

AUDIT & PERFORMANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE

At a Meeting of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held in Committee Room 3, Council Offices, Garshake Road, Dumbarton on Wednesday, 28 November 2012 at 10.03 a.m.

Present: Councillors George Black, Jim Brown, Jonathan McColl, Ian Murray, Tommy Rainey, Gail Robertson and Martin Rooney and Mr Stevie J. Doogan, Mr Edward Haynes and Mr Francis McNeill.

Attending: Joyce White, Chief Executive; Angela Wilson, Executive Director of Corporate Services; Terry Lanagan, Executive Director of Educational Services; Elaine Melrose, Executive Director of Housing, Environmental & Economic Development; Stephen West, Head of Finance and Resources; Gillian McNeilly, Finance Manager; Patricia Marshall, Manager of ICT; Colin McDougall, Manager of Risk & Performance; Joe Gillespie, Section Head (Operations); William Pook, Performance and Information Manager, West Dunbartonshire Community Health & Care Partnership; Craig Stewart, Committee Officer, Legal, Democratic and Regulatory Services.

Also Attending: Mr David McConnell, Assistant Director, Ms Elaine Boyd, Senior Audit Manager, and Mr Laurence Slavin, Senior Auditor, Audit Scotland.

Apology: An apology for absence was intimated on behalf of Ms Margaret Ward.

Councillor Jonathan McColl in the Chair

CHAIR'S REMARKS

Prior to the commencement of the meeting, Councillor McColl, Chair, advised of an extra item of business on "Future Agenda Items" he would intend taking at the end of the business of the meeting. The Committee noted the position in this respect.

Councillor Rooney advised that Councillor Lawrence O'Neill had recently resigned from membership of the Audit & Performance Committee and that the vacancy would be filled by Councillor Michelle Stewart. The position was noted thereto and the Chair, Councillor McColl, welcomed Councillor Stewart (who was in attendance in the public gallery) to the Committee.

DECLARATION OF INTEREST

It was noted that there were no declarations of interest in any of the items of business on the agenda at this point in the meeting.

MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

The Minutes of Meetings of the Audit & Performance Review Committee held on 29 August 2012 (Ordinary) and 25 September 2012 (Special) were submitted and approved as correct records.

AUDIT SCOTLAND – ANNUAL REPORT ON THE 2011/12 AUDIT

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services advising on the findings in relation to the external auditor's final report to Members on the completion of their 2011/12 audit. In this connection, it was noted that the report intended to inform Members of key issues arising during the audit and to assist them in fulfilling their obligations in respect of governance, performance management and the stewardship of public funds.

After discussion and having heard Mr McConnell, Ms Boyd, Mr Slavin, the Chief Executive, Director of Corporate Services and relevant officers in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note, with satisfaction, that the Council had received an unqualified audit opinion on the accounts for 2011/12;
- (2) to note the findings of the 2011/12 audit and that the auditor's report would be presented to the December Council meeting for Members' consideration;
- (3) to note the terms of the discussion that had taken place in respect of this matter; and
- (4) to convey its thanks and appreciation to the External Auditors, Audit Scotland, the Head of Audit, Performance & Strategic Planning, who retired from Council Service recently, and the staff who assisted with the carrying out of the Audit and its successful conclusion.

Note: Councillors Murray and Rainey left the meeting at this point in the proceedings as they required to be at another engagement (Education Seminar) that was taking place at noon.

KEY CORPORATE PERFORMANCE INDICATORS – MID YEAR REVIEW 2012

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services reviewing the performance of the Key Corporate Performance Indicators at the mid year point 2012.

After discussion and having heard the Chief Executive, Executive Director of Corporate Services and the Manager of Risk & Performance in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the terms of the discussion that had taken place in respect of this matter; and
- (2) otherwise to note the contents of the report and appendices.

TREASURY MANAGEMENT ANNUAL REPORT 2011/12

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services providing an update on treasury management during 2011/12. It was noted that Members had already considered this report at the Council meeting held on 26 September 2012.

The Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the treasury management stewardship information within the report; and
- (2) to note the 2011/12 actual prudential indicators as advised within the report (Tables 2, 3, 4 and 5).

TREASURY MANAGEMENT MID-YEAR REPORT 2012/13

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services providing an update on treasury management and prudential indicators during 2012/13. It was noted that Members had already considered this report at the Council meeting held on 26 September 2012.

Having heard the Finance Manager in answer to a Member's question, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the treasury management and prudential stewardship information within the report; and
- (2) to note the 2012/13 revised estimates of treasury and prudential indicators as advised within the report (Tables A, B, C, D, E, F, H and M).

ANNUAL EFFICIENCY STATEMENT 2011/12

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services providing a copy of the annual efficiency statement for 2011/2012 prepared by the Council.

After discussion and having heard the Finance Manager in further explanation of the report, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note that the Council's efficiency statement for 2011/2012 was produced within the timescale imposed by COSLA and identified £4.686m of cashable savings and £0.260m of non cashable savings; and
- (2) to note the efficiency gains achieved by the Council in the efficiency statement for 2011/2012.

ACTIVITY ON WHISTLEBLOWING HOTLINE FOR THE PERIOD 1ST JULY 2012 TO 30TH SEPTEMBER 2012

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services advising on the level of activity on the whistleblowing hotline.

After discussion and having heard the Chief Executive and Executive Director of Corporate Services in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the terms of the report.

INTERNAL AUDIT ACTION PLANS ISSUED DURING THE PERIOD FROM 15 JULY TO 14 OCTOBER 2012 AND PROGRESS OF INTERNAL AUDIT AND EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORTS

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services:-

- (a) presenting the Internal Audit Section action plans issued to directorates during the period from 15 July to 14 October 2012; and
- (b) advising of the progress being made in actioning recommendations contained within Internal Audit and External Audit reports which management have committed to implementing.

After discussion and having heard the Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development, the Chief Executive and Manager of Risk & Performance in further explanation and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note the terms of the discussion that had taken place in respect of this matter;

- (2) that the Executive Director of Housing, Environmental and Economic Development would arrange to supply the specific information requested by Mr Haynes with regard to 'Extensions of Time' (referred to in Action Code CED/IAAP/161) contained in Appendix A under Project 45. Tendering and Contracting; and
- (3) otherwise to note the contents of the report.

INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS REPORT TO 30 SEPTEMBER 2012

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services advising on the work undertaken by the Internal Audit Section against the Audit Plan 2012/13.

After discussion and having heard the Chief Executive, Head of Finance & Resources and Section Head (Operations) in further explanation and in answer to a Member's question, the Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

AUDIT SCOTLAND REPORT: HOW COUNCILS WORK: AN IMPROVEMENT SERIES FOR COUNCILLORS AND OFFICERS – USING COST INFORMATION TO IMPROVE PERFORMANCE: ARE YOU GETTING IT RIGHT?

A report was submitted by the Executive Director of Corporate Services bringing to the attention of Members, Audit Scotland's latest report on their 'How Councils Work' series.

After discussion and having heard Ms Boyd, the Chief Executive and Executive Director of Corporate Services in elaboration and in answer to Members' questions, the Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

After hearing Councillor McColl, Chair, it was agreed that any Member wishing to raise an Item of Business for consideration at future meetings of the Committee, should bring it to the attention of Committee Services, in the first instance, in order that it could be taken forward and progressed. The position was noted thereto.

The meeting closed at 1.52 p.m.