alexandria to Aurora House in Clydebank.

Councillor McNair, seconded by Councillor Rooney moved:-

This Council notes the report from the Chief Social Work Officer, and welcomes elected members receiving information on the proposed closure of the Church Street office in Alexandria.

Council agrees that elected members should always be involved in decisions of this nature after taking advice from council officers, consulting our trade unions, and listening to the views of our constituents.

Council therefore agrees to instruct the Chief Executive to conduct a meaningful consultation with the trade unions, staff and local service users, and report back to Council on the views and comments received.

This Council also notes with concern the comments from the Chief Social Work Officer (at section 4.1 of the report) that in the last 18 months there has been a noticeable rise in the number of child protection and welfare referrals.

The Chief Social Work Officer is instructed to quantify the exact rise in these types of referrals over this period, the reasons for the referral, and the most likely cause for this increase. This report should be included on the same agenda as the consultation feedback.

This Council takes the welfare of children and families very seriously and requires the fullest possible information to safeguard the decisions we make in the delivery of services. Council will carefully consider the above reports and give further direction to officers when the reports are presented to Council.

Following a question from the Provost, Councillor Rooney confirmed that he was in agreement to his motion - Item 15(f) – Office Rationalisation Plans being withdrawn.

As an amendment, Councillor Bollan, seconded by Bailie Agnew moved:-

Council agrees to rescind the proposal to close the Alexandria Social Work office. This is a key vital service that needs to be kept close to the Communities it serves. Officers advise there will be a financial cost of initially approx. £44,000 per annum with costs projected to average £63,000 per annum over a 40 year period. There will also be an approx. cost to the Council of £7,063 per year, for 2 years, for additional travelling costs for staff. Clients will be required to meet their own travel costs which is unacceptable. If there is a financial impact then this year any shortfall should be taken from reserves and any future shortfall should be dealt with through the budget setting process for 2018/2019 and beyond.

The Chief Social Work Officer was then heard in answer to Members' questions.

On a vote being taken 1 member voted for the amendment, and 20 for the motion which was accordingly carried.

### **GLASGOW CITY REGION CITY DEAL – UPDATE**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Regeneration on progress with the implementation of the Glasgow City Region, City Deal and the Council's City project.

After discussion and having heard officers in answer to Members' questions, the Council agreed to note the progress of the Glasgow City Region City Deal and the Council's project for the Exxon site.

### **DRAFT STATEMENT OF ACCOUNTS 2016/17**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead - Resources providing a copy of the draft Annual Accounts for 2016/17 and highlighting matters of interest.

The Council agreed:-

- (a) to note the contents of the report and the attached draft Statements of Accounts, subject to the understanding that the draft accounts may change depending upon the audit of the accounts undertaken by the Council's external auditors;
- (b) subject to the proposed Committee timetable being approved later in this meeting, to delegate authority to the Audit and Performance Review Committee to formally approve the audited accounts in September 2017, prior to submission to the Accounts Commission by 30 September 2017;
- (c) to note that a report on the audited accounts will be submitted to Council in October 2017; and
- (c) to note the attached proposed 2018/19 budget timetable.

## **LOCAL SCRUTINY PLAN 2017-18**

A report was submitted by the Chief Executive providing information on the Local Scrutiny Plan for 2017-18 which had recently been published by Audit Scotland. After discussion and having heard officers in further explanation of the report and in answer to Members' questions, the Council agreed to note the Local Scrutiny Plan for 2017-18 and the Council's planned actions related to the issues highlighted therein which aim to mitigate these issues.

## **WINTER MAINTENANCE PAYMENTS**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Resources providing information regarding a recent Internal Audit Report on winter maintenance payments.

Councillor McLaren, seconded by Councillor McColl, moved:-

That Council agrees to note the contents of the report.

Councillor Bolla moved an amendment which failed to obtain a seconder.

## **VACANCIES ON COMMITTEES AND OTHER BODIES**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Regulatory advising of the outstanding vacancies on committees, working groups, joint boards/committees and outside bodies.

Councillor McColl moved:-

Council agrees that unfilled vacancies will now be available for any non-SNP Councillor to fill. Members (or Group Leaders/Secretaries on behalf of their members) are invited to fill these vacancies on a first come first serve basis. The SNP will not overload committees etc., with our members and therefore, should no expressions of interest be received, these positions will remain vacant until such time as an opposition member wishes to fill them.

Council further agrees that following a request for Clydebank Housing Association for their Council nominated members to comprise 1 SNP and 1 Labour, Council notes that Cllr McNair has withdrawn her nomination to this body and invites Labour to appoint a representative by notifying Committee Admin in the usual manner.

The Council agreed to approve the above motion.

## **COMMUNICATIONS, MUSEUMS AND CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE – PROPOSED REMIT AND REVISIONS TO STANDING ORDERS**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Regulatory seeking approval of a proposed remit and delegation of powers to the Communications, Museums and Cultural Development Committee and subsequent revisions to Standing Orders.

After discussion the Council agreed:-

- (1) to approve the remit and delegated powers of the Communications, Museums and Cultural Development Committee as detailed in the Appendix to the report; and
- (2) to note that the Strategic Lead – Regulatory would revise Standing Orders to take account of any changes required following decisions taken at the Statutory Meeting of Council on 17 May 2017 and at this meeting.

## **COMMITTEE TIMETABLE – AUGUST to DECEMBER 2017**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – Regulatory seeking approval of a committee timetable for the period from August to December 2017.

After discussion, the Council agreed to approve the Committee timetable, as shown as an Appendix to these minutes.

## **ELECTED MEMBER SEMINAR PROGRAMME 2017/18**

A report was submitted by the Strategic Lead – People and Technology seeking approval of the proposed format for the Elected Member Seminar programme for 2017/18.

The Council agreed the proposed format for Elected Member Development programme for the term 2017/18.

## **NOTICES OF MOTION**

- (a) **Motion by Councillor Jim Bollan - Closure of Alexandria and Dumbarton Social Work Offices**

Councillor Bollan's motion did not require to be considered at this point, having already been moved as an amendment in connection with earlier item of business, namely Office Rationalisation Programme – Alexandria Social Work Office.

**(b) Motion by Bailie Denis Agnew – Lisbon Lions**

Bailie Agnew, seconded by Councillor Bollan moved:-

This Council recognises the immense achievement for the Celtic football team in May 1967 to be the first British team to win the European Cup.

This achievement brought global recognition from a home grown group of young men at the peak of their performance. Sadly, almost half of the original Lisbon Lions team have passed away. However, the remaining individuals from that group (Jim Clark, John Craig, Willie Wallace, Billy McNeil, Stevie Chalmers, Bobby Lennox and Bertie Auld) are still with us and I would propose that this Council recognises their and their former teammates' achievement by holding a ceremony at some future date to confer this Freemanship of West Dunbartonshire on the surviving Lisbon Lions. The costs will be met from unearmarked reserves.

As an amendment Councillor Docherty, seconded by Councillor McColl moved:-

Council congratulates Celtic FC in the 50th anniversary year of their historic win over Inter Milan in the European Cup final, on 25<sup>th</sup> May 1967. This was a magnificent achievement for a football club with all of its players living within a 30-mile radius of its home ground, Parkhead.

Council notes that it was the first Scottish and indeed British team to win this trophy, and believes that, for Scottish and British football, the Lisbon Lions set a standard that is unlikely to be matched by a solely home-grown club again.

Council thanks Bailie Agnew for his well-meaning motion and agrees that it is right and proper for us to formally recognise the Lisbon Lions' achievement on this milestone 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary year. However given there is no direct local connection to West Dunbartonshire, we do not feel it would be appropriate to hold a Freeman Ceremony or Civic Reception."

Following debate and at the request of Bailie Agnew, the Council agreed to proceed by way of a roll call vote.

On a vote being taken 12 Members, namely Provost Hendrie and Councillors Bollan, Brown, Conaghan, Dickson, Docherty, Finn, Lennie, Caroline McAllister, McColl, McLaren and McNair voted for the amendment, 3 Members voted for the motion, namely Bailie Agnew and Councillors Millar and O'Neill and 6 Members abstained from voting, namely Councillors Casey, Douglas McAllister, McBride, Page, Rooney and Walker.

The amendment was accordingly carried.

**(c) Motion by Councillor David McBride – Our Lady and St Patrick’s High School – Transport Commitment**

Councillor McBride moved:-

This Council eagerly awaits the opening of the fantastic new OLSP building in Bellsmyre later this year.

When the new built OLSP opens we will all be proud to note that every secondary pupil in West Dunbartonshire including those in the new Kilpatrick Secondary will be taught in a modern fit for purpose school with first class facilities for learning and sport.

OLSP is an excellent school and its current location in Castlehill has served the community well over many years.

This Council notes current and past pupils from Bellsmyre have been entitled to free bus travel for all journeys over the qualifying 2 miles, while the National entitlement for free school transport for secondary pupils is currently 3 miles.

Council, therefore, believes that it would be unfair if pupils making the opposite journey from Dumbarton West to Bellsmyre were denied free transport under similar terms.

Therefore we agree the 2-mile qualification for school transport must remain unchanged and not presented as a budget cut in the lifetime of the current elected Council and remains protected until at least May 2022.

The Council agreed to approve the above motion.

**(d) Motion by Councillor Daniel Lennie - £12m District Heating System at Queens Quay in Clydebank**

Councillor Lennie moved:-

This Council congratulates the Chief Executive and her staff for the successful match-funding bid for £6m of funding from the Scottish Governments “Low Carbon Innovation Transition Programme.”

The decision to commit £6m of capital and submit a bid last October has been fully vindicated.

This Council wants to build on this success and reduce energy poverty in the area and is very keen to maximise the benefit of the current District Heating System investment project so that residents in Dalmuir and Mountblow also benefit from this.



Therefore the Council asks the Chief Executive to explore other opportunities for rolling out the district heating initiative across the whole authority and to come back with options and costings to a future Council meeting.

### **Background Information**

1. The Council agreed to submit a bid for match funding towards a £12m District Heating System at Queens Quay in Clydebank at a Special meeting of West Dunbartonshire Council on Wednesday 24<sup>th</sup> November.
2. Phase one of the development will be the construction of a plant on Queens Quay that would provide energy for all of the public facilities on the development site such as the new leisure centres, the Councils new office block Aurora House, the new Clydebank Health Centre, the new Clydebank Residential Care Home and Day Care Centre.
3. In addition, the facility would be able to provide energy to Clydebank College, Clydebank Town Hall, Clydebank Library local businesses and around 1,200 homes planned for the Queens Quay site.
4. Phase two would see the potential extension to the Clyde Regional Shopping Centre and the planned development at the existing Playdrome site. The plans would also see an extension up to the Golden Jubilee Hospital and to housing beyond in Dalmuir, Mountblow and beyond.
5. As well as reducing the Councils carbon footprint, the business plan would result in income from surplus energy sales.

The Council agreed to approve the above motion.

Note: Having declared an interest earlier in the meeting, Councillor McColl left prior to discussion of the next item.

### **(e) Motion by Councillor Martin Rooney – Equal Pay**

Councillor Rooney, seconded by Councillor Bollan moved:-

This Council is concerned that despite the imposed settlement by the previous SNP Administration it appears that many female workers are still subject to unequal treatment.

The Council notes that all elected members received a letter from a female member of staff dated 6<sup>th</sup> June, that she along with some of her fellow colleagues, have been discriminated against by West Dunbartonshire Council over equal pay.

The Council is currently in the process of making individual offers to historical claimants i.e. those with outstanding claims lodged at Employment Tribunal.

The Council's approach is that those individuals with valid claims at Tribunal are being made offers in accordance with the agreement reached with claimants' representatives. However, in the absence of any legal justification, those without claims at Employment Tribunal or those with invalid claims will be excluded from any such offer.

This Council believes that addressing the historic inequality is a moral responsibility and that every effort should be used to made to ensure that all female staff that had instigated a claim through their trade union should be entitled to the same compensation as other colleagues.

This Council therefore calls on the Chief Executive to review the claims process with a view to identifying individuals that have lost out.

The Chief Executive is requested to bring forward a report identifying the numbers of staff and the cost implications to the next Council meeting for decision.

As an amendment Councillor Caroline McAllister, seconded by Councillor Conaghan moved:-

This Council notes that under the previous SNP administration Council commenced the process of addressing inequality faced by employees in the workplace.

The Council's approach as agreed with individual's representatives is to make offers to those with valid claims in accordance with the agreement reached.

This Council believes that addressing the historic inequality is a moral responsibility they are discharging within the legal constraints of an evolving law.

Indeed the responsibility for resolving the historic pay inequality was a collective one and the council fully discharged its duties in this respect in 2009.

This Council therefore calls on the Chief Executive to make contact with every affected employee that the council is aware of, to advise them to seek counsel from their representatives in accordance with the agreements in place.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

Following a request from Bailie Agnew, the Provost<sup>1</sup> agreed to an adjournment of 10 minutes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As corrected by West Dunbartonshire Council at its meeting on 30 August 2017

The meeting resumed at 8.26 p.m. with all those Members noted in the sederunt present, with the exception of Councillor McColl.

Following discussion, Councillor Caroline McAllister advised that having heard Councillor Rooney in clarification of his motion she now wished to withdraw her amendment and agree to a report being brought back to a future meeting of Council.

Having heard the Strategic Lead – Regulatory, the Council agreed to the withdrawal of the amendment and accordingly Councillor Rooney's motion was approved.

### **SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS**

At this point Councillor Douglas McAllister moved the suspension of Standing Order 6(c) to allow the remaining business on the agenda to be considered beyond 8.30 p.m. The Council agreed accordingly.

#### **(f) Motion by Councillor Martin Rooney – Office Rationalisation Plans**

Councillor Rooney's motion did not require to be considered at this point, having been withdrawn by him earlier in the meeting.

#### **(g) Motion by Councillor Lawrence O'Neill – Clydebank Football Club**

This Council recognises and congratulates Clydebank FC Under 19s on their recent success in winning the SYFA Inspire Scottish Cup under the stewardship of Manager Scott Carson, Head Coach Paul Mooney and the other staff involved as well as the players for their fantastic run throughout the Competition as well as the fact that many of them are still able to represent Clydebank FC at that age group next season.

Further recognises the achievements of the Senior Clydebank FC in gaining promotion to the top-tier of SJFA West Region Super League, Premier Division and the contribution made by the directors, staff & players of Clydebank FC on this great achievement and the impact that it will have on the Town.

Full Council also wishes to formally thank former Clydebank FC Chairman, Gordon Robertson, for his efforts over the last 14 years to keep the Club's name going as both Chairman, Coach and stand-in manager on occasion and wishes him well now that he has decided to pull the tracksuit back on and assist former Clydebank FC stalwart, Budgie McGhie, at Kilbirnie Ladeside FC next season.

In recognising the achievements of both teams, Council honours the commitment made by Provost Emeritus Councillor Douglas McAllister before

the end of his term to formally recognise them with a Civic Reception (paid from the Provost's Civic Hospitality Fund agreed at last Full Council) and wishes to extend that invitation to Gordon in recognition of his determination and efforts on behalf of the Club and the Town.

The Council agreed to approve the above motion.

### **VALEDICTORY – KEITH REDPATH**

Councillor Casey informed the Council that Keith Redpath, Chief Officer, West Dunbartonshire Health & Social Care Partnership would be retiring at the end of July 2017.

Councillor Casey remarked that Mr Redpath had been an excellent Chief Officer and had given her invaluable support in her roles of Convener and NHS Board member. Commending his hard work, dedication and commitment over the years she wished him well in his retirement.

The Council concurred.

The meeting closed at 8.29 p.m.